



CAPTION

Ron Y. Donagi, Philip T. Gressman, Pamela Gorkin, David P. Marsh, James L. Rosenberger, Eugene Boman, Gary Gordon, Liz McMahon, Timothy Feeman, and Garth Isaak, Petitioners

v.

2021 Legislative Reapportionment Commission, Respondent

CASE INFORMATION

Initiating Document: Petition for Review

Case Status: Closed

Journal Number:

Case Category: Administrative Agency Case Type(s): Redistricting

CONSOLIDATED CASES

RELATED CASES

| Docket No / Reason | Type |
|---|---------|
| 11 MM 2022 Same Issue(s) Benninghoff, K, Pet v. 2021 Legislative Reapp Comm | Related |
| 14 MM 2022 Same Issue(s) Boscola, L., Pet. v. 2021 Legislative Reapp Comm | Related |
| 16 MM 2022 Same Issue(s) Roe, E., Pet. v. 2021 Legislative Reapp Comm | Related |
| 18 MM 2022 Same Issue(s) Ingram, G, et al, Pets v 2021 Legislative Reap Com | Related |
| 4 WM 2022 Same Issue(s) Covert, et al, Pets v. 2021 Legislative Reapp Comm | Related |
| 7 WM 2022 Same Issue(s) Koger, T., Pet. v. 2021 Legislative Reapp Comm. | Related |
| 11 WM 2022 Same Issue(s) Hutz, J., Pet. v. 2021 Legislative Reapp Comm | Related |
| 12 WM 2022 Same Issue(s) Kress, E., Pet v. 2021 Legislative Reapp Comm | Related |

COUNSEL INFORMATION



COUNSEL INFORMATION

| | | |
|----------------|-----------------------------------|--------|
| Attorney: | Watterson, Kim M. | |
| | Reed Smith, LLP | |
| Address: | Reed Smith Llp | |
| | 225 5TH Ave Ste 1200 | |
| | Pittsburgh, PA 15222-2716 | |
| Phone No: | (412) 288-7996 | |
| Receive Mail: | Yes | |
| Receive EMail: | Yes | Email: |
| Representing: | Boman, Eugene, Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |
| Representing: | Donagi, Ron Y., Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |
| Representing: | Feeman, Timothy, Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |
| Representing: | Gordon, Gary, Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |
| Representing: | Gorkin, Pamela, Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |
| Representing: | Gressman, Philip T., Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |
| Representing: | Isaak, Garth, Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |
| Representing: | Marsh, David P., Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |
| Representing: | McMahon, Liz, Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |
| Representing: | Rosenberger, James L., Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |



COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Amunson, Jessica
 Pro Hac Vice
 Jenner & Block LLP
 Address: 1099 New York Ave NW Ste 900
 Washington, DC 20001
 Phone No: (202) 639-6023
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:
 Representing: Boman, Eugene, Petitioner
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Donagi, Ron Y., Petitioner
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Feeman, Timothy, Petitioner
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Gordon, Gary, Petitioner
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Gorkin, Pamela, Petitioner
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Gressman, Philip T., Petitioner
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Isaak, Garth, Petitioner
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Marsh, David P., Petitioner
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: McMahon, Liz, Petitioner
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Rosenberger, James L., Petitioner
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:



COUNSEL INFORMATION

| | | |
|----------------|-----------------------------------|--------|
| Attorney: | Hirsch, Sam | |
| | Pro Hac Vice | |
| | Jenner & Block LLP | |
| Address: | 1099 New York Ave NW Ste 900 | |
| | Washington, DC 20001-4412 | |
| Receive Mail: | Yes | |
| Receive EMail: | Yes | Email: |
| Representing: | Boman, Eugene, Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |
| Representing: | Donagi, Ron Y., Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |
| Representing: | Feeman, Timothy, Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |
| Representing: | Gordon, Gary, Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |
| Representing: | Gorkin, Pamela, Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |
| Representing: | Gressman, Philip T., Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |
| Representing: | Isaak, Garth, Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |
| Representing: | Marsh, David P., Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |
| Representing: | McMahon, Liz, Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |
| Representing: | Rosenberger, James L., Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |



COUNSEL INFORMATION

| | | |
|----------------|-----------------------------------|--------|
| Attorney: | Misour, Devin Michael | |
| | Reed Smith, LLP | |
| Address: | Reed Smith Llp | |
| | 225 Fifth Ave Fl 9 | |
| | Pittsburgh, PA 15222 | |
| Phone No: | (412) 288-3091 | |
| Receive Mail: | Yes | |
| Receive EMail: | Yes | Email: |
| Representing: | Boman, Eugene, Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |
| Representing: | Donagi, Ron Y., Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |
| Representing: | Feeman, Timothy, Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |
| Representing: | Gordon, Gary, Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |
| Representing: | Gorkin, Pamela, Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |
| Representing: | Gressman, Philip T., Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |
| Representing: | Isaak, Garth, Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |
| Representing: | Marsh, David P., Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |
| Representing: | McMahon, Liz, Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |
| Representing: | Rosenberger, James L., Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |



COUNSEL INFORMATION

| | | |
|----------------|-----------------------------------|--------|
| Attorney: | Otterberg, April | |
| | Pro Hac Vice | |
| | Jenner & Block LLP | |
| Address: | 353 N. Clark St | |
| | Chicago, IL 60654 | |
| Phone No: | (312) 840-8646 | |
| Receive Mail: | Yes | |
| Receive EMail: | Yes | Email: |
| Representing: | Boman, Eugene, Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |
| Representing: | Donagi, Ron Y., Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |
| Representing: | Feeman, Timothy, Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |
| Representing: | Gordon, Gary, Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |
| Representing: | Gorkin, Pamela, Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |
| Representing: | Gressman, Philip T., Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |
| Representing: | Isaak, Garth, Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |
| Representing: | Marsh, David P., Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |
| Representing: | McMahon, Liz, Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |
| Representing: | Rosenberger, James L., Petitioner | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |

| | | |
|----------------|--|--------|
| Attorney: | Byer, Robert L. | |
| | Duane Morris LLP | |
| Address: | 600 Grant St Ste 5010 | |
| | Pittsburgh, PA 15219-2802 | |
| Phone No: | (412) 497-1083 | |
| Receive Mail: | Yes | |
| Receive EMail: | Yes | Email: |
| Representing: | 2021 Legislative Reapportionment Commission of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, | |
| | Respondent | |
| Pro Se: | No | |
| IFP Status: | | |



COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Mintz, Leah Ariel
 Duane Morris, LLP
 Address: 30 S 17TH St
 Philadelphia, PA 19103
 Phone No: (215) 979-1263
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:
 Representing: 2021 Legislative Reapportionment Commission of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania,
 Respondent
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Kotula, Kathleen Marie
 PA Department of State
 Address: 306 N Ofc Bldg 401 North St
 Harrisburg, PA 17120-0500
 Phone No: (717) 783-1657
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Bureau of Elections, Participant
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Shapiro, Joshua D.
 Address: Pennsylvania Office Of Attorney General
 Strawberry Sq Fl 16
 Harrisburg, PA 17120
 Phone No: (717) 783-7556
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Attorney General's Office, Participant
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Holtzman, Anthony Richard
 Address: K& L Gates Llp
 17 N 2ND St 18th Fl
 Harrisburg, PA 17101-1507
 Phone No: (717) 231-4500
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:
 Representing: Ward, Kim, Amicus Curiae
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:



COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Levine, Clifford B.
 Address: Dentons Cohen Grigsby
 Dentons Cohen & Grigsby P.C.
 625 Liberty Ave; 5th floor
 Pittsburgh, PA 15222
 Phone No: (412) 297-4998
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Costa, Senator Jay, Amicus Curiae
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

FEE INFORMATION

| Fee Dt | Fee Name | Fee Amt | Receipt Dt | Receipt No | Receipt Amt |
|------------|---------------------|---------|------------|-------------------|-------------|
| 03/07/2022 | Petition for Review | 90.25 | 03/08/2022 | 2022-SUP-M-000598 | 90.25 |

AGENCY/TRIAL COURT INFORMATION

Court Below: Legislative Reapportionment Commission
 County: Division: Legislative Reapportionment Commission
 Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: February 4, 2022
 Docket Number: House District 148
 Judge(s): OTN:
 Order Type: Order

Court Below: Legislative Reapportionment Commission
 County: Division: Legislative Reapportionment Commission
 Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: February 4, 2022
 Docket Number: House District 165
 Judge(s): OTN:
 Order Type: Order

Court Below: Legislative Reapportionment Commission
 County: Division: Legislative Reapportionment Commission
 Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: February 4, 2022
 Docket Number: House District 76
 Judge(s): OTN:
 Order Type: Order

Court Below: Legislative Reapportionment Commission
 County: Division: Legislative Reapportionment Commission
 Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: February 4, 2022
 Docket Number: House District 82
 Judge(s): OTN:

Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



Miscellaneous Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 17 MM 2022

Page 9 of 12

December 3, 2024

Order Type: Order

Court Below: Legislative Reapportionment Commission

County: Division: Legislative Reapportionment Commission

Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: February 4, 2022

Docket Number: Senate District 17

Judge(s): OTN:

Order Type: Order

Court Below: Legislative Reapportionment Commission

County: Division: Legislative Reapportionment Commission

Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: February 4, 2022

Docket Number: Senate District 23

Judge(s): OTN:

Order Type: Order

Court Below: Legislative Reapportionment Commission

County: Division: Legislative Reapportionment Commission

Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: February 4, 2022

Docket Number: Senate District 25

Judge(s): OTN:

Order Type: Order

Court Below: Legislative Reapportionment Commission

County: Division: Legislative Reapportionment Commission

Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: February 4, 2022

Docket Number: Senate District 26

Judge(s): OTN:

Order Type: Order

ORIGINAL RECORD CONTENT

| Original Record Item | Filed Date | Content/Description |
|----------------------|----------------|----------------------------------|
| Agency Record | March 07, 2022 | Electroncially filed @ 4 WM 2022 |

Record Remittal:

BRIEFING SCHEDULE

Amicus Curiae
Costa, Senator Jay
Brief

Due: March 11, 2022

Filed: March 11, 2022

Respondent

2021 Legislative Reapportionment Commission of the
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Brief

Due: March 11, 2022

Filed: March 11, 2022

Ward, Kim



BRIEFING SCHEDULE

Amicus Curiae**Ward, Kim****Brief**

Due: March 11, 2022

Filed: March 11, 2022

Petitioner**Boman, Eugene****Brief**

Due: March 7, 2022

Filed: March 7, 2022

Donagi, Ron Y.**Brief**

Due: March 7, 2022

Filed: March 7, 2022

Feeman, Timothy**Brief**

Due: March 7, 2022

Filed: March 7, 2022

Gordon, Gary**Brief**

Due: March 7, 2022

Filed: March 7, 2022

Gorkin, Pamela**Brief**

Due: March 7, 2022

Filed: March 7, 2022

Gressman, Philip T.**Brief**

Due: March 7, 2022

Filed: March 7, 2022

Isaak, Garth**Brief**

Due: March 7, 2022

Filed: March 7, 2022

Marsh, David P.**Brief**

Due: March 7, 2022

Filed: March 7, 2022

McMahon, Liz**Brief**

Due: March 7, 2022

Filed: March 7, 2022

Rosenberger, James L.**Brief**

Due: March 7, 2022

Filed: March 7, 2022



DISPOSITION INFORMATION

| | | | |
|-----------------------|-----------------------------------|---------------------|----------------|
| Related Journal No: | | Judgment Date: | March 16, 2022 |
| Category: | Decided | Disposition Author: | Per Curiam |
| Disposition: | Order Denying Petition for Review | Disposition Date: | March 16, 2022 |
| Dispositional Filing: | Order | Author: | Per Curiam |
| Filed Date: | March 16, 2022 | | |

DOCKET ENTRY

| Filed Date | Docket Entry / Representing | Participant Type | Filed By |
|---|---|--|---|
| March 7, 2022 | Petition for Review | Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner | Donagi, Ron Y. Gressman, Philip T. Gorkin, Pamela Marsh, David P. Rosenberger, James L. Boman, Eugene Gordon, Gary McMahon, Liz Feeman, Timothy Isaak, Garth |
| March 7, 2022 | Petitioner's Brief/Math-Science Professors' Brief in Support of Petition for Review | Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner Petitioner | Donagi, Ron Y. Gressman, Philip T. Gorkin, Pamela Marsh, David P. Rosenberger, James L. Boman, Eugene Gordon, Gary McMahon, Liz Feeman, Timothy Isaak, Garth |
| March 7, 2022 | Agency Record Received | | Legislative Reapportionment Commission |
| Comments: Electronically Filed @ 4 WM 2022 | | | |
| March 8, 2022 | Praecipe for Appearance 2021 Legislative Reapportionment Commission of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania | Respondent | Mintz, Leah Ariel |



DOCKET ENTRY

| Filed Date | Docket Entry / Representing | Participant Type | Filed By |
|----------------|---|------------------|---|
| March 11, 2022 | Brief for Amicus Curiae Kim Ward | Amicus Curiae | Ward, Kim |
| March 11, 2022 | Brief of Amicus Curiae Senator Jay Costa | Amicus Curiae | Costa, Senator Jay |
| March 11, 2022 | Respondent LRC Answer to Petition for Review | Respondent | 2021 Legislative Reapportionment Commission of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania |
| March 11, 2022 | Respondent LRC Brief | Respondent | 2021 Legislative Reapportionment Commission of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania |
| March 16, 2022 | Order Regarding Petition for Review | | Per Curiam |

Comments:
PER CURIAM

AND NOW, this 16th day of March, 2022, upon consideration of the above-captioned legislative reapportionment appeals filed pursuant to PA. CONST. art. II, § 17(d) (indicating that "[a]ny aggrieved person may file an appeal from the final plan [of the 2021 Pennsylvania Legislative Reapportionment Commission] directly to the Supreme Court"), this Court finds that the Final Reapportionment Plan of the Pennsylvania Legislative Reapportionment Commission filed on February 4, 2022, is in compliance with the mandates of the Pennsylvania Constitution and the United States Constitution and is not contrary to law, and, therefore, shall have the force of law. See PA. CONST. art. II, § 17(d) & (e) (specifying that "[i]f the appellant establishes that the final plan is contrary to law, the Supreme Court shall issue an order remanding the plan to the commission" and that "[w]hen the Supreme Court has finally decided an appeal...the reapportionment plan shall have the force of law..."). Further, it is hereby ordered that said Plan shall be used in all forthcoming elections to the General Assembly until the next constitutionally-mandated reapportionment shall be approved.

All outstanding motions filed in the above-captioned matters are hereby DISMISSED.

This Court's February 23, 2022 Order, at Judicial Administration Docket No. 569, which temporarily suspended the General Primary Election calendar relative to elections for seats in the General Assembly, is VACATED. Our adjustment to that calendar is resolved by separate order at that docket number and entered today.

Jurisdiction relinquished.

| | | | |
|----------------|---|--|----------------------------|
| March 16, 2022 | Order Exited | | Office of the Prothonotary |
| March 31, 2022 | Reconsideration Time Expired/Case Closed | | Office of the Prothonotary |