Miscellaneous Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 386 MD 2024

Page 1 of 12

December 22, 2024



CAPTION

In re: Nomination Papers of Robert F. Kennedy, Jr. and Nicole Shanahan as the We The People Candidates for President and Vice President of the United States in the November 5, 2024 General Election

Objection of: Alexander Reber and

Janneken Smucker

CASE INFORMATION

Objection to Nominating Papers **Initiating Document:**

Case Status: Closed

Case Processing Status: August 23, 2024 Completed

Journal Number:

Case Category: Election Case Type(s): Objection to Nomination Papers

> **CONSOLIDATED CASES RELATED CASES**

COUNSEL INFORMATION

Petitioner Smucker, Janneken

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Ford, Timothy James Dilworth Paxson LLP Law Firm: Address: 1500 Market St Ste 3500E

Philadelphia, PA 19102

Fax No: Phone No: (215) 575-7017

Richards, Ira Neil Attorney: Law Firm: Dilworth Paxson LLP Address: 1500 Market St Ste 3500 E

Philadelphia, PA 19102-2101

Phone No: (215) 575-7061 Fax No:

Attorney: Spitzer, Margaret Ruth McGuire

Dilworth Paxson LLP Law Firm: Address: 136 Briarwood Dr

Holland, PA 18966

Phone No: (267) 994-7544 Fax No:

Attorney: Rodkey, David Law Firm: Dilworth Paxson LLP Address: 1500 E Market St 3500 E

Philadelphia, PA 19102

Phone No: (215) 575-7027 Fax No:

Miscellaneous Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 386 MD 2024

Page 2 of 12

December 22, 2024

COUNSEL INFORMATION

Fax No:

Petitioner Smucker, Janneken

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Small, Jack Michael Dilworth Paxson LLP Law Firm: Address: 1500 Market St Ste 3500e

Philadelphia, PA 19102

Phone No: (215) 575-7313 Fax No:

Petitioner Reber, Alexander

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Ford, Timothy James Dilworth Paxson LLP Law Firm: Address: 1500 Market St Ste 3500E

Philadelphia, PA 19102

Phone No: (215) 575-7017 Fax No:

Attorney: Richards, Ira Neil Law Firm: Dilworth Paxson LLP Address: 1500 Market St Ste 3500 E

Philadelphia, PA 19102-2101

(215) 575-7061 Phone No:

Spitzer, Margaret Ruth McGuire Attorney:

Law Firm: Dilworth Paxson LLP Address: 136 Briarwood Dr Holland, PA 18966

Fax No: Phone No: (267) 994-7544

Rodkey, David Attorney: Dilworth Paxson LLP Law Firm: Address: 1500 E Market St 3500 E

Philadelphia, PA 19102

Phone No: Fax No: (215) 575-7027

Small, Jack Michael Attorney: Law Firm: Dilworth Paxson LLP 1500 Market St Ste 3500e Address:

Philadelphia, PA 19102

Phone No: (215) 575-7313 Fax No:

Other Mullen, Kathleen Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Mullen, Kathleen Ann

Pennsylvania Governor's Office of General Counsel Law Firm:

Address: Dept of State

> 306 N Office Building Harrisburg, PA 17120-0102

Phone No: (717) 743-7563 Fax No:

Miscellaneous Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 386 MD 2024

Page 3 of 12

December 22, 2024



COUNSEL INFORMATION

Other Kotula, Kathleen Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Kotula, Kathleen Marie

Pennsylvania Department of State Law Firm:

Pa Dept Of State Address:

> 401 North St Rm 306 Harrisburg, PA 17120

Fax No: Phone No: (717) 783-1657

Other Everhart, lan Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Everhart, Ian Blythe Attorney:

Pennsylvania Department of State Law Firm:

Address: 11 Stanwix St Ste 340 Pittsburgh, PA 15222

Phone No: (717) 996-8723

Fax No:

Other Darr, Gregory Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Darr, Gregory Mitchell Attorney:

Pennsylvania Department of State Law Firm:

Address: Pa Dept Of State Occ

> 306 N Office Bldg Harrisburg, PA 17120

Phone No: (717) 571-5598

Phone No: (717) 346-0462

Respondent Shanahan, Nicole Ann

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Otter, Lawrence M.

Address: Po Box 575

Silverdale, PA 18962-0575

Phone No: (267) 261-2948 Fax No:

Attorney: Rossi, Paul Anthony

316 Hill St Address:

Mountville, PA 17554

Phone No: (717) 961-8978 Fax No:

Fax No:

Miscellaneous Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 386 MD 2024

Page 4 of 12

December 22, 2024



COUNSEL INFORMATION

Respondent Kennedy, Robert F., Jr.

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Otter, Lawrence M. Address:

Po Box 575

Silverdale, PA 18962-0575

Phone No: (267) 261-2948 Fax No:

Attorney: Rossi, Paul Anthony

Address: 316 Hill St

Mountville, PA 17554

Phone No: (717) 961-8978 Fax No:

FEE	INF	ORM/	NOITA
-----	-----	------	-------

Fee Dt	Fee Name	Fee Amt Receipt Dt	Receipt No	Receipt Amt
08/08/2024	Miscellaneous Docket Filing Fee	70.25 08/08/2024	2024-CMW-H-001221	70.25
08/14/2024	Subpoena	6.00 08/14/2024	2024-CMW-H-001236	6.00
08/14/2024	Subpoena	2.00 08/14/2024	2024-CMW-H-001238	2.00

AGENCY/TRIAL COURT INFORMATION

Order Appealed From: Notice of Appeal Filed:

Order Type:

Documents Received: August 8, 2024

Court Below:

Division: County: Judge: OTN:

Judicial District: Docket Number:

ORIGINAL RECORD CONTENT

Original Record Item Filed Date Content Description

Date of Remand of Record:

Reber, Alexander

BRIEFING SCHEDULE

Petitioner Respondent

Kennedy, Robert F., Jr.

Brief Brief

Due: August 15, 2024 Filed: August 15, 2024 Due: August 15, 2024 Filed: August 15, 2024

Smucker, Janneken Shanahan, Nicole Ann

Brief Brief

Due: August 15, 2024 Filed: August 15, 2024 Due: August 15, 2024 Filed: August 15, 2024

DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date Docket Entry / Filer Participant Type **Exit Date** Representing

Objection to Nominating Papers August 8, 2024

> Reber, Alexander Petitioner Smucker, Janneken Petitioner

Miscellaneous Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 386 MD 2024

Page 5 of 12



		DOCKET ENTRY		
Filed Date	Docket Entry / Filer	Representing	Participant Type	Exit Date
August 8, 2024	Certificate of Service Filed			
_	Ford, Timothy James	Reber, Alexander	Petitioner	
	Ford, Timothy James	Smucker, Janneken	Petitioner	
Document Na	me: Service of Petition			
August 9, 2024	Entry of Appearance			
	Otter, Lawrence M.	Kennedy, Robert F., Jr.	Respondent	
	Otter, Lawrence M.	Shanahan, Nicole Ann	Respondent	
Document Na	me: Atty. Otter for Respondents			

Miscellaneous Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 386 MD 2024

Page 6 of 12

December 22, 2024



		DOCKET ENTRY		
Filed Date	Docket Entry / Filer	Representing	Participant Type	Exit Date
August 9, 2024	Order Filed			08/09/2024
	Per Curiam			

Document Name: Scheduling and Case Management Order

Comment: NOW, August 9, 2024, upon consideration of the Petition to Set Aside Nomination Papers (Objection Petition):

- 1. IT IS HEREBY ORDERED:
- A. Hearing on the Objection Petition is scheduled for Monday, August 12, 2024, at 10:00 a.m., in Courtroom Number 2, Widener Building, One South Penn Square, 1339 Chestnut Street, 9th Floor, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania. Objectors are directed to secure the services of a court stenographer for the hearing. Failure of Objectors to secure the services of a court stenographer may result in the dismissal of this matter.
- B. If signature lines are challenged, Objectors shall secure, by request or subpoena, the presence of a Statewide Uniform Registry of Electors (SURE) system operator at the hearing.
- C. Service of the Objection Petition on Candidates and this Order on all parties is complete upon the posting of the Objection Petition and this Order on the Court's website in accordance with this Court's Notice and Order in In re: Objections to Nomination Petitions/Papers of Candidates for Statewide and State-Level Office (Pa. Cmwlth., No. 126 Misc. Dkt. No. 3, July 19, 2023).
- D. At the hearing, Objectors shall offer proof of timely service of the Objection Petition on the Secretary of the Commonwealth.
- 2. It is FURTHER ORDERED that the parties shall comply with the following in advance of the hearing:
- A. Objectors shall file a list of all witnesses to be called at the hearing and the curriculum vitae and expert report for each expert witness. Any witness not identified may be precluded from testifying except for good cause shown.
- B. Candidates shall file a list of all witnesses to be called at the hearing and the curriculum vitae and expert report for each expert witness. Any witness not identified may be precluded from testifying except for good cause shown.
- 3. If signature line challenges are at issue, it is FURTHER ORDERED that the parties shall comply with the following in advance of the hearing:
- A. Objectors and Candidates or Candidates' representatives and, if appropriate, a SURE system operator, shall meet to review each and every challenged signature line.
- B. Objectors and Candidates shall file a stipulation of the parties that identifies:
- (a) the total number of completed signature lines submitted;
- (b) the total number of uncontested signature lines submitted;
- (c) the total number of signature lines challenged;
- (d) each and every signature line to which there is an objection, identified by page number and line number, and the basis for the objection;
- (e) each and every signature line to be stricken as invalid or for which an objection is to be withdrawn, identified by page number and line number, if the parties can reach such a stipulation.
- C. Candidates shall file a list of all signature lines, identified by page number and line number, that are facially defective and that Candidates intend to rehabilitate. Candidates shall also state the manner in which Candidates intend to rehabilitate the signature lines.
- 4. Objectors and Candidates may each file a memorandum of law in support of their respective positions. No further memoranda will be permitted unless ordered by the Court.
- 5. Unless otherwise ordered, the parties shall file all items required or permitted by paragraphs 2, 3 and 4 of this Order by 12:00 noon, Sunday, August 11, 2024. Filing may be accomplished by PACFile (the Pennsylvania appellate court electronic filing system) or by email to CommCourtFiling@pacourts.us. Parties may not file by facsimile without express prior permission from the Court.
- 6. Failure to comply with any provision of this Order may preclude the noncompliant party from entering any evidence, and may result in the imposition of monetary sanctions.

Miscellaneous Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 386 MD 2024

Page 7 of 12



		DOCKET ENTRY		
Filed Date	Docket Entry / Filer	Representing	Participant Type	Exit Date
August 11, 2024	Stipulation Filed			
	Ford, Timothy James	Reber, Alexander	Petitioner	
	Ford, Timothy James	Smucker, Janneken	Petitioner	
	Otter, Lawrence M.	Kennedy, Robert F., Jr.	Respondent	
	Otter, Lawrence M.	Shanahan, Nicole Ann	Respondent	
Document Name:	Case Management Stipulation			
August 11, 2024	Memorandum of Law Filed			
	Ford, Timothy James	Reber, Alexander	Petitioner	
	Ford, Timothy James	Smucker, Janneken	Petitioner	
Document Name:	Objectors' Memorandum of Law	in Support of Petition to Set Aside		
August 11, 2024	Filed - Other			
	Ford, Timothy James	Reber, Alexander	Petitioner	
	Ford, Timothy James	Smucker, Janneken	Petitioner	
Document Name:	Objectors' Witness List			
August 11, 2024	Memorandum of Law Filed			
	Otter, Lawrence M.	Kennedy, Robert F., Jr.	Respondent	
Document Name:	Respondents' Pre-trial Memo			
ugust 11, 2024	Filed - Other			
	Otter, Lawrence M.	Kennedy, Robert F., Jr.	Respondent	
	Otter, Lawrence M.	Shanahan, Nicole Ann	Respondent	
Document Name:	Respondents' Witness List			
August 12, 2024	Hearing Scheduled			08/12/2024
	Dumas, Lori A.			
Document Name:	Aug. 20, 2024, 10:00am, Widene	er Bldg., Phila. / Briefing Set		
Comment:	brief addressing all legal issue Pa.R.A.P. 2135 for principal legal court Electronic Filing System facsimile without express prior particles are strongly encounted witnesses and other evidentia filed as part of each party's pre-trial statement, which must must be filed by 5:00 p.m., Market Pa.R.A.P. 2135 for principal issue principal statement in the particle is a part of each party's pre-trial statement, which must be filed by 5:00 p.m., Market Pa.R.A.P. 2135 for principal issue principal	August, 2024, we ORDER as forces on or before 12:00 p.m., Augustiefs. Filing may be accomplish m) or by email to CommCourtFermission from the Court. Eduled for Tuesday, August 20, 21 Penn Square, 1339 Chestnut Statement, and confer in a part of the August 21 pre-trial statement, which must of the also include the curriculum vitated Monday, August 19, 2024. Any we have shown. Objectors are directed to the curriculum vitated and the curriculum vitated	gust 15, 2024. Each be led by PACFile (the Filing@pacourts.us. Par 024, at 10:00 a.m., in street, 9th Floor, Philad dvance and agree or 20th hearing. Any succomply with Pa.R.Civ.Pale and expert report for vitness not identified managed by the street of t	rief must comply with Pennsylvania Appellatities may not file be Courtroom Number 2 delphia, Pennsylvania otherwise stipulate to the stipulation must be 2. 212.2. Each party'r any expert witness ay be precluded from
August 13, 2024	Entry of Appearance			
August 15, 2024	Rossi, Paul Anthony	Kennedy, Robert F., Jr.	Respondent	

Miscellaneous Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 386 MD 2024

Page 8 of 12



		DOCKET ENTRY		
Filed Date	Docket Entry / Filer	Representing	Participant Type	Exit Date
August 13, 2024	Order Filed			08/13/2024
	Per Curiam			
Document Name:	Court's 8-12-24 Order is AMENDE	ED only to the extent that the hearir	ng shall be held in Harris	burg, PA
Comment:	at: AND NOW, this 13th day of August, 2024, this Court's Order of August 12, 2024 is hereby AMENDED only to the extent that the evidentiary hearing currently scheduled for Tuesday, August 20, 2024, at 10:00 a.m., in Philadelphia, shall be held in Courtroom 3002, Pennsylvania Judicial Center, 601 Commonwealth Avenue, Harrisburg, Pennsylvania, on the same date and time. In all other respects the August 12, 2024 Order remains in effect.			
August 14, 2024	Entry of Appearance			
	Richards, Ira Neil	Reber, Alexander	Petitioner	
	Richards, Ira Neil	Smucker, Janneken	Petitioner	
Document Name:	Attorney Ira Neil Richards for Peti	tioners		
August 15, 2024	Respondent's Brief Filed			
	Kennedy, Robert F., Jr.		Respondent	
	Shanahan, Nicole Ann		Respondent	
August 15, 2024	Petitioner's Brief Filed			
	Reber, Alexander		Petitioner	
	Smucker, Janneken		Petitioner	

Miscellaneous Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 386 MD 2024

Page 9 of 12



December 22, 2024				
		DOCKET ENTRY		
Filed Date	Docket Entry / Filer	Representing	Participant Type	Exit Date
August 16, 2024	Order Filed Per Curiam Decorum Order			08/16/2024
Document Name Comment	AND NOW, this 16th day Office of Pennsylvania Cofor Tuesday, August 20, Judicial Center (PJC), an Court hereby ORDERS as f 1. Any schedule change practicable.	of August, 2024, after consultation ourts (AOPC) regarding the eviden 2024, at 10:00 a.m., in Courtroom of it appearing that there may be follows: es will be posted to the Court and media to observe the hearing	tiary hearing in this matter m 3002 (Courtroom), Third e significant public interes 's website and/or social	r, which is scheduled d Floor, Pennsylvania it in this matter, the media as soon as
	9:50 a.m. Additional sea Courtroom 5001 (Overflow	Courtroom will be reserved for prosting will be available to the puw Courtroom) on the Fifth Floor all live audio and video feed. Additional	ublic on a "first come, fi of the PJC, where the	rst seated" basis in
	reserved seats for proper Courtroom (collectively Countroom Police, or other	for properly credentialed members of the purtrooms) will be released to the er authorized security personnel will oms. Attorneys not involved in the	e media in the Courtroor public. 3. Nobody other t I be permitted to stand at	m and the Overflow than Court personnel, the back of or along
	4. Decorum shall be mainta 5. No signs or banners is buttons, facemasks, or of disruptive, or potentially imp 6. No electronic devices Except for those electronic in the Courtrooms, with the and watches may be car	ined at all times by all persons prese may be brought into the PJC. No other items with messages; or of properly prejudicial may be brought in may be used in the Courtrooms of the devices used by the Court and the exception of cellular or smart ried and/or worn into the Courtro- cording, and/or photographing of the	company, media or cam ther material that may be to, worn, or displayed in the except by the Court and be counsel, no electronic de phones and watches. Cellioms, but they must be tu	e deemed distracting, PJC. by counsel of record. vices will be allowed ular or smart phones
	7. Cameras will not be per be available on the plaza of 8. The PJC will be open will be unlocked and available before the open arrangements with this members of the media and 9. Persons who fail to opersonnel or the Capitol Pol 10. Media liaisons are: Stacey Witalec, AOPC Direct 717-231-3334 (office) or 71	ctor of Communications 7-877-2997 (mobile); Asst. Director of Communications	to address the media. and other authorized person other authorized person who require earlier acce of Police will begin scre ore the opening of Court.	onnel. The Courtroom nel approximately 30 ss must make prior ening and admitting

Miscellaneous Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 386 MD 2024

Page 10 of 12



		DOCKET ENTRY		
Filed Date	Docket Entry / Filer	Representing	Participant Type	Exit Date
August 19, 2024	Filed - Other			
	Rossi, Paul Anthony	Shanahan, Nicole Ann	Respondent	
	Rossi, Paul Anthony	Kennedy, Robert F., Jr.	Respondent	
Document Name:	Respondents' Pre-Trial Statement			
August 19, 2024	Filed - Other			
	Ford, Timothy James	Reber, Alexander	Petitioner	
	Ford, Timothy James	Smucker, Janneken	Petitioner	
Document Name:	Petitioners' Pre-Trial Statement			
August 21, 2024	Transcript Filed			
	Court Reporter			
Document Name:	Proceedings of August 12, 2024 at	10:00 a.m.		
August 21, 2024	Filed - Other			
	Rossi, Paul Anthony	Shanahan, Nicole Ann	Respondent	
	Rossi, Paul Anthony	Kennedy, Robert F., Jr.	Respondent	
Document Name:	Notice of Recent Decision			
August 21, 2024	Answer Filed			
	Ford, Timothy James	Reber, Alexander	Petitioner	
	Ford, Timothy James	Smucker, Janneken	Petitioner	
Document Name:	Objectors' Answer to Candidate's N	lotice of Recent Decision		
August 23, 2024	Transcript Filed			
	Court Reporter			
Document Name:	Proceedings of 8/20/24 hearing.			
August 23, 2024	Filed - Other			
	Rossi, Paul Anthony	Shanahan, Nicole Ann	Respondent	
	Rossi, Paul Anthony	Kennedy, Robert F., Jr.	Respondent	
Document Name:	Respondents' Notice of Withdraw o	f Opposition to Petition to Set Aside		
August 23, 2024	Amended			
	Rossi, Paul Anthony	Shanahan, Nicole Ann	Respondent	
	Rossi, Paul Anthony	Kennedy, Robert F., Jr.	Respondent	
Document Name:	AMENDED NOTICE to Withdrawal	their Opposition to the Petition to Set	Aside Resp's Nomin	ation Papers

Miscellaneous Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 386 MD 2024

Page 11 of 12

December 22, 2024



		DOCKET ENTRY		
Filed Date	Docket Entry / Filer	Representing	Participant Type	Exit Date
August 23, 2024	Dismissal			08/23/2024
	Dumas, Lori A.			
		andidacy is GRANTED; The Petition		
Comment:	Kennedy, Jr. and Nicole the United States in the Opposition to the Petition Smucker (Petitioners), and not appear on the Commodize filed as a Petition to (1) As this Court finds Code, the Petition to Withd (2) The Petition to Set Asic (3) The Secretary of the as candidates for Preside Election ballot. (4) Each party shall pay the (5) Respondents shall see with this Court. (6) The Prothonotary shall (7) The Prothonotary shall	y of August, 2024, upon consider Shanahan as the We the People ne November 5, 2024 General on to Set Aside Nomination Paper of Which requests dismissal of Remonwealth's 2024 general election Withdraw Candidacy and ORDERS no special circumstances exist, draw Candidacy is GRANTED. de Nomination Papers is DISMISSEI of Commonwealth shall not include ent and Vice President of the University of this Order on Peter a copy of this Order on Peter I promptly send a copy of this Order I mark the docket in this case as closs	Election (Respondents), we pers, filed by Alexander For Respondents' nomination pages as follows: of. Section 978.4 of the DAS MOOT. The Robert F. Kennedy, Jr. Inited States on the Novemental states and shall promptly to the Secretary of the Commental states.	and Vice President of which withdraws thei Reber and Janneken pers so that they do accepts the Amended Pennsylvania Election and Nicole Shanahar aber 5, 2024 General file proof of services
August 28, 2024	Transcript Filed Court Reporter			
Document Name:	•	bany County Courthouse, Albany Ne	ew York.	
August 28, 2024	Exhibit			
	Court Reporter			
Document Name:	Proceedings of 8/6/24 in All	bany County Courthouse, Albany, N	ew York.	

DISPOSITION INFORMATION

Final Disposition: Yes

Related Journal No: Judgment Date:

Category: Disposed Before Decision Disposition Author: Dumas, Lori A.

Disposition: Disposition Date: August 23, 2024

Miscellaneous Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 386 MD 2024

Page 12 of 12

December 22, 2024



DISPOSITION INFORMATION

Disposition Comment:

AND NOW, this 23rd day of August, 2024, upon consideration of the Amended Notice filed by Robert F. Kennedy, Jr. and Nicole Shanahan as the We the People Candidates for President and Vice President of the United States in the November 5, 2024 General Election (Respondents), which withdraws their opposition to the Petition to Set Aside Nomination Papers, filed by Alexander Reber and Janneken Smucker (Petitioners), and which requests dismissal of Respondents' nomination papers so that they do not appear on the Commonwealth's 2024 general election ballot, the Court hereby accepts the Amended Notice filed as a Petition to Withdraw Candidacy and ORDERS as follows:

- (1) As this Court finds no special circumstances exist, cf. Section 978.4 of the Pennsylvania Election Code, the Petition to Withdraw Candidacy is GRANTED.
- (2) The Petition to Set Aside Nomination Papers is DISMISSED AS MOOT.
- (3) The Secretary of the Commonwealth shall not include Robert F. Kennedy, Jr. and Nicole Shanahan as candidates for President and Vice President of the United States on the November 5, 2024 General Election ballot.
- (4) Each party shall pay their own costs.
- (5) Respondents shall serve a copy of this Order on Petitioners and shall promptly file proof of service with this Court.
- (6) The Prothonotary shall promptly send a copy of this Order to the Secretary of the Commonwealth.
- (7) The Prothonotary shall mark the docket in this case as closed.

Dispositional Filing: Filed Date:

Filing Author: