

## Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



## Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 85 MAP 2022

Page 1 of 20

February 20, 2026

## CAPTION

Jessica Shirley, Interim Acting Secretary of the Department of Environmental Protection and Acting Chairperson of the Environmental Quality Board

v.

Pennsylvania Legislative Reference Bureau, Vincent C. DeLiberato, Jr., Director of the Legislative Reference Bureau, and Amy J. Mendelsohn, Director of the Pennsylvania Code and Bulletin

Appeal of: Citizens for Pennsylvania's Future, Sierra Club, and Clean Air Council, Possible Intervenors

## CASE INFORMATION

Initiating Document: Notice of Appeal

Case Status: Closed

Journal Number: J-30B-2023 May 24, 2023

Case Category: Administrative Agency

Case Type(s): Environmental Protection,  
Department of  
Environmental Quality Board

## CONSOLIDATED CASES

## RELATED CASES

Docket No / Reason	Type	Docket No / Reason	Type
79 MAP 2022	Consolidated	45 MAP 2022	Related
Sua Sponte		Same Record Below	
87 MAP 2022	Consolidated	McDonnell v. PA Legislative Reference Bureau et al	
Sua Sponte		79 MAP 2022	Related
		Similar Issues	
		DEP et al. Aplt v. PA Legislative Reference Bureau	
		81 MAP 2022	Related
		Similar Issues	
		Ziadeh, R v. PA Legislative Reference Bureau et al	
		83 MAP 2022	Related
		Similar Issues	
		Ziadeh, R v. PA Legislative Reference Bureau et al	
		87 MAP 2022	Related
		Similar Issues	
		DEP, et al. v. PA Legislative Reference Bureau	
		89 MAP 2022	Related
		Similar Issues	
		Bowfin KeyCon Hldgs. et al., Aplt. v. DEP et al.	
		106 MAP 2023	Related
		Same Record Below	
		DEP, et al. Aplt v. PA Legislative Ref. Bureau	
		113 MAP 2023	Related
		Same Record Below	
		DEP et al. Aplt v. PA Legislative Reference Bureau	
		114 MAP 2023	Related
		Same Record Below	
		Bowfin KeyCon Hldgs. et al. v. DEP et al.	

## Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



## Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 85 MAP 2022

Page 2 of 20

February 20, 2026

## RELATED CASES

Docket No / Reason	Type
115 MAP 2023	Related
Same Record Below	
DEP, et al. v. PA Legislative Reference Bureau	
116 MAP 2023	Related
Same Record Below	
Bowfin KeyCon Hldgs. et al. v. DEP et al.	

## COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Bomstein, Alexander George  
 Clean Air Council  
 Address: 1617 Jfk Blvd Ste 1130  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 567-4004  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Clean Air Council, Appellant  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

Attorney: O'Neill, Jessica Rose  
 Citizens for Pennsylvania's Future  
 Address: 1429 Walnut St Ste 400  
 Philadelphia, PA 19102  
 Phone No: (843) 906-6402  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Citizens for Pennsylvania's Future, Appellant  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Sierra Club, Appellant  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Bast, Emma Hope  
 PennFuture  
 Address: 1429 Walnut St Ste 400  
 Philadelphia, PA 19102  
 Phone No: (267) 838-9154  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Citizens for Pennsylvania's Future, Appellant  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Sierra Club, Appellant  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

## Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



## Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 85 MAP 2022

Page 3 of 20

February 20, 2026

## COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Kilbert, Angela Mae  
 PennFuture  
 Address: 200 First Ave  
 Ste 200  
 Pittsburgh, PA 15222  
 Phone No: (412) 760-8495  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Citizens for Pennsylvania's Future, Appellant  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Sierra Club, Appellant  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Hull, Kandice Kerwin  
 McNeese Wallace & Nurick LLC  
 Address: Po Box 1166  
 Harrisburg, PA 17108-1166  
 Phone No: (717) 232-8000  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Browne, Pat, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Corman, Jake, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Ward, Kim, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Yaw, Gene, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

## Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



## Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 85 MAP 2022

Page 4 of 20

February 20, 2026

## COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Klein, Peter William  
 Address: Legislative Reference Bureau  
 501 N Third St 641 Main Capitol Bldg  
 Harrisburg, PA 17120  
 Phone No: (717) 787-4223  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: DeLiberato, Jr., Vincent C., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Mendelsohn, Amy J., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Pennsylvania Legislative Reference Bureau, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Kutz, James John  
 Post & Schell, P.C.  
 Address: Post & Schell Pc  
 17 N 2ND St Fl 12  
 Harrisburg, PA 17101-1638  
 Phone No: (717) 731-1970  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Causer, Martin T., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Cutler, Bryan D., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Pittinsky, David  
 Ballard Spahr, LLP  
 Address: Ballard Spahr LLP  
 1735 Market St Fl 51  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103-7599  
 Phone No: (215) 864-8117  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Negrin, Richard, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

## Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



## Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 85 MAP 2022

Page 5 of 20

February 20, 2026

## COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Bogush, Mark Andrew  
 Legislative Reference Bureau  
 Address: 501 N 3RD St 641 Main Capitol Bldg  
 Harrisburg, PA 17120  
 Phone No: (717) 787-5323  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: DeLiberato, Jr., Vincent C., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Mendelsohn, Amy J., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Pennsylvania Legislative Reference Bureau, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Burruss, John Chesley  
 Ballard Spahr LLP  
 Address: 1735 Market St Fl 51  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 864-8237  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Negrin, Richard, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Butash, Andrew  
 Legislative Reference Bureau  
 Address: Legislative Reference Bur  
 501 N 3RD St 641 Main Capitol Bldg  
 Harrisburg, PA 17120  
 Phone No: (717) 787-4223  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: DeLiberato, Jr., Vincent C., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Mendelsohn, Amy J., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Pennsylvania Legislative Reference Bureau, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

## Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



## Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 85 MAP 2022

Page 6 of 20

February 20, 2026

## COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Campbell, Sean Christopher  
 Post & Schell, P.C.  
 Address: Post & Schell P.c.  
 17 N 2ND St 12th Fl  
 Harrisburg, PA 17101  
 Phone No: (717) 612-6056  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes  
 Representing: Causer, Martin T., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Cutler, Bryan D., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

Email:

Attorney: Corey, Rodney A.  
 Pennsylvania House of Representatives Republican Caucus  
 Address: Pa House Of Representatives  
 Main Capitol Bldg Ste B 6 P.o. Box 202228  
 Harrisburg, PA 17120-2228  
 Phone No: (717) 783-1510  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes  
 Representing: Causer, Martin T., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Cutler, Bryan D., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

Email:

Attorney: Crompton, J. Andrew  
 McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC  
 Address: 100 Pine Street  
 PO Box 1166  
 Harrisburg, PA 17108-1166  
 Phone No: (717) 237-8000  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Browne, Pat, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Corman, Jake, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Ward, Kim, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Yaw, Gene, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

## Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



## Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 85 MAP 2022

Page 7 of 20

February 20, 2026

## COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Gallagher, Thomas Joseph, IV  
 Ballard Spahr, LLP  
 Address: Ballard Spahr Llp  
 1735 Market St  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103-7599  
 Phone No: (215) 864-8383  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Negrin, Richard, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Hazlett, Thomas W.  
 Ballard Spahr, LLP  
 Address: Ballard Spahr Llp  
 1735 Market St Fl 51  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 665-8500  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Negrin, Richard, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Hughey, Austin David  
 McNees Wallace & Nurick  
 Address: 100 Pine St  
 Harrisburg, PA 17101  
 Phone No: (864) 517-6871  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Browne, Pat, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Corman, Jake, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Ward, Kim, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

## Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



## Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 85 MAP 2022

Page 8 of 20

February 20, 2026

## COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Kawa, Erin Renee  
 Post & Schell, P.C.  
 Address: Post & Schell Pc  
 17 N Second St Fl 12  
 Harrisburg, PA 17101  
 Phone No: (717) 612-6057  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Causer, Martin T., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Cutler, Bryan D., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Kearney, Brian Nolan  
 Ballard Spahr, LLP  
 Address: Ballard Spahr Llp  
 1735 Market St 51st Fl  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103-7599  
 Phone No: (609) 284-2479  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Negrin, Richard, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Khuri, Brigid Landy  
 McNees Wallace & Nurick  
 Address: 100 Pine St  
 Harrisburg, PA 17101  
 Phone No: (717) 237-5319  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Browne, Pat, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Corman, Jake, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Ward, Kim, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Yaw, Gene, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:



## Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



## Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 85 MAP 2022

Page 9 of 20

February 20, 2026

## COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Mann, James Guthrie  
 Pennsylvania House of Representatives  
 Address: Ste B 6 Main Capitol  
 Po Box 202228  
 Harrisburg, PA 17120-2228  
 Phone No: (717) 783-1510  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Causer, Martin T., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Cutler, Bryan D., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

Attorney: McCaulley, Errin Todd, Jr.  
 McNeese Wallace & Nurick LLC  
 Address: McNeese Wallace & Nurick  
 100 Pine St Ste 550  
 Harrisburg, PA 17101  
 Phone No: (717) 237-5366  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Browne, Pat, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Corman, Jake, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Ward, Kim, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Yaw, Gene, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Watson, Travis Wood  
 Ballard Spahr LLP  
 Address: 1735 Market St  
 51st Floor  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 864-8475  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Negrin, Richard, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

## Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



## Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 85 MAP 2022

Page 10 of 20

February 20, 2026

## COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney:	White, Matthew Adam	
	Ballard Spahr, LLP	
Address:	Ballard Spahr Llp	
	1735 Market St Fl 51	
	Philadelphia, PA 19103-7599	
Phone No:	(215) 864-8849	
Receive Mail:	Yes	
Receive EMail:	Yes	Email:
Representing:	Negrin, Richard, Appellee	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		

---

Attorney:	Brown, C. Baird	
	eco(n)law LLC	
Address:	230 S Broad St	
	17th Floor	
	Philadelphia, PA 19102	
Phone No:	(215) 586-6615	
Receive Mail:	Yes	
Representing:	Keystone Energy Efficiency Alliance, et al., Amicus Curiae	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		

---

Attorney:	Dernbach, John C.	
Address:	251 North 27th Street, Camp Hill, PA, USA	
	3800 Vartan Way	
	Camp Hill, PA 17011	
Phone No:	(717) 829-3258	
Receive Mail:	Yes	
Receive EMail:	Yes	Email:
Representing:	Widener University Environmental Law and Sustainability Center, Amicus Curiae	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		

---

Attorney:	McKinstry, Robert Bruce, Jr.	
Address:	548 School House Rd	
	Kennett Square, PA 19348	
Phone No:	(484) 467-3207	
Receive Mail:	Yes	
Representing:	McKinstry, Robert B., Jr., Amicus Curiae	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		

## Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



## Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 85 MAP 2022

Page 11 of 20

February 20, 2026

## SUPREME COURT INFORMATION

Appeal From: the Order of the Commonwealth Court at No. 41 MD 2022 dated June 28, 2022.

Appeal Filed Below: 7/20/2022 12:00:00AM

Probable Jurisdiction Noted:

Docketed Date:

July 20, 2022

Allocatur/Miscellaneous Granted:

Allocatur/Miscellaneous Docket No.:

Allocatur/Miscellaneous Grant Order:

## FEE INFORMATION

Fee Dt	Fee Name	Fee Amt	Receipt Dt	Receipt No	Receipt Amt
07/25/2022	Notice of Appeal	90.25	07/25/2022	2022-SUP-M-001698	361.00

## INTERMEDIATE APPELLATE COURT INFORMATION

Court Name:

Docket Number:

Date of Order:

Rearg/Recon Disp Date:

Rearg/Recon Disposition:

Judge(s):

Intermediate Appellate Court Action:

Referring Court:

## AGENCY/TRIAL COURT INFORMATION

Court Below: Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

County:

Division: Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: June 28, 2022

Docket Number: 41 MD 2022

Judge(s): Wojcik, Michael H.

OTN:

Order Type: Order

## ORIGINAL RECORD CONTENT

Original Record Item	Filed Date	Content/Description
Part(s)		3 Boxes
Transcript(s)		5
Exhibit(s)		4 Binders
Part(s)	June 11, 2024	25 - Commonwealth Court Supplemental Record
@ 106 MAP 2023	August 05, 2024	

Record Remittal: August 5, 2024

## BRIEFING SCHEDULE

Amicus Curiae

Keystone Energy Efficiency Alliance, et al.

Brief

Due: November 4, 2022

Filed: November 4, 2022

Appellee

Browne, Pat

Brief

Due: November 28, 2022

Filed: November 28, 2022

McKinstry, Robert B., Jr.

Brief

Supplemental Brief

Due: January 22, 2024

Filed: January 22, 2024

## Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



## Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 85 MAP 2022

Page 12 of 20

February 20, 2026

## BRIEFING SCHEDULE

**Amicus Curiae****McKinstry, Robert B., Jr.****Brief**

Due: November 4, 2022

Filed: November 7, 2022

**Widener University Environmental Law and  
Sustainability Center****Brief**

Due: November 4, 2022

Filed: November 7, 2022

**Appellant****Citizens for Pennsylvania's Future****Brief**

Due: November 4, 2022

Filed: November 4, 2022

**Reply Brief**

Due: December 5, 2022

Filed: December 5, 2022

**Reproduced Record**

Due: November 4, 2022

Filed: November 4, 2022

**Supplemental Brief**

Due: January 8, 2024

Filed: January 8, 2024

**Clean Air Council****Brief**

Due: November 4, 2022

Filed: November 4, 2022

**Reply Brief**

Due: December 5, 2022

Filed: December 5, 2022

**Reproduced Record**

Due: November 4, 2022

Filed: November 4, 2022

**Supplemental Brief**

Due: January 8, 2024

Filed: January 8, 2024

**Sierra Club****Brief**

Due: November 4, 2022

Filed: November 4, 2022

**Reply Brief**

Due: December 5, 2022

Filed: December 5, 2022

**Reproduced Record**

Due: November 4, 2022

Filed: November 4, 2022

**Supplemental Brief**

Due: January 8, 2024

Filed: January 8, 2024

**Appellee****Browne, Pat****Causer, Martin T.****Brief**

Due: November 28, 2022

Filed: November 28, 2022

**Supplemental Brief**

Due: January 22, 2024

Filed: January 22, 2024

**Corman, Jake****Brief**

Due: November 28, 2022

Filed: November 28, 2022

**Supplemental Brief**

Due: January 22, 2024

Filed: January 22, 2024

**Cutler, Bryan D.****Brief**

Due: November 28, 2022

Filed: November 28, 2022

**Supplemental Brief**

Due: January 22, 2024

Filed: January 22, 2024

**DeLiberato, Jr., Vincent C.****Brief**

Due: November 28, 2022

Filed:

**Supplemental Brief**

Due: January 22, 2024

Filed:

**Mendelsohn, Amy J.****Brief**

Due: November 28, 2022

Filed:

**Supplemental Brief**

Due: January 22, 2024

Filed:

**Negrin, Richard****Brief**

Due: November 28, 2022

Filed:

**Supplemental Brief**

Due: January 22, 2024

Filed:

**Pennsylvania Legislative Reference Bureau****Brief**

Due: November 28, 2022

Filed:

**Supplemental Brief**

## Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



## Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 85 MAP 2022

Page 13 of 20

February 20, 2026

## BRIEFING SCHEDULE

## Appellee

Pennsylvania Legislative Reference Bureau

## Supplemental Brief

Due: January 22, 2024 Filed:

## Ward, Kim

## Brief

Due: November 28, 2022 Filed: November 28, 2022

## Supplemental Brief

Due: January 22, 2024 Filed: January 22, 2024

## Yaw, Gene

## Brief

Due: November 28, 2022 Filed: November 28, 2022

## Supplemental Brief

Due: January 22, 2024 Filed: January 22, 2024

## SESSION INFORMATION

Journal Number: J-30B-2023  
 Listed/Submitted Date: May 24, 2023  
 Consideration Type: Oral Argument Supreme Ct.

## DISPOSITION INFORMATION

Related Journal No:	J-30B-2023	Judgment Date:	July 18, 2024
Category:	Decided	Disposition Author:	Dougherty, Kevin M.
Disposition:	Reversed	Disposition Date:	July 18, 2024
Dispositional Filing:	<b>Majority Opinion</b>	Author:	Dougherty, Kevin M.

Filed Date: July 18, 2024

Justice:	Todd, Debra	Vote:	Joins
Justice:	Donohue, Christine	Vote:	Joins
Justice:	Wecht, David N.	Vote:	Joins

Dispositional Filing:	<b>Concurring Opinion</b>	Author:	Donohue, Christine
-----------------------	---------------------------	---------	--------------------

Filed Date: July 18, 2024

Justice:	Todd, Debra	Vote:	Join Concurring Opinion
----------	-------------	-------	-------------------------

Dispositional Filing:	<b>Concurring/Dissenting Opinion</b>	Author:	Mundy, Sallie U.
-----------------------	--------------------------------------	---------	------------------

Filed Date: July 18, 2024

## Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



## Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 85 MAP 2022

Page 14 of 20

February 20, 2026

## DISPOSITION INFORMATION

Dispositional Filing: **Concurring/Dissenting Opinion** Author: Brobson, P. Kevin

Filed Date: July 18, 2024

## DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
July 20, 2022	Notice of Appeal	Appellant	Citizens for Pennsylvania's Future
		Appellant	Clean Air Council
		Appellant	Sierra Club
July 20, 2022	Jurisdictional Statement	Appellant	Citizens for Pennsylvania's Future
		Appellant	Clean Air Council
		Appellant	Sierra Club
August 3, 2022	Answer to Notice of Appeal & Jurisdictional Statement	Appellee	Benninghoff, Kerry A.
		Appellee	Cutler, Bryan D.
		Appellee	Causer, Martin T.
August 3, 2022	Answer to Notice of Appeal & Jurisdictional Statement	Appellee	Browne, Pat
		Appellee	Corman, Jake
		Appellee	Ward, Kim
		Appellee	Yaw, Gene
August 3, 2022	No Answer Letter to Notice of Appeal & Jurisdictional Statement	Appellee	Negrin, Richard
August 3, 2022	Answer to Notice of Appeal & Jurisdictional Statement	Appellee	DeLiberato, Jr., Vincent C.
		Appellee	Mendelsohn, Amy J.
		Appellee	Pennsylvania Legislative Reference Bureau
August 5, 2022	Application for Leave to Join Application to Consolidate and Expedite Appeals	Appellant	Citizens for Pennsylvania's Future
		Appellant	Clean Air Council
		Appellant	Sierra Club
August 8, 2022	No Answer Letter to Application to Expedite and Consolidate	Appellee	Negrin, Richard

## Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



## Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 85 MAP 2022

Page 15 of 20

February 20, 2026

## DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
August 10, 2022	No Answer Letter to Application to Expedite and Consolidate	Appellee Appellee Appellee	DeLiberato, Jr., Vincent C. Mendelsohn, Amy J. Pennsylvania Legislative Reference Bureau
August 10, 2022	Answer to Application to Expedite and Consolidate	Appellee Appellee Appellee	Benninghoff, Kerry A. Cutler, Bryan D. Causer, Martin T.
August 10, 2022	Answer to Application to Expedite and Consolidate	Appellee Appellee Appellee Appellee	Browne, Pat Corman, Jake Ward, Kim Yaw, Gene
August 30, 2022	Notice of Disclosure		Brobson, P. Kevin
October 12, 2022	Jurisdiction Postponed		Per Curiam
Comments: AND NOW, this 12th day of October, 2022, the determination of this Court's jurisdiction is DEFERRED to consideration of the briefs. In addition to the issues set forth in purported Appellants' jurisdictional statements, purported Appellants and the parties, including those who attained party status when the Commonwealth Court permitted them to intervene, are ORDERED to address the appealability of the Commonwealth Court's order denying purported Appellants' intervention request. See Markham v. Wolf, 136 A.3d 134, 138 n.4 (Pa. 2016) (explaining that an order denying intervention is immediately appealable under the collateral order doctrine). See also Pa.R.A.P. 313 (setting forth the collateral order doctrine). Purported Appellants and the parties are ORDERED to file briefs that jointly address both of the appeals captioned on this order. The Combined Application for Leave to Join Application of Appellant Constellation is DISMISSED.			
October 12, 2022	Order Exited		Office of the Prothonotary
October 14, 2022	Commonwealth Court Record Received		Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania
October 21, 2022	Designation of Contents of Reproduced Record	Appellant	Citizens for Pennsylvania's Future
November 4, 2022	Appellant's Brief	Appellant Appellant Appellant	Citizens for Pennsylvania's Future Clean Air Council Sierra Club

## Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



## Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 85 MAP 2022

Page 16 of 20

February 20, 2026

## DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
November 4, 2022	Appellant's Reproduced Record (3 volumes)	Appellant	Citizens for Pennsylvania's Future
		Appellant	Clean Air Council
		Appellant	Sierra Club
November 4, 2022	Amicus Curiae Brief	Amicus Curiae	Keystone Energy Efficiency Alliance, et al.
November 7, 2022	Amicus Curiae Brief	Amicus Curiae	McKinstry, Robert B., Jr.
		Amicus Curiae	Widener University Environmental Law and Sustainability Center
November 28, 2022	Appellee's Brief	Appellee	Browne, Pat
		Appellee	Corman, Jake
		Appellee	Ward, Kim
		Appellee	Yaw, Gene
November 28, 2022	Appellee's Brief	Appellee	Benninghoff, Kerry A.
		Appellee	Cutler, Bryan D.
		Appellee	Causer, Martin T.
December 5, 2022	Appellant's Reply Brief	Appellant	Citizens for Pennsylvania's Future
		Appellant	Clean Air Council
		Appellant	Sierra Club
December 5, 2022	Application for Order Confirming Substitution of Parties and Amending Caption of Appellees	Appellee	Browne, Pat
		Appellee	Corman, Jake
		Appellee	Ward, Kim
		Appellee	Yaw, Gene
Comments:			
Requesting "Senate President Pro Tempore Jake Corman, Senate Majority Leader Kim Ward, and Senate Committee Chair Pat Browne" changed to "Senator Kim Ward, Interim Senate President Pro Tempore; Senator Joseph Pittman, Senate Majority Leader; Senator Scott Martin, Chair of the Senate Appropriations Committee"			
December 19, 2022	Answer in Support of Application for Order Confirming Substitution of Parties and Amending Caption o	Appellee	Benninghoff, Kerry A.
		Appellee	Cutler, Bryan D.
		Appellee	Causer, Martin T.



## Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



## Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 85 MAP 2022

Page 17 of 20

February 20, 2026

## DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
December 19, 2022	<b>No Answer to App. for Order Confirming Substitution of Parties and Amending Caption of Appellees</b>	Appellee Appellee Appellee	DeLiberato, Jr., Vincent C. Mendelsohn, Amy J. Pennsylvania Legislative Reference Bureau

**March 21, 2023**      **Dispositional Memo Order**

Per Curiam

## Comments:

AND NOW, this 21st day of March, 2023, oral argument is GRANTED in the appeals docketed at 85 MAP 2022 and 87 MAP 2022, and a determination of jurisdiction is DEFERRED to consideration of the briefs; in the appeal docketed at 79 MAP 2022, oral argument is GRANTED, LIMITED to the following issues as phrased by the appellant:

1. Did Commonwealth Court err in determining that Senators raised a substantial legal question with respect to whether RGGI Rulemaking's CO2 emission allowances are taxes, not fees?
2. Did Commonwealth Court err in determining that Senators demonstrated irreparable harm?
3. Did Commonwealth Court err in failing to properly balance the harms alleged by Senators with the harms the Commonwealth demonstrated would occur if the RGGI Regulation were enjoined?
4. Did Commonwealth Court err in failing to properly assess the public interest in implementing and enforcing the RGGI Regulation?
5. Did Commonwealth Court err in determining that enjoining the RGGI Regulation would abate the harms alleged by Senate Intervenors?

The remaining issues in the appeal docketed at 79 MAP 2022 are submitted on the briefs, and the Court will not entertain them at oral argument.

The Senate Intervenors' Application for Order Confirming Substitution of Parties and Amending Caption in the appeal docketed at 79 MAP 2022 is GRANTED without prejudice to any party's ability to challenge legislative standing, which will be decided on the briefs. See Pa.R.A.P. 502(c).

**March 21, 2023**      **Order Exited**

Office of the Prothonotary

**March 30, 2023**      **Acknowledgement of Argument Notice**

Corman, Jake	Appellee	Hull, Kandice Kerwin
Ward, Kim	Appellee	Hull, Kandice Kerwin
Yaw, Gene	Appellee	Hull, Kandice Kerwin
Browne, Pat	Appellee	Hull, Kandice Kerwin
Ward, Kim	Appellee	Crompton, J. Andrew
Yaw, Gene	Appellee	Crompton, J. Andrew
Browne, Pat	Appellee	Crompton, J. Andrew
Corman, Jake	Appellee	Crompton, J. Andrew
Ward, Kim	Appellee	Khuri, Brigid Landy
Yaw, Gene	Appellee	Khuri, Brigid Landy
Browne, Pat	Appellee	Khuri, Brigid Landy
Corman, Jake	Appellee	Khuri, Brigid Landy

## Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



## Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 85 MAP 2022

Page 18 of 20

February 20, 2026

## DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
<b>March 30, 2023</b>	<b>Acknowledgement of Argument Notice</b>		
	Pennsylvania Legislative Reference Bureau	Appellee	Klein, Peter William
	DeLiberato, Jr., Vincent C.	Appellee	Klein, Peter William
	Mendelsohn, Amy J.	Appellee	Klein, Peter William
<b>March 31, 2023</b>	<b>Acknowledgement of Argument Notice</b>		
	Citizens for Pennsylvania's Future	Appellant	O'Neill, Jessica Rose
	Sierra Club	Appellant	O'Neill, Jessica Rose
<b>April 4, 2023</b>	<b>Praecipe to Substitute (Cutler for Benninghoff &amp; Causer for Metcalfe)</b>		
		Appellee	Benninghoff, Kerry A.
		Appellee	Cutler, Bryan D.
		Appellee	Causer, Martin T.
Comments: Pursuant to Pennsylvania Rule of Appellate Procedure 502(c): Substitute Representative Bryan D. Cutler, Leader of the House Republican Caucus, for Representative Kerry A. Benninghoff. Substitute Representative Martin T. Causer, Republican Chair of the House Environmental Resources and Energy Committee, for former-Representative Daryl D. Metcalfe. Representative Kerry Benninghoff not participating as a party as is no longer the Leader of the House Republican Caucus.			
<b>April 11, 2023</b>	<b>Acknowledgement of Argument Notice</b>		
	Cutler, Bryan D.	Appellee	Kutz, James John
	Benninghoff, Kerry A.	Appellee	Kutz, James John
	Causer, Martin T.	Appellee	Kutz, James John
<b>May 24, 2023</b>	<b>Argued</b>		
	Citizens for Pennsylvania's Future	Appellant	O'Neill, Jessica Rose
	Sierra Club	Appellant	O'Neill, Jessica Rose
	Ward, Kim	Appellee	Hull, Kandice Kerwin
	Yaw, Gene	Appellee	Hull, Kandice Kerwin
	Browne, Pat	Appellee	Hull, Kandice Kerwin
	Corman, Jake	Appellee	Hull, Kandice Kerwin
	Ward, Kim	Appellee	Khuri, Brigid Landy
	Yaw, Gene	Appellee	Khuri, Brigid Landy
	Browne, Pat	Appellee	Khuri, Brigid Landy
	Corman, Jake	Appellee	Khuri, Brigid Landy
	Negrin, Richard	Appellee	White, Matthew Adam
	McDonnell, Patrick J.	Appellee	White, Matthew Adam
	Patrick J. McDonnell, Secretary of the Department of Environmental Protection	Appellee	White, Matthew Adam

## Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



## Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 85 MAP 2022

Page 19 of 20

February 20, 2026

## DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
<b>December 18, 2023</b>	<b>Order Directing Filing of Supplemental Briefs</b>		Per Curiam
Comments:			
AND NOW, this 18th day of December, 2023, the parties are hereby directed to file supplemental briefs addressing whether the appeals should be dismissed as moot in light of the Commonwealth Court's order on November 1, 2023. Appellants' briefs are due within 21 days of the date of this order, and appellees' briefs are due within 14 days of service of appellants' briefs.			
<b>December 18, 2023</b>	<b>Order Exited</b>		Office of the Prothonotary
<b>January 8, 2024</b>	<b>Appellant's Supplemental Brief</b>	Appellant Appellant Appellant	Citizens for Pennsylvania's Future Clean Air Council Sierra Club
<b>January 12, 2024</b>	<b>Praecepte for Appearance</b> Negrin, Richard	Appellee	Watson, Travis Wood
<b>January 12, 2024</b>	<b>Praecepte for Appearance</b> Negrin, Richard	Appellee	Burruss, John Chesley
<b>January 22, 2024</b>	<b>Appellee's Supplemental Brief</b>	Appellee Appellee	Cutler, Bryan D. Causar, Martin T.
<b>January 22, 2024</b>	<b>Appellee's Supplemental Brief</b>	Appellee Appellee Appellee Appellee	Browne, Pat Corman, Jake Ward, Kim Yaw, Gene
<b>February 19, 2024</b>	<b>Praecepte for Withdrawal of Appearance</b> Clean Air Council Clean Air Council	Appellant Appellant	Minott, Joseph Otis Cohen, Paul Jay, II
<b>June 11, 2024</b>	<b>Supplemental Commonwealth Court Record Received</b>		Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania
<b>July 18, 2024</b>	<b>Reversed</b>		Dougherty, Kevin M.

Comments:

For the foregoing reasons, in the appeal docketed at 85 MAP 2022, the order of the Commonwealth Court is reversed, and the appeal docketed at 87 MAP 2022 is dismissed as moot.

Chief Justice Todd and Justices Donohue and Wecht join the opinion.

Justice Donohue files a concurring opinion in which Chief Justice Todd joins.

Justice Mundy files a concurring and dissenting opinion.

Justice Brobson files a concurring and dissenting opinion.

## Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



## Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 85 MAP 2022

Page 20 of 20

February 20, 2026

## DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
July 18, 2024	Judgment Entered		Office of the Prothonotary
August 5, 2024	Remitted		Office of the Prothonotary
August 7, 2024	Acknowledgement of opinion dated July 19, 2024.		Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania