



## CAPTION

Gabriel Ingram, Ruth Moton, Mark Kirchgasser and Susan Powell, Petitioners  
 v.  
 2021 Legislative Reapportionment Commission, Respondent

## CASE INFORMATION

Initiating Document: Petition for Review  
 Case Status: Closed  
 Journal Number:  
 Case Category: Administrative Agency Case Type(s): Redistricting

## CONSOLIDATED CASES

## RELATED CASES

| Docket No / Reason  | Type    |
|---|---------|
| 11 MM 2022<br>Same Issue(s)<br>Benninghoff, K, Pet v. 2021 Legislative Reapp Comm | Related |
| 14 MM 2022<br>Same Issue(s)<br>Boscola, L., Pet. v. 2021 Legislative Reapp Comm   | Related |
| 16 MM 2022<br>Same Issue(s)<br>Roe, E., Pet. v. 2021 Legislative Reapp Comm       | Related |
| 17 MM 2022<br>Same Issue(s)<br>Donagi, R, etal, Pets, v 2021 Legislative Reap Com | Related |
| 4 WM 2022<br>Same Issue(s)<br>Covert, et al, Pets v. 2021 Legislative Reapp Comm  | Related |
| 7 WM 2022<br>Same Issue(s)<br>Koger, T., Pet. v. 2021 Legislative Reapp Comm.     | Related |
| 11 WM 2022<br>Same Issue(s)<br>Hutz, J., Pet. v. 2021 Legislative Reapp Comm      | Related |
| 12 WM 2022<br>Same Issue(s)<br>Kress, E., Pet v. 2021 Legislative Reapp Comm      | Related |

## COUNSEL INFORMATION




---

**COUNSEL INFORMATION**


---

Attorney: Breth, Thomas E.  
 Dillon McCandless King Coulter & Graham, LLP  
 Address: Dillon Mccandless King Coulter & Graham Llp  
 128 W Cunningham St  
 Butler, PA 16001-5742  
 Phone No: (724) 283-2200  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Ingram, Gabriel, Petitioner  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Kirchgasser, Mark, Petitioner  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Moton, Ruth, Petitioner  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Powell, Susan, Petitioner  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Shakley, Michael Donald  
 Dillon McCandless King Coulter & Graham LLP  
 Address: 128 W Cunningham St  
 Butler, PA 16001  
 Phone No: (724) 283-2200  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Ingram, Gabriel, Petitioner  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Kirchgasser, Mark, Petitioner  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Moton, Ruth, Petitioner  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Powell, Susan, Petitioner  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---




---

**COUNSEL INFORMATION**


---

Attorney: Brier, Daniel Thomas  
 Myers, Brier & Kelly, LLP  
 Address: Myers Brier & Kelly  
 425 Spruce St Ste 200  
 Scranton, PA 18503  
 Phone No: (570) 342-6100  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: McClinton, Joanna E., Intervenor - Respondent  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Armezzani, Richard Louis  
 Myers, Brier & Kelly, LLP  
 Address: Myers Brier & Kelly Llp  
 425 Biden St Ste 200  
 Scranton, PA 18503  
 Phone No: (570) 342-6100  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: McClinton, Joanna E., Intervenor - Respondent  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Brier, Patrick Joseph  
 Patrick Brier & Associates, LLC  
 Address: Patrick J Brier & Associates  
 425 Spruce St Ste 200  
 Scranton, PA 18503  
 Phone No: (570) 342-6100  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: McClinton, Joanna E., Intervenor - Respondent  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Comber, Michael Anthony  
 Reisinger Comber & Miller, LLC  
 Address: Reisinger Comber & Miller LLC  
 436 Seventh Ave Ste 300  
 Pittsburgh, PA 15219  
 Phone No: (412) 894-1380  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: McClinton, Joanna E., Intervenor - Respondent  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---




---

**COUNSEL INFORMATION**


---

Attorney: Walsh, Donna Ann  
 Myers, Brier & Kelly, LLP  
 Address: 425 Spruce St  
 Ste 200  
 Scranton, PA 18503  
 Phone No: (570) 342-6100  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: McClinton, Joanna E., Intervenor - Respondent  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Byer, Robert L.  
 Duane Morris LLP  
 Address: 600 Grant St Ste 5010  
 Pittsburgh, PA 15219-2802  
 Phone No: (412) 497-1083  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: 2021 Legislative Reapportionment Commission, Respondent  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Mintz, Leah Ariel  
 Duane Morris, LLP  
 Address: 30 S 17TH St  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 979-1263  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: 2021 Legislative Reapportionment Commission, Respondent  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Kotula, Kathleen Marie  
 PA Department of State  
 Address: 306 N Ofc Bldg 401 North St  
 Harrisburg, PA 17120-0500  
 Phone No: (717) 783-1657  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Bureau of Elections, Participant  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---



## COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Shapiro, Joshua D.

Address: Pennsylvania Office Of Attorney General  
Strawberry Sq Fl 16  
Harrisburg, PA 17120

Phone No: (717) 783-7556

Receive Mail: Yes

Representing: Attorney General's Office, Participant

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Levine, Clifford B.

Address: Dentons Cohen Grigsby  
Dentons Cohen & Grigsby P.C.  
625 Liberty Ave; 5th floor  
Pittsburgh, PA 15222

Phone No: (412) 297-4998

Receive Mail: Yes

Representing: Costa, Senator Jay, Amicus Curiae

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

## FEE INFORMATION

| Fee Dt     | Fee Name            | Fee Amt | Receipt Dt | Receipt No        | Receipt Amt |
|------------|---------------------|---------|------------|-------------------|-------------|
| 03/07/2022 | Petition for Review | 90.25   | 03/08/2022 | 2022-SUP-M-000599 | 90.25       |

## AGENCY/TRIAL COURT INFORMATION

Court Below: Legislative Reapportionment Commission

County: Division: Legislative Reapportionment Commission

Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: February 2, 2022

Docket Number: 159 Legislative District

Judge(s): OTN:

Order Type: Order

## ORIGINAL RECORD CONTENT

| Original Record Item | Filed Date     | Content/Description              |
|----------------------|----------------|----------------------------------|
| Agency Record        | March 07, 2022 | Electroncially Filed @ 4 WM 2022 |

## Record Remittal:

## BRIEFING SCHEDULE

| Amicus Curiae       |                       | Intervenor - Respondent |                       |
|---------------------|-----------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------|
| Costa, Senator Jay  |                       | McClinton, Joanna E.    |                       |
| Brief               |                       | Brief                   |                       |
| Due: March 11, 2022 | Filed: March 11, 2022 | Due: March 11, 2022     | Filed: March 11, 2022 |
| <b>Petitioner</b>   |                       | <b>Respondent</b>       |                       |



## BRIEFING SCHEDULE

| Petitioner               |                      | Respondent   |                       |
|--------------------------|----------------------|--|-----------------------|
| <b>Ingram, Gabriel</b>   |                      | <b>2021 Legislative Reapportionment Commission</b> |                       |
| <b>Brief</b>             |                      | <b>Brief</b>                                       |                       |
| Due: March 7, 2022       | Filed: March 7, 2022 | Due: March 11, 2022                                | Filed: March 11, 2022 |
| <b>Kirchgasser, Mark</b> |                      |  |                       |
| <b>Brief</b>             |                      |  |                       |
| Due: March 7, 2022       | Filed: March 7, 2022 |  |                       |
| <b>Moton, Ruth</b>       |                      |  |                       |
| <b>Brief</b>             |                      |  |                       |
| Due: March 7, 2022       | Filed: March 7, 2022 |  |                       |
| <b>Powell, Susan</b>     |                      |  |                       |
| <b>Brief</b>             |                      |  |                       |
| Due: March 7, 2022       | Filed: March 7, 2022 |  |                       |

## DISPOSITION INFORMATION

|                       |                                   |                     |                |
|-----------------------|-----------------------------------|---------------------|----------------|
| Related Journal No:   |                                   | Judgment Date:      | March 16, 2022 |
| Category:             | Decided                           | Disposition Author: | Per Curiam     |
| Disposition:          | Order Denying Petition for Review | Disposition Date:   | March 16, 2022 |
| Dispositional Filing: | <b>Order</b>                      | Author:             | Per Curiam     |
| Filed Date:           | March 16, 2022                    |                     |                |

## DOCKET ENTRY

| Filed Date           | Docket Entry / Representing                                       | Participant Type | Filed By                               |
|----------------------|---|------------------|--|
| <b>March 7, 2022</b> | <b>Petition for Review</b>  | Petitioner       | Ingram, Gabriel                        |
|                      |   | Petitioner       | Moton, Ruth                            |
|                      |   | Petitioner       | Kirchgasser, Mark                      |
|                      |   | Petitioner       | Powell, Susan                          |
| <b>March 7, 2022</b> | <b>Petitioner's Brief/Brief in Support of Petition for Review</b> | Petitioner       | Ingram, Gabriel                        |
|                      |   | Petitioner       | Moton, Ruth                            |
|                      |   | Petitioner       | Kirchgasser, Mark                      |
|                      |   | Petitioner       | Powell, Susan                          |
| <b>March 7, 2022</b> | <b>Agency Record Received</b>                                     |                  | Legislative Reapportionment Commission |

Comments:  
Electronically Filed @ 4 WM 2022



## DOCKET ENTRY

| Filed Date     | Docket Entry / Representing  | Participant Type                                     | Filed By   |
|----------------|--|--|--|
| March 8, 2022  | <b>Praecipe for Appearance</b><br>2021 Legislative Reapportionment<br>Commission                       | Respondent   | Mintz, Leah Ariel  |
| March 10, 2022 | <b>Notice of Intervention</b>  | Intervenor - Respondent                              | McClinton, Joanna E.   |
| March 11, 2022 | <b>Intervenor McClinton Answer to Petition for Review</b>  | Intervenor - Respondent                              | McClinton, Joanna E.   |
| March 11, 2022 | <b>Intervenor McClinton's Brief</b>  | Intervenor - Respondent                              | McClinton, Joanna E.   |
| March 11, 2022 | <b>Brief of Amicus Curiae Senator Jay Costa</b>  | Amicus Curiae  | Costa, Senator Jay   |
| March 11, 2022 | <b>Respondent LRC Brief</b>  | Respondent   | 2021 Legislative<br>Reapportionment Commission   |
| March 11, 2022 | <b>Respondent LRC Answer to Petition for Review</b>  | Respondent   | 2021 Legislative<br>Reapportionment Commission   |
| March 14, 2022 | <b>Praecipe for Appearance</b><br>Ingram, Gabriel<br>Moton, Ruth<br>Kirchgasser, Mark<br>Powell, Susan | Petitioner<br>Petitioner<br>Petitioner<br>Petitioner | Shakley, Michael Donald<br>Shakley, Michael Donald<br>Shakley, Michael Donald<br>Shakley, Michael Donald |
| March 16, 2022 | <b>Application to Strike Reports in Respondent - Intervenor Consolidated Answer</b>                    | Petitioner<br>Petitioner<br>Petitioner<br>Petitioner | Ingram, Gabriel<br>Moton, Ruth<br>Kirchgasser, Mark<br>Powell, Susan                                     |



## DOCKET ENTRY

| Filed Date     | Docket Entry / Representing         | Participant Type | Filed By   |
|----------------|-------------------------------------|------------------|------------|
| March 16, 2022 | Order Regarding Petition for Review |                  | Per Curiam |

Comments:  
PER CURIAM

AND NOW, this 16th day of March, 2022, upon consideration of the above-captioned legislative reapportionment appeals filed pursuant to PA. CONST. art. II, § 17(d) (indicating that "[a]ny aggrieved person may file an appeal from the final plan [of the 2021 Pennsylvania Legislative Reapportionment Commission] directly to the Supreme Court"), this Court finds that the Final Reapportionment Plan of the Pennsylvania Legislative Reapportionment Commission filed on February 4, 2022, is in compliance with the mandates of the Pennsylvania Constitution and the United States Constitution and is not contrary to law, and, therefore, shall have the force of law. See PA. CONST. art. II, § 17(d) & (e) (specifying that "[i]f the appellant establishes that the final plan is contrary to law, the Supreme Court shall issue an order remanding the plan to the commission" and that "[w]hen the Supreme Court has finally decided an appeal...the reapportionment plan shall have the force of law..."). Further, it is hereby ordered that said Plan shall be used in all forthcoming elections to the General Assembly until the next constitutionally-mandated reapportionment shall be approved.

All outstanding motions filed in the above-captioned matters are hereby DISMISSED.

This Court's February 23, 2022 Order, at Judicial Administration Docket No. 569, which temporarily suspended the General Primary Election calendar relative to elections for seats in the General Assembly, is VACATED. Our adjustment to that calendar is resolved by separate order at that docket number and entered today.

Jurisdiction relinquished.

|                |  |  |                            |
|----------------|--|--|----------------------------|
| March 16, 2022 | Order Exited                             |  | Office of the Prothonotary |
| March 31, 2022 | Reconsideration Time Expired/Case Closed |  | Office of the Prothonotary |