



## CAPTION

Ryan Covert, Darlene J. Covert, and Erik Hulick, Petitioners  
 v.  
 2021 Pennsylvania Legislative Reapportionment Commission, Respondent

## CASE INFORMATION

Initiating Document: Petition for Review  
 Case Status: Closed  
 Journal Number:  
 Case Category: Administrative Agency Case Type(s): Redistricting

## CONSOLIDATED CASES

## RELATED CASES

Docket No / Reason	Type
11 MM 2022 Same Issue(s) Benninghoff, K, Pet v. 2021 Legislative Reapp Comm	Related
14 MM 2022 Same Issue(s) Boscola, L., Pet. v. 2021 Legislative Reapp Comm	Related
16 MM 2022 Same Issue(s) Roe, E., Pet. v. 2021 Legislative Reapp Comm	Related
17 MM 2022 Same Issue(s) Donagi, R, etal, Pets, v 2021 Legislative Reap Com	Related
18 MM 2022 Same Issue(s) Ingram, G, et al, Pets v 2021 Legislative Reap Com	Related
7 WM 2022 Similar Issues Koger, T., Pet. v. 2021 Legislative Reapp Comm.	Related
11 WM 2022 Same Issue(s) Hutz, J., Pet. v. 2021 Legislative Reapp Comm	Related
12 WM 2022 Same Issue(s) Kress, E., Pet v. 2021 Legislative Reapp Comm	Related

## COUNSEL INFORMATION




---

**COUNSEL INFORMATION**


---

Attorney: Gilliland-Vanasdale, Jennifer L.  
 Gilliland Vanasdale Sinatra Law Office, LLC  
 Address: Gilliland Vanasdale Sinatra Law Office LLC  
 257 S Main St  
 Butler, PA 16001  
 Phone No: (724) 741-0536  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Covert, Darlene J., Petitioner  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Covert, Ryan, Petitioner  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Hulick, Erik, Petitioner  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Brier, Daniel Thomas  
 Myers, Brier & Kelly, LLP  
 Address: Myers Brier & Kelly  
 425 Spruce St Ste 200  
 Scranton, PA 18503  
 Phone No: (570) 342-6100  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: McClinton, Joanna E., Intervenor - Respondent  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Armezzani, Richard Louis  
 Myers, Brier & Kelly, LLP  
 Address: Myers Brier & Kelly Llp  
 425 Biden St Ste 200  
 Scranton, PA 18503  
 Phone No: (570) 342-6100  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: McClinton, Joanna E., Intervenor - Respondent  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---




---

**COUNSEL INFORMATION**


---

Attorney: Brier, Patrick Joseph  
 Patrick Brier & Associates, LLC  
 Address: Patrick J Brier & Associates  
 425 Spruce St Ste 200  
 Scranton, PA 18503  
 Phone No: (570) 342-6100  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: McClinton, Joanna E., Intervenor - Respondent  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Comber, Michael Anthony  
 Reisinger Comber & Miller, LLC  
 Address: Reisinger Comber & Miller LLC  
 436 Seventh Ave Ste 300  
 Pittsburgh, PA 15219  
 Phone No: (412) 894-1380  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: McClinton, Joanna E., Intervenor - Respondent  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Walsh, Donna Ann  
 Myers, Brier & Kelly, LLP  
 Address: 425 Spruce St  
 Ste 200  
 Scranton, PA 18503  
 Phone No: (570) 342-6100  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: McClinton, Joanna E., Intervenor - Respondent  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Byer, Robert L.  
 Duane Morris LLP  
 Address: 600 Grant St Ste 5010  
 Pittsburgh, PA 15219-2802  
 Phone No: (412) 497-1083  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: 2021 Pennsylvania Legislative Reapportionment Commission, Respondent  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---




---

**COUNSEL INFORMATION**


---

Attorney: Mintz, Leah Ariel  
 Duane Morris, LLP  
 Address: 30 S 17TH St  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 979-1263  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: 2021 Pennsylvania Legislative Reapportionment Commission, Respondent  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Kotula, Kathleen Marie  
 Pennsylvania Department of State  
 Address: Pa Dept Of State  
 306 N Ofc Bldg 401 North St  
 Harrisburg, PA 17120-0500  
 Phone No: (717) 783-1657  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Bureau of Elections, Participant  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Shapiro, Joshua D.  
 Address: Pennsylvania Office Of Attorney General  
 Strawberry Sq Fl 16  
 Harrisburg, PA 17120  
 Phone No: (717) 783-7556  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Office of the Attorney General, Participant  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Pro Se: Holt, Amanda E.  
 Address: 124 Bastian Lane  
 Allentown, PA 18104  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Pro Se: Holt, Amanda E., Amicus Curiae  
 Pro Se: Yes  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Hull, Kandice Kerwin  
 McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC  
 Address: Po Box 1166  
 Harrisburg, PA 17108-1166  
 Phone No: (717) 232-8000  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: County Commissioners Association of Pennsylvania, Amicus Curiae  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---



#### COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Levine, Clifford B.  
 Address: Dentons Cohen Grigsby  
 Dentons Cohen & Grigsby P.C.  
 625 Liberty Ave; 5th floor  
 Pittsburgh, PA 15222  
 Phone No: (412) 297-4998  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Costa, Senator Jay, Amicus Curiae  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

#### FEE INFORMATION

Fee Dt	Fee Name	Fee Amt	Receipt Dt	Receipt No	Receipt Amt
02/15/2022	Petition for Review	90.25	02/15/2022	2022-SUP-W-000293	90.25

#### AGENCY/TRIAL COURT INFORMATION

Court Below:  
 County: Division:  
 Date of Agency/Trial Court Order:  
 Docket Number:  
 Judge(s): OTN:  
 Order Type:

#### ORIGINAL RECORD CONTENT

Original Record Item	Filed Date	Content/Description
Agency Record	February 23, 2022	
Testimony	February 24, 2022	
Testimony	March 03, 2022	
Agency Record	March 04, 2022	
Testimony	March 04, 2022	
Testimony	March 05, 2022	

#### Record Remittal:

#### BRIEFING SCHEDULE

<b>Amicus Curiae</b> <b>County Commissioners Association of Pennsylvania</b> <b>Brief</b> Due: Filed: March 7, 2022	<b>Intervenor - Respondent</b> <b>McClinton, Joanna E.</b> <b>Brief</b> Due: March 11, 2022 Filed: March 11, 2022
<b>Holt, Amanda E.</b> <b>Brief</b> Petitioner	<b>Respondent</b> <b>2021 Pennsylvania Legislative Reapportionment Commission</b> <b>Brief</b> Due: March 11, 2022 Filed: March 11, 2022
<b>Covert, Darlene J.</b> <b>Brief</b>	



## BRIEFING SCHEDULE

**Petitioner****Covert, Darlene J.****Brief**

Due: March 7, 2022

Filed: March 7, 2022

**Covert, Ryan****Brief**

Due: March 7, 2022

Filed: March 7, 2022

**Hulick, Erik****Brief**

Due: March 7, 2022

Filed: March 7, 2022

## DISPOSITION INFORMATION

Related Journal No:

Judgment Date:

Category:

Decided

Disposition Author:

Per Curiam

Disposition:

Order Denying Petition for Review

Disposition Date:

March 16, 2022

Dispositional Filing:

Author:

Filed Date:

## DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
<b>February 15, 2022</b>	<b>Petition for Review</b>	Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner	Covert, Ryan Hulick, Erik Covert, Darlene J.
<b>February 15, 2022</b>	<b>Amended Certificate of Service</b> Covert, Ryan Hulick, Erik Covert, Darlene J.	Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner	Gilliland-Vanasdale, Jennifer L. Gilliland-Vanasdale, Jennifer L. Gilliland-Vanasdale, Jennifer L.
<b>February 17, 2022</b>	<b>Praecepte for Appearance</b> 2021 Pennsylvania Legislative Reapportionment Commission	Respondent	Mintz, Leah Ariel
<b>February 17, 2022</b>	<b>No. 569 Judicial Administration Docket - Order dated February 17, 2022</b>		Supreme Court of Pennsylvania
<b>February 23, 2022</b>	<b>Agency Record Received</b>		Legislative Reapportionment Commission

Comments:

Record Index Tabs 1-38k and 39-43



## DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
<b>February 24, 2022</b>	<b>Agency Transcripts of Testimony</b>		Legislative Reapportionment Commission
Comments: Transcripts of Testimony Vol. I - XVII (pages 1-1021, plus exhibits)			
<b>March 3, 2022</b>	<b>Agency Transcripts of Testimony</b>		Legislative Reapportionment Commission
Comments: Transcripts of Testimony Vol XVIII-XXII (pages 1022-1464, plus exhibits)			
<b>March 3, 2022</b>	<b>Application for Oral Argument and Other Relief in Response to 2/17/22 and 2/23/22 Orders of Court</b>	Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner	Covert, Ryan Hulick, Erik Covert, Darlene J.
<b>March 4, 2022</b>	<b>Supplemental Application for Oral Argument and Other Relief</b>	Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner	Covert, Ryan Hulick, Erik Covert, Darlene J.
<b>March 4, 2022</b>	<b>Answer to Application for Relief</b>	Respondent	2021 Pennsylvania Legislative Reapportionment Commission
<b>March 4, 2022</b>	<b>Agency Record Received</b>		Legislative Reapportionment Commission
Comments: Report of Mark A. Nordenberg, Chair of the 2021 Pennsylvania Legislative Reapportionment Commission, Regarding the Commission's Final Plan			
<b>March 4, 2022</b>	<b>Notice of Intervention</b>	Intervenor - Respondent	McClinton, Joanna E.
<b>March 4, 2022</b>	<b>Order Denying Application for Relief</b>		Per Curiam
Comments: AND NOW, this 4th day of March, 2022, the Application for Oral Argument and Other Relief and the Supplemental Application for Oral Argument and Other Relief are DENIED.			
<b>March 4, 2022</b>	<b>Order Exited</b>		Office of the Prothonotary
<b>March 4, 2022</b>	<b>Agency Transcripts of Testimony</b>		Legislative Reapportionment Commission
Comments: Transcripts of Testimony Vol XXIII (pages 1465-1582, plus exhibits)			



## DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
March 5, 2022	Agency Transcripts of Testimony		Legislative Reapportionment Commission
Comments: Transcripts of Testimony Vol. XXIV-XXV (pages 1582-1795, plus exhibits)			
March 7, 2022	Amended Petition for Review	Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner	Covert, Ryan Hulick, Erik Covert, Darlene J.
March 7, 2022	Amicus Curiae Brief	Amicus Curiae	County Commissioners Association of Pennsylvania
March 7, 2022	Petitioner's Brief	Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner	Covert, Ryan Hulick, Erik Covert, Darlene J.
March 10, 2022	Application for Leave to File Brief Nunc Pro Tunc	Amicus Curiae	Holt, Amanda E.
March 11, 2022	Answer to Petition for Review	Intervenor - Respondent	McClinton, Joanna E.
March 11, 2022	Intervenor - Respondent's Brief	Intervenor - Respondent	McClinton, Joanna E.
March 11, 2022	Answer to Petition for Review	Respondent	2021 Pennsylvania Legislative Reapportionment Commission
March 11, 2022	Respondent's Brief	Respondent	2021 Pennsylvania Legislative Reapportionment Commission
March 11, 2022	Answer to Application for Leave to File Amicus Brief Nunc Pro Tunc	Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner	Covert, Ryan Hulick, Erik Covert, Darlene J.
March 11, 2022	No Answer Letter to Application for Leave to File Amicus Brief Nunc Pro Tunc	Intervenor - Respondent	McClinton, Joanna E.
March 11, 2022	No Answer Letter to Application for Leave to File Amicus Brief Nunc Pro Tunc	Respondent	2021 Pennsylvania Legislative Reapportionment Commission
March 11, 2022	Amicus Curiae Brief	Amicus Curiae	Costa, Senator Jay



## DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
March 14, 2022	<b>Application to Deny Senator Costa Amicus Participation &amp; to Strike Consolidated Answer of Intervenor</b>	Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner	Covert, Ryan Hulick, Erik Covert, Darlene J.
March 16, 2022	<b>Answer to Application for Relief</b>	Respondent	2021 Pennsylvania Legislative Reapportionment Commission
March 16, 2022	<b>Answer to Application for Relief</b>	Amicus Curiae	Costa, Senator Jay
March 16, 2022	<b>Answer to Application for Relief</b>	Intervenor - Respondent	McClinton, Joanna E.
March 16, 2022	<b>Supplemental Answer from LRC in Opposition</b>	Respondent	2021 Pennsylvania Legislative Reapportionment Commission
March 16, 2022	<b>Application for Relief</b>	Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner	Covert, Ryan Hulick, Erik Covert, Darlene J.
March 16, 2022	<b>Order Regarding Petition for Review</b>		Per Curiam
<p>Comments:</p> <p>AND NOW, this 16th day of March, 2022, upon consideration of the above-captioned legislative reapportionment appeals filed pursuant to PA. CONST. art. II, § 17(d) (indicating that "[a]ny aggrieved person may file an appeal from the final plan [of the 2021 Pennsylvania Legislative Reapportionment Commission] directly to the Supreme Court"), this Court finds that the Final Reapportionment Plan of the Pennsylvania Legislative Reapportionment Commission filed on February 4, 2022, is in compliance with the mandates of the Pennsylvania Constitution and the United States Constitution and is not contrary to law, and, therefore, shall have the force of law. See PA. CONST. art. II, § 17(d) &amp; (e) (specifying that "[i]f the appellant establishes that the final plan is contrary to law, the Supreme Court shall issue an order remanding the plan to the commission" and that "[w]hen the Supreme Court has finally decided an appeal...the reapportionment plan shall have the force of law..."). Further, it is hereby ordered that said Plan shall be used in all forthcoming elections to the General Assembly until the next constitutionally-mandated reapportionment shall be approved.</p> <p>All outstanding motions filed in the above-captioned matters are hereby DISMISSED.</p> <p>This Court's February 23, 2022 Order, at Judicial Administration Docket No. 569, which temporarily suspended the General Primary Election calendar relative to elections for seats in the General Assembly, is VACATED. Our adjustment to that calendar is resolved by separate order at that docket number and entered today.</p> <p>Jurisdiction relinquished.</p>			
March 16, 2022	<b>Order Exited</b>		Office of the Prothonotary
April 4, 2022	<b>Reconsideration Time Expired/Case Closed</b>		Office of the Prothonotary