



## CAPTION

Amanda E. Holt, Elaine Tomlin, Luis Nudi, Diane Edbril, Dariel I. Jamieson, Lora Lavin, James Yoest, Jeffrey Meyer, Christopher H. Fromme, Timothy F. Burnett, Chris Hertzog, Glen Eckhart, Joan Jessen, Elizabeth Rogan, James Hertzler, Gary Eichelberger, Barbara B. Cross, and Mary Frances Ballard, Petitioners

v.

2011 Legislative Reapportionment Commission, Respondent

## CASE INFORMATION

Initiating Document: Petition for Review

Case Status: Closed

Journal Number: J-100-2012 September 13, 2012

Case Category: Administrative Agency Case Type(s): Redistricting

## CONSOLIDATED CASES

## RELATED CASES

Docket No / Reason	Type
126 MM 2012 Court Order	Consolidated
127 MM 2012 Court Order	Consolidated
128 MM 2012 Court Order	Consolidated
129 MM 2012 Court Order	Consolidated
130 MM 2012 Court Order	Consolidated
131 MM 2012 Court Order	Consolidated
132 MM 2012 Court Order	Consolidated
134 MM 2012 Court Order	Consolidated
39 WM 2012 Court Order	Consolidated
40 WM 2012 Court Order	Consolidated
41 WM 2012 Court Order	Consolidated
42 WM 2012 Court Order	Consolidated

## COUNSEL INFORMATION




---

**COUNSEL INFORMATION**


---

Attorney: Gibson, Virginia A.

Address: Hogan Lovells  
1835 Market Swt 29th Fl  
Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (267) 675-4635

Representing: Holt, et al, Petitioner

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Churchill, Michael

Address: Public Interest Law Center of Philadelphia (The)  
Public Interest Law Ctr Phila  
1709 Ben Franklin Pky Fl 2  
Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (215) 627-7100

Representing: Holt, et al, Petitioner

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Loney, Stephen Allen, Jr.

Address: Hogan Lovells US, LLP  
Hogan Lovells US Llp  
1835 Market St Fl 29  
Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (267) 675-4677

Representing: Holt, et al, Petitioner

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Newmann, David

Address: Hogan Lovells US, LLP  
Hogan Lovells US Llp  
1835 Market St 29th Fl  
Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (267) 675-4610

Representing: Holt, et al, Petitioner

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Del Sole, Joseph A.

Address: Del Sole Cavanaugh Stroyd, L.L.C.  
200 First Ave Ste 300  
Pittsburgh, PA 15222

Phone No: (412) 261-2393

Representing: 2011 Legislative Reapportionment Commission, Respondent

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

---




---

**COUNSEL INFORMATION**


---

Attorney: Cavanaugh, Patrick Kennedy  
 Del Sole Cavanaugh Stroyd, L.L.C.  
 Address: The Waterfront Building, Suite 300  
 200 First Avenue  
 PITTSBURGH, PA 15222  
 Phone No: (412) 261-2393  
 Representing: 2011 Legislative Reapportionment Commission, Respondent  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Del Sole, Stephen John  
 Del Sole Cavanaugh Stroyd, L.L.C.  
 Address: The Waterfront Building, Suite 300  
 200 First Avenue  
 Pittsburgh, PA 15222  
 Phone No: (412) 261-2393  
 Representing: 2011 Legislative Reapportionment Commission, Respondent  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Stickman, William Shaw, IV  
 Del Sole Cavanaugh Stroyd, L.L.C.  
 Address: The Waterfront Building, Suite 300  
 200 First Avenue  
 Pittsburgh, PA 15222  
 Phone No: (412) 261-2393  
 Representing: 2011 Legislative Reapportionment Commission, Respondent  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Gallagher, Kathleen A.  
 Eckert Seamans Cherin & Mellott, LLC  
 Address: 44th Floor USX Tower  
 600 Grant St  
 Pittsburgh, PA 15219  
 Phone No: (412) 566-6034  
 Representing: Michael Turzai, as a Member of the 2011 PA Legislative Reapportionment Commission,  
 Respondent Amicus Curiae  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Paszamant, Brian S.  
 Blank Rome LLP  
 Address: One Logan Sq 130 N 18th St  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103-6933  
 Phone No: (215) 569-5791  
 Representing: Senator Dominic Pileggi, Respondent Amicus Curiae  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---




---

**COUNSEL INFORMATION**


---

Attorney: Buchholz, Carl Merritt

Address: DLA Piper LLP  
One Liberty Place  
1650 Market St., Suite 4900  
Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (215) 656-3300

Representing: Senator Dominic Pileggi, Respondent Amicus Curiae

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Mullaney, Mary Ann

Address: Blank Rome LLP  
One Logan Sq 130 N 18th St  
Philadelphia, PA 19103-6933

Phone No: (215) 569-5598

Representing: Senator Dominic Pileggi, Respondent Amicus Curiae

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Robinson, Brian Michael

Address: DLA Piper US, LLP  
Dla Piper US Llp  
1650 Market St Fl 49  
Philadelphia, PA 19103-7301

Phone No: (215) 656-2445

Representing: Senator Dominic Pileggi, Respondent Amicus Curiae

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Clemmer, Shauna Christine

Address: PA Department of State  
PA Department of State  
301 N Office Building  
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0102

Phone No: (717) 783-0736

Representing: Bureau of Elections, Department of State, Participant

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Kelly, Linda L.

Address: Office of Attorney General  
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania  
Litigation Section  
15th Floor, Strawberry Square  
Harrisburg, PA 17120

Representing: Attorney General's Office, Participant

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

---




---

**COUNSEL INFORMATION**

Attorney: Granahan, Kathleen M.  
 Address: PA Office of Attorney General  
 16th Floor, Strawberry Square  
 Harrisburg, PA 17120  
 Phone No: (717) 787-3391  
 Representing: Attorney General's Office, Participant  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

**FEE INFORMATION**

Fee Dt	Fee Name	Fee Amt	Receipt Dt	Receipt No	Receipt Amt
07/10/2012	Petition for Review	73.50	07/10/2012	2012-SUP-M-000887	73.50

---

**AGENCY/TRIAL COURT INFORMATION**

Court Below:  
 County: Division:  
 Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: June 8, 2012  
 Docket Number: Carlisle, Cumberland County  
 Judge(s): OTN:  
 Order Type: Order

---

Court Below:  
 County: Division:  
 Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: June 8, 2012  
 Docket Number: Chester County  
 Judge(s): OTN:  
 Order Type: Order

---

Court Below:  
 County: Division:  
 Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: June 8, 2012  
 Docket Number: Coply, Lehigh County  
 Judge(s): OTN:  
 Order Type: Order

---

Court Below:  
 County: Division:  
 Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: June 8, 2012  
 Docket Number: Delaware County  
 Judge(s): OTN:  
 Order Type: Order

---

## Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



Miscellaneous Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 133 MM 2012

Page 6 of 11

September 25, 2018

---

Court Below:

County:

Division:

Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: June 8, 2012

Docket Number: Enola, Cumberland County

Judge(s):

OTN:

Order Type: Order

---

Court Below:

County:

Division:

Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: June 8, 2012

Docket Number: Lehigh County

Judge(s):

OTN:

Order Type: Order

---

Court Below:

County:

Division:

Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: June 8, 2012

Docket Number: Lower Merion Twp, Montgomery Co.

Judge(s):

OTN:

Order Type: Order

---

Court Below:

County:

Division:

Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: June 8, 2012

Docket Number: McMurray, Washington County

Judge(s):

OTN:

Order Type: Order

---

Court Below:

County:

Division:

Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: June 8, 2012

Docket Number: Mechanicsburg, Cumberland County

Judge(s):

OTN:

Order Type: Order

---

## Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



Miscellaneous Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 133 MM 2012

Page 7 of 11

September 25, 2018

Court Below:

County:

Division:

Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: June 8, 2012

Docket Number: Philadelphia Ward 42

Judge(s):

OTN:

Order Type: Order

Court Below:

County:

Division:

Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: June 8, 2012

Docket Number: Pittsburgh, Allegheny County

Judge(s):

OTN:

Order Type: Order

Court Below:

County:

Division:

Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: June 8, 2012

Docket Number: Radnor Township, Delaware County

Judge(s):

OTN:

Order Type: Order

Court Below:

County:

Division:

Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: June 8, 2012

Docket Number: Ross Township, Allegheny County

Judge(s):

OTN:

Order Type: Order

Court Below:

County:

Division:

Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: June 8, 2012

Docket Number: Salisbury Township, Lehigh County

Judge(s):

OTN:

Order Type: Order

## ORIGINAL RECORD CONTENT

Original Record Item	Filed Date	Content/Description
----------------------	------------	---------------------

Record Remittal:

## BRIEFING SCHEDULE

## Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



## Miscellaneous Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 133 MM 2012

Page 8 of 11

September 25, 2018

**Petitioner****Holt, et al  
Brief**

Due: August 6, 2012

Filed: August 6, 2012

**Reply Brief**

Due: August 27, 2012

Filed:

**Respondent****2011 Legislative Reapportionment Commission  
Brief**

Due: August 20, 2012

Filed: August 20, 2012

**Respondent Amicus Curiae****Michael Turzai, as a Member of the 2011 PA  
Legislative Reapportionment Commission  
Brief**

Due: August 20, 2012

Filed: August 20, 2012

**Senator Dominic Pileggi  
Brief**

Due: August 20, 2012

Filed: August 20, 2012

**SESSION INFORMATION**

Journal Number: J-100-2012  
 Listed/Submitted Date: September 13, 2012  
 Consideration Type: Oral Argument Supreme Ct.

**DISPOSITION INFORMATION**

Related Journal No: J-100-2012 Judgment Date: May 8, 2013  
 Category: Decided Disposition Author: Castille, Ronald D.  
 Disposition: Appeal Dismissed Disposition Date: May 8, 2013  
 Dispositional Filing: **Majority Opinion** Author:  
 Filed Date: May 8, 2013

Justice:	Eakin, J. Michael	Vote:	Joins
Justice:	Baer, Max	Vote:	Joins
Justice:	Todd, Debra	Vote:	Joins
Justice:	McCaffery, Seamus P.	Vote:	Joins

Dispositional Filing: **Concurring Opinion** Author: Saylor, Thomas G.  
 Filed Date: May 8, 2013

**DOCKET ENTRY**

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
<b>July 9, 2012</b>	<b>Petition for Review</b>	Petitioner	Holt, et al





## DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
July 10, 2012	<b>Order Regarding Answer/No Answer Letter, Petitioner's Briefs, Consolidation and Argument</b>		Bizzoso, Irene M.
Comments:			
AND NOW, this 10th day of July, 2012, the above referenced matters are hereby consolidated for purposes of pleading, briefing and argument.			
A consolidated answer or no answer letter to the petitions for review is due by 1 P.M. Monday, July 23, 2012. Any prior directives regarding time frame for filing an answer is/are hereby rescinded.			
Petitioners' briefs are to be received by the Supreme Court of Pennsylvania Prothonotary's Office by 1:00 p.m. on Monday, August 6, 2012. If hand delivered, briefs may be filed at the nearest Supreme Court Prothonotary's Office. Service of said briefs shall be made via personal service or e-mail as agreed to by the parties.			
Respondent's consolidate brief is due on or before 1:00 p.m. Monday, August 20, 2012, under the same filing and service constraints as aforementioned. Due to the nature of these appeals and the constricted time frame, no applications for extensions of time will be entertained.			
Oral argument will be scheduled during the September argument session in Philadelphia, by separate order.			
July 10, 2012	<b>Order Exited</b>		Office of the Prothonotary
July 19, 2012	<b>Agency Record Received</b>		Legislative Reapportionment Commission
July 23, 2012	<b>Answer to Petition for Review</b>	Respondent	2011 Legislative Reapportionment Commission
August 6, 2012	<b>Order Regarding Oral Argument</b>		Bizzoso, Irene M.
Comments:			
AND NOW, this 6th day of August, 2012, this matter is hereby listed as case #2 for argument session commencing at 9:30 a.m., Thursday, September 13, 2012, in Philadelphia, PA. Petition and Respondent will be allotted up to thirty (30) minutes per side to present their argument.			
August 6, 2012	<b>Order Exited</b>		Office of the Prothonotary
August 6, 2012	<b>Brief of Petitioners with Appendix</b>	Petitioner	Holt, et al
August 6, 2012	<b>Motion for Leave to File a Brief in Excess of the Page Limit Set Forth by Pa.R.A.P. 2135</b>	Respondent	2011 Legislative Reapportionment Commission
August 6, 2012	<b>Order Granting Motion for Leave to File Brief in Excess of Page Limitation</b>		Vaskov, John A.
Comments:			
AND NOW, this 6th day of August, 2012, the Motion for Leave to File Brief in Excess of Page Limitation is granted, the Respondent's Brief not to exceed 110 pages.			
August 6, 2012	<b>Order Exited</b>		Office of the Prothonotary



## DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
<b>August 13, 2012</b>	<b>Acknowledgement of Argument Notice</b>		
	2011 Legislative Reapportionment Commission	Respondent	Del Sole, Joseph A.
	2011 Legislative Reapportionment Commission	Respondent	Stickman, William Shaw, IV
<b>August 13, 2012</b>	<b>Acknowledgement of Argument Notice</b>		
	Holt, et al	Petitioner	Churchill, Michael
	Holt, et al	Petitioner	Newmann, David
	Holt, et al	Petitioner	Gibson, Virginia A.
<b>August 20, 2012</b>	<b>Respondent's Brief</b>		
		Respondent	2011 Legislative Reapportionment Commission
<b>August 20, 2012</b>	<b>Respondent Amicus Curiae's Brief</b>	Respondent Amicus Curiae	Michael Turzai, as a Member of the 2011 PA Legislative Reapportionment Commission
<b>August 20, 2012</b>	<b>Petition of Amicus Curiae Turzai for Leave to Participate in Oral Argument</b>	Respondent Amicus Curiae	Michael Turzai, as a Member of the 2011 PA Legislative Reapportionment Commission
<b>August 20, 2012</b>	<b>Respondent Amicus Curiae's Brief</b>	Respondent Amicus Curiae	Senator Dominic Pileggi
<b>August 22, 2012</b>	<b>No Answer Letter to Petition of Amicus Curiae Turzai for Leave to Participate in Oral Argument</b>	Respondent	2011 Legislative Reapportionment Commission
<b>August 27, 2012</b>	<b>Petitioner's Reply Brief</b>	Petitioner	Holt, et al
<b>August 28, 2012</b>	<b>Order Denying Petition of Amicus Curiae Turzai for Leave to Participate in Oral Argument</b>		Per Curiam
Comments:			
AND NOW, this 28th day of August, 2012, the Petition of Amicus Curiae Michael Turzai as a Member of the 2011 Pennsylvania Legislative Reapportionment Commission for Leave to Participate in Oral Argument is DENIED. See Pa.R.A.P. 531(b).			
<b>August 28, 2012</b>	<b>Order Exited</b>		Office of the Prothonotary
<b>September 11, 2012</b>	<b>Praecipe for Appearance</b>		
	2011 Legislative Reapportionment Commission	Respondent	Cavanaugh, Patrick Kennedy



## DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
September 13, 2012	Argued		Supreme Court of Pennsylvania
May 8, 2013	Appeal Dismissed		Castille, Ronald D.

## Comments:

The matter has been ably briefed, both by concerned citizens and the LRC. For the reasons we have articulated above, we reaffirm Holt I as against the various challenges made to the decision; and we further determine that, as against the specific challenges presented in these various appeals, the LRC, in crafting the 2012 Final Plan, sufficiently heeded this Court's admonition that it "could have easily achieved a substantially greater fidelity to all of the mandates in Article II, Section 16" than it did in its unconstitutional 2011 Final Plan. See Holt I, 38 A.3d at 718. Moreover, we hold that the appellants have not demonstrated that the 2012 Final Plan is contrary to law. We therefore conclude that the LRC has utilized the population data of the 2010 census to create a redistricting map that complies with the Pennsylvania Constitution, which shall hereby have the force of law, beginning with the 2014 election cycle. The appeals are dismissed.

Jurisdiction relinquished.

Former Justice Orié Melvin did not participate in the consideration or decision of these appeals.

Messrs. Justice Eakin and Baer, Madame Justice Todd and Mr. Justice McCaffery join the opinion.

Mr. Justice Saylor files a concurring opinion.

May 8, 2013	Judgment Entered		Office of the Prothonotary
May 30, 2013	Reconsideration Time Expired/Case Closed		Office of the Prothonotary

## Comments:

Notification sent to the Legislative Reapportionment Commission

6-4-13 - Received receipt acknowledgment from the Reapportionment Commission.