



## CAPTION

Ron Y. Donagi, Philip T. Gressman, Pamela Gorkin, David P. Marsh, James L. Rosenberger, Eugene Boman, Gary Gordon, Liz McMahon, Timothy Feeman, and Garth Isaak, Petitioners

v.

2021 Legislative Reapportionment Commission, Respondent

## CASE INFORMATION

Initiating Document: Petition for Review

Case Status: Closed

Journal Number:

Case Category: Administrative Agency Case Type(s): Redistricting

## CONSOLIDATED CASES

## RELATED CASES

Docket No / Reason	Type
11 MM 2022 Same Issue(s) Benninghoff, K, Pet v. 2021 Legislative Reapp Comm	Related
14 MM 2022 Same Issue(s) Boscola, L., Pet. v. 2021 Legislative Reapp Comm	Related
16 MM 2022 Same Issue(s) Roe, E., Pet. v. 2021 Legislative Reapp Comm	Related
18 MM 2022 Same Issue(s) Ingram, G, et al, Pets v 2021 Legislative Reap Com	Related
4 WM 2022 Same Issue(s) Covert, et al, Pets v. 2021 Legislative Reapp Comm	Related
7 WM 2022 Same Issue(s) Koger, T., Pet. v. 2021 Legislative Reapp Comm.	Related
11 WM 2022 Same Issue(s) Hutz, J., Pet. v. 2021 Legislative Reapp Comm	Related
12 WM 2022 Same Issue(s) Kress, E., Pet v. 2021 Legislative Reapp Comm	Related

## COUNSEL INFORMATION




---

**COUNSEL INFORMATION**


---

Attorney:	Watterson, Kim M.	
	Reed Smith, LLP	
Address:	Reed Smith Llp	
	225 5TH Ave Ste 1200	
	Pittsburgh, PA 15222-2716	
Phone No:	(412) 288-7996	
Receive Mail:	Yes	
Receive EMail:	Yes	Email:
Representing:	Boman, Eugene, Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Representing:	Donagi, Ron Y., Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Representing:	Feeman, Timothy, Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Representing:	Gordon, Gary, Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Representing:	Gorkin, Pamela, Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Representing:	Gressman, Philip T., Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Representing:	Isaak, Garth, Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Representing:	Marsh, David P., Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Representing:	McMahon, Liz, Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Representing:	Rosenberger, James L., Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		

---




---

**COUNSEL INFORMATION**


---

Attorney: Amunson, Jessica  
 Pro Hac Vice  
 Jenner & Block LLP  
 Address: 1099 New York Ave NW Ste 900  
 Washington, DC 20001  
 Phone No: (202) 639-6023  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Boman, Eugene, Petitioner  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Donagi, Ron Y., Petitioner  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Feeman, Timothy, Petitioner  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Gordon, Gary, Petitioner  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Gorkin, Pamela, Petitioner  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Gressman, Philip T., Petitioner  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Isaak, Garth, Petitioner  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Marsh, David P., Petitioner  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: McMahon, Liz, Petitioner  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Rosenberger, James L., Petitioner  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---




---

**COUNSEL INFORMATION**


---

Attorney:	Hirsch, Sam	
	Pro Hac Vice	
	Jenner & Block LLP	
Address:	1099 New York Ave NW Ste 900	
	Washington, DC 20001-4412	
Receive Mail:	Yes	
Receive EMail:	Yes	Email:
Representing:	Boman, Eugene, Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Representing:	Donagi, Ron Y., Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Representing:	Feeman, Timothy, Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Representing:	Gordon, Gary, Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Representing:	Gorkin, Pamela, Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Representing:	Gressman, Philip T., Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Representing:	Isaak, Garth, Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Representing:	Marsh, David P., Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Representing:	McMahon, Liz, Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Representing:	Rosenberger, James L., Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		

---




---

**COUNSEL INFORMATION**


---

Attorney:	Misour, Devin Michael	
	Reed Smith, LLP	
Address:	Reed Smith Llp	
	225 Fifth Ave Fl 9	
	Pittsburgh, PA 15222	
Phone No:	(412) 288-3091	
Receive Mail:	Yes	
Receive EMail:	Yes	Email:
Representing:	Boman, Eugene, Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Representing:	Donagi, Ron Y., Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Representing:	Feeman, Timothy, Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Representing:	Gordon, Gary, Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Representing:	Gorkin, Pamela, Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Representing:	Gressman, Philip T., Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Representing:	Isaak, Garth, Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Representing:	Marsh, David P., Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Representing:	McMahon, Liz, Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Representing:	Rosenberger, James L., Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		

---




---

**COUNSEL INFORMATION**


---

Attorney:	Otterberg, April	
	Pro Hac Vice	
	Jenner & Block LLP	
Address:	353 N. Clark St	
	Chicago, IL 60654	
Phone No:	(312) 840-8646	
Receive Mail:	Yes	
Receive EMail:	Yes	Email:
Representing:	Boman, Eugene, Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Representing:	Donagi, Ron Y., Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Representing:	Feeman, Timothy, Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Representing:	Gordon, Gary, Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Representing:	Gorkin, Pamela, Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Representing:	Gressman, Philip T., Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Representing:	Isaak, Garth, Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Representing:	Marsh, David P., Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Representing:	McMahon, Liz, Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Representing:	Rosenberger, James L., Petitioner	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		

---

Attorney:	Byer, Robert L.	
	Duane Morris LLP	
Address:	600 Grant St Ste 5010	
	Pittsburgh, PA 15219-2802	
Phone No:	(412) 497-1083	
Receive Mail:	Yes	
Receive EMail:	Yes	Email:
Representing:	2021 Legislative Reapportionment Commission of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania,	
	Respondent	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		

---




---

**COUNSEL INFORMATION**


---

Attorney: Mintz, Leah Ariel  
 Duane Morris, LLP  
 Address: 30 S 17TH St  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 979-1263  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: 2021 Legislative Reapportionment Commission of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania,  
 Respondent  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Kotula, Kathleen Marie  
 PA Department of State  
 Address: 306 N Ofc Bldg 401 North St  
 Harrisburg, PA 17120-0500  
 Phone No: (717) 783-1657  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Bureau of Elections, Participant  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Shapiro, Joshua D.  
 Address: Pennsylvania Office Of Attorney General  
 Strawberry Sq Fl 16  
 Harrisburg, PA 17120  
 Phone No: (717) 783-7556  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Attorney General's Office, Participant  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Holtzman, Anthony Richard  
 Address: K& L Gates Llp  
 17 N 2ND St 18th Fl  
 Harrisburg, PA 17101-1507  
 Phone No: (717) 231-4500  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Ward, Kim, Amicus Curiae  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---




---

**COUNSEL INFORMATION**

Attorney: Levine, Clifford B.  
 Address: Dentons Cohen Grigsby  
 Dentons Cohen & Grigsby P.C.  
 625 Liberty Ave; 5th floor  
 Pittsburgh, PA 15222  
 Phone No: (412) 297-4998  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Costa, Senator Jay, Amicus Curiae  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

**FEE INFORMATION**

Fee Dt	Fee Name	Fee Amt	Receipt Dt	Receipt No	Receipt Amt
03/07/2022	Petition for Review	90.25	03/08/2022	2022-SUP-M-000598	90.25

---

**AGENCY/TRIAL COURT INFORMATION**

Court Below: Legislative Reapportionment Commission  
 County: Division: Legislative Reapportionment Commission  
 Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: February 4, 2022  
 Docket Number: House District 148  
 Judge(s): OTN:  
 Order Type: Order

---

Court Below: Legislative Reapportionment Commission  
 County: Division: Legislative Reapportionment Commission  
 Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: February 4, 2022  
 Docket Number: House District 165  
 Judge(s): OTN:  
 Order Type: Order

---

Court Below: Legislative Reapportionment Commission  
 County: Division: Legislative Reapportionment Commission  
 Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: February 4, 2022  
 Docket Number: House District 76  
 Judge(s): OTN:  
 Order Type: Order

---

Court Below: Legislative Reapportionment Commission  
 County: Division: Legislative Reapportionment Commission  
 Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: February 4, 2022  
 Docket Number: House District 82  
 Judge(s): OTN:



## Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



## Miscellaneous Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 17 MM 2022

Page 9 of 12

June 30, 2024

Order Type: Order

Court Below: Legislative Reapportionment Commission

County: Division: Legislative Reapportionment Commission

Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: February 4, 2022

Docket Number: Senate District 17

Judge(s): OTN:

Order Type: Order

Court Below: Legislative Reapportionment Commission

County: Division: Legislative Reapportionment Commission

Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: February 4, 2022

Docket Number: Senate District 23

Judge(s): OTN:

Order Type: Order

Court Below: Legislative Reapportionment Commission

County: Division: Legislative Reapportionment Commission

Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: February 4, 2022

Docket Number: Senate District 25

Judge(s): OTN:

Order Type: Order

Court Below: Legislative Reapportionment Commission

County: Division: Legislative Reapportionment Commission

Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: February 4, 2022

Docket Number: Senate District 26

Judge(s): OTN:

Order Type: Order

## ORIGINAL RECORD CONTENT

Original Record Item	Filed Date	Content/Description
Agency Record	March 07, 2022	Electroncially filed @ 4 WM 2022

## Record Remittal:

## BRIEFING SCHEDULE

**Amicus Curiae**  
**Costa, Senator Jay**  
**Brief**

Due: March 11, 2022

Filed: March 11, 2022

**Respondent**

**2021 Legislative Reapportionment Commission of the**  
**Commonwealth of Pennsylvania**  
**Brief**

Due: March 11, 2022

Filed: March 11, 2022

**Ward, Kim**



## BRIEFING SCHEDULE

**Amicus Curiae****Ward, Kim****Brief**

Due: March 11, 2022

Filed: March 11, 2022

**Petitioner****Boman, Eugene****Brief**

Due: March 7, 2022

Filed: March 7, 2022

**Donagi, Ron Y.****Brief**

Due: March 7, 2022

Filed: March 7, 2022

**Feeman, Timothy****Brief**

Due: March 7, 2022

Filed: March 7, 2022

**Gordon, Gary****Brief**

Due: March 7, 2022

Filed: March 7, 2022

**Gorkin, Pamela****Brief**

Due: March 7, 2022

Filed: March 7, 2022

**Gressman, Philip T.****Brief**

Due: March 7, 2022

Filed: March 7, 2022

**Isaak, Garth****Brief**

Due: March 7, 2022

Filed: March 7, 2022

**Marsh, David P.****Brief**

Due: March 7, 2022

Filed: March 7, 2022

**McMahon, Liz****Brief**

Due: March 7, 2022

Filed: March 7, 2022

**Rosenberger, James L.****Brief**

Due: March 7, 2022

Filed: March 7, 2022



## DISPOSITION INFORMATION

Related Journal No:		Judgment Date:	March 16, 2022
Category:	Decided	Disposition Author:	Per Curiam
Disposition:	Order Denying Petition for Review	Disposition Date:	March 16, 2022
Dispositional Filing:	<b>Order</b>	Author:	Per Curiam
Filed Date:	March 16, 2022		

## DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
<b>March 7, 2022</b>	<b>Petition for Review</b>	Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner	Donagi, Ron Y. Gressman, Philip T. Gorkin, Pamela Marsh, David P. Rosenberger, James L. Boman, Eugene Gordon, Gary McMahon, Liz Feeman, Timothy Isaak, Garth
<b>March 7, 2022</b>	<b>Petitioner's Brief/Math-Science Professors' Brief in Support of Petition for Review</b>	Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner	Donagi, Ron Y. Gressman, Philip T. Gorkin, Pamela Marsh, David P. Rosenberger, James L. Boman, Eugene Gordon, Gary McMahon, Liz Feeman, Timothy Isaak, Garth
<b>March 7, 2022</b>	<b>Agency Record Received</b>		Legislative Reapportionment Commission
Comments: Electronically Filed @ 4 WM 2022			
<b>March 8, 2022</b>	<b>Praecipe for Appearance</b> 2021 Legislative Reapportionment Commission of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania	Respondent	Mintz, Leah Ariel



## DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
March 11, 2022	<b>Brief for Amicus Curiae Kim Ward</b>	Amicus Curiae	Ward, Kim
March 11, 2022	<b>Brief of Amicus Curiae Senator Jay Costa</b>	Amicus Curiae	Costa, Senator Jay
March 11, 2022	<b>Respondent LRC Answer to Petition for Review</b>	Respondent	2021 Legislative Reapportionment Commission of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
March 11, 2022	<b>Respondent LRC Brief</b>	Respondent	2021 Legislative Reapportionment Commission of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
March 16, 2022	<b>Order Regarding Petition for Review</b>		Per Curiam

Comments:  
PER CURIAM

AND NOW, this 16th day of March, 2022, upon consideration of the above-captioned legislative reapportionment appeals filed pursuant to PA. CONST. art. II, § 17(d) (indicating that "[a]ny aggrieved person may file an appeal from the final plan [of the 2021 Pennsylvania Legislative Reapportionment Commission] directly to the Supreme Court"), this Court finds that the Final Reapportionment Plan of the Pennsylvania Legislative Reapportionment Commission filed on February 4, 2022, is in compliance with the mandates of the Pennsylvania Constitution and the United States Constitution and is not contrary to law, and, therefore, shall have the force of law. See PA. CONST. art. II, § 17(d) & (e) (specifying that "[i]f the appellant establishes that the final plan is contrary to law, the Supreme Court shall issue an order remanding the plan to the commission" and that "[w]hen the Supreme Court has finally decided an appeal...the reapportionment plan shall have the force of law..."). Further, it is hereby ordered that said Plan shall be used in all forthcoming elections to the General Assembly until the next constitutionally-mandated reapportionment shall be approved.

All outstanding motions filed in the above-captioned matters are hereby DISMISSED.

This Court's February 23, 2022 Order, at Judicial Administration Docket No. 569, which temporarily suspended the General Primary Election calendar relative to elections for seats in the General Assembly, is VACATED. Our adjustment to that calendar is resolved by separate order at that docket number and entered today.

Jurisdiction relinquished.

March 16, 2022	<b>Order Exited</b>		Office of the Prothonotary
March 31, 2022	<b>Reconsideration Time Expired/Case Closed</b>		Office of the Prothonotary