



## CAPTION

Carol Ann Carter, Monica Parrilla, Rebecca Poyourow, William Tung, Roseanne Milazzo, Burt Siegel, Susan Cassanelli, Lee Cassanelli, Lynn Wachman, Michael Guttman, Maya Fonkeu, Brady Hill, Mary Ellen Balchunis, Tom DeWall, Stephanie McNulty and Janet Temin, Petitioners

v.

Veronica Degraffenreid, in her official capacity as the Acting Secretary of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania; Jessica Mathis, in her official capacity as Director for the Pennsylvania Bureau of Election Services and Notaries, Respondents

## CASE INFORMATION

Initiating Document: Application for Extraordinary Relief

Case Status: Closed

Journal Number:

Case Category: Election Case Type(s): Redistricting

## CONSOLIDATED CASES

## RELATED CASES

Docket No / Reason	Type
142 MM 2021 Same Issue(s) Gressman et al., Pet. v. Degraffenreid et al.	Related
5 MAP 2022 Same Record Below Carter, C. et al v. Chapman, L. et al.	Related
6 MAP 2022 Same Record Below Gressman et al. v. Chapman, L. et al.	Related
9 MAP 2022 Same Record Below Carter, C. et al v. Chapman, L. et al.	Related
10 MAP 2022 Same Record Below Gressman et al. v. Chapman, L. et al.	Related
11 MAP 2022 Same Record Below Carter, C. et al v. Chapman, L. et al; Apl: Osche	Related
12 MAP 2022 Same Record Below Gressman et al. v. Chapman, L. et al.; Apl: Osche	Related
7 MM 2022 Same Record Below Carter, C. et al, Pets. v. Chapman, L., et al.	Related

## COUNSEL INFORMATION




---

**COUNSEL INFORMATION**


---

Attorney: Rogers, Edward David  
 Ballard Spahr, LLP  
 Address: Ballard Spahr Llp  
 1735 Market St Fl 51  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103-7599  
 Phone No: (610) 246-4701  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Carol Ann Carter, et al., Petitioner  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Clark, Robert Joseph  
 Ballard Spahr, LLP  
 Address: Ballard Spahr Llp  
 1735 Market St Fl 51  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 864-8659  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Carol Ann Carter, et al., Petitioner  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: McDonald, Michael R.  
 Ballard Spahr LLP  
 Address: 1735 Market St Fl 51  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 864-8425  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Carol Ann Carter, et al., Petitioner  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Ort, Paul Keller  
 Ballard Spahr, LLP  
 Address: Ballard Spahr Llp  
 1735 Market St Fl 51  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 864-8287  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Carol Ann Carter, et al., Petitioner  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---




---

**COUNSEL INFORMATION**


---

Attorney: Pratt, Marcel S.  
 Ballard Spahr, LLP  
 Address: Ballard Spahr Llp  
 1735 Market St 51st Fl  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 864-8506  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Carol Ann Carter, et al., Petitioner  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Hill, John Brent  
 Hangle, Aronchick, Segal, Pudlin & Schiller  
 Address: Hangle Aronchick Segal  
 1 Logan Sq Fl 27  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 496-7049  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Degraffenreid, Veronica, Respondent  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Respondent  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Kotula, Kathleen Marie  
 Pennsylvania Department of State  
 Address: Pa Dept Of State  
 306 N Ofc Bldg 401 North St  
 Harrisburg, PA 17120-0500  
 Phone No: (717) 783-1657  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Bureau of Elections, Respondent  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---




---

**COUNSEL INFORMATION**


---

Attorney: Mavroudis, Dimitrios  
  
 Address: Tucker Law Group  
 1801 Market St Ste 2500  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 982-2280  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Degraffenreid, Veronica, Respondent  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Respondent  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Rickabaugh, Jessica Ann  
 Tucker Law Group, LLC  
 Address: Tucker Law Group  
 1801 Market St Ste 2500  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 875-0609  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Degraffenreid, Veronica, Respondent  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Respondent  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Tucker, Joe H., Jr.  
 Tucker Law Group, LLC  
 Address: Tucker Law Group LLC  
 1801 Market Ste Ste 2500  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 875-0609  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Degraffenreid, Veronica, Respondent  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Respondent  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---




---

**COUNSEL INFORMATION**


---

Attorney: Wiygul, Robert Andrew  
 Hangle, Aronchick, Segal, Pudlin & Schiller  
 Address: Hangle Aronchick Et Al  
 18TH Cherry Sts Fl 27  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 496-7042  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Degraffenreid, Veronica, Respondent  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Respondent  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Duffy, Jeffry William  
 Baker & Hostetler, LLP  
 Address: Baker & Hostetler Llp  
 1735 Market St Ste 3300  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103-7501  
 Phone No: (215) 564-2916  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Benninghoff, Kerry, Possible Intervenor  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Cutler, Bryan, Possible Intervenor  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Holtzman, Anthony Richard  
 Address: K& L Gates Llp  
 17 N 2ND St 18th Fl  
 Harrisburg, PA 17101-1507  
 Phone No: (717) 231-4500  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Corman, Jake, Possible Intervenor  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Ward, Kim, Possible Intervenor  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---




---

**COUNSEL INFORMATION**


---

Attorney: King, Thomas W., III  
 Dillon McCandless King Coulter & Graham LLP  
 Address: Dillon Mccandless Et Al  
 128 W Cunningham St  
 Butler, PA 16001-5742  
 Phone No: (724) 283-2200  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Leslie Oshe, et al., Possible Intervenor  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Woods, Corrie Allen  
 Woods Law Offices PLLC  
 Address: 200 Commerce Dr Ste 210  
 Moon Township, PA 15108  
 Phone No: (412) 329-7751  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Jay Costa, et al., Possible Intervenor  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Attisano, Marco Santino  
 Flannery Georgalis, LLC  
 Address: Flannery Georgalis LLC  
 707 Grant St Ste 2750  
 Pittsburgh, PA 15219  
 Phone No: (412) 438-8209  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Jay Costa, et al., Possible Intervenor  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Breth, Thomas E.  
 Dillon McCandless King Coulter & Graham, LLP  
 Address: Dillon Mccandless King Coulter & Graham Llp  
 128 W Cunningham St  
 Butler, PA 16001-5742  
 Phone No: (724) 283-2200  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Leslie Oshe, et al., Possible Intervenor  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---



#### COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Shuber, Jordan Peter  
 Address: Dillon, McCandless, King, Coulter & Graham, L.L.P.  
 Dillon Mccandless King Coulter & Graham L.I.p.  
 128 W Cunningham St  
 Butler, PA 16001  
 Phone No: (724) 283-2200  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Leslie Oshe, et al., Possible Intervenor  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

#### SUPREME COURT INFORMATION

Appeal From:  
 Appeal Filed Below:  
 Probable Jurisdiction Noted: Docketed Date: December 21, 2021  
 Allocatur/Miscellaneous Granted: Allocatur/Miscellaneous Docket No.:  
 Allocatur/Miscellaneous Grant Order:

#### FEE INFORMATION

Fee Dt	Fee Name	Fee Amt	Receipt Dt	Receipt No	Receipt Amt
12/21/2021	Extraordinary / Plenary Jurisdiction	70.25	12/28/2021	2021-SUP-M-002042	70.25

#### INTERMEDIATE APPELLATE COURT INFORMATION

Court Name: Docket Number:  
 Date of Order: Rearg/Recon Disp Date:  
 Rearg/Recon Disposition:  
 Judge(s):  
 Intermediate Appellate Court Action:  
 Referring Court:

#### AGENCY/TRIAL COURT INFORMATION

Court Below: Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania  
 County: Division: Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania  
 Date of Agency/Trial Court Order:  
 Docket Number: 464 MD 2021  
 Judge(s): OTN:  
 Order Type:

#### ORIGINAL RECORD CONTENT

Original Record Item	Filed Date	Content/Description
----------------------	------------	---------------------

#### Record Remittal:



## DISPOSITION INFORMATION

Related Journal No:		Judgment Date:	
Category:	Decided	Disposition Author:	Per Curiam
Disposition:	Order Denying Application for Extraordinary Relief	Disposition Date:	January 10, 2022
Dispositional Filing:	<b>Dissenting Statement</b>	Author:	Wecht, David N.
Filed Date:	January 10, 2022		

## DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
<b>December 21, 2021</b>	<b>"Application for Extraordinary Relief under 42 Pa.C.S. § 726 and Pa.R.A.P. 3309"</b>	Petitioner	Carol Ann Carter, et al.
<b>December 27, 2021</b>	<b>Answer to Application for Extraordinary Relief</b>	Respondent Respondent	Degraffenreid, Veronica Mathis, Jessica
<b>December 27, 2021</b>	<b>Application for Intervention</b>	Possible Intervenor Possible Intervenor Possible Intervenor Possible Intervenor	Cutler, Bryan Benninghoff, Kerry Corman, Jake Ward, Kim
<b>December 29, 2021</b>	<b>Answer to Application for Intervention</b>	Respondent Respondent	Degraffenreid, Veronica Mathis, Jessica
<b>December 29, 2021</b>	<b>Answer to Application for Intervention</b>	Petitioner	Carol Ann Carter, et al.
<b>December 30, 2021</b>	<b>Praecipe for Appearance</b>	Possible Intervenor Possible Intervenor	Cutler, Bryan Benninghoff, Kerry
<b>December 30, 2021</b>	<b>Application for Leave to File Response to Application for Extraordinary Relief</b>	Possible Intervenor	Leslie Oshe, et al.

## Comments:

Filed on behalf of:

Leslie Osche, Kim Greyer, Michael T. Slupe, Candee Barnes, Thomas Reep, Brandy Reep, Kenneth Lunsford, Tammy Lunsford, James Thompson, Pamela Thompson, Joseph Renwick, Stephanie Renwick, Louis Capozzi, David Ball, Mary E. Owlett, Kristine Eng, Justin Behrens, James P. Foreman, Matthew J. Stuckey, Anthony J. Luther, Linda C. Daniels, Jeffrey Piccola, James Vasilko, Jay Hagerman, Evan P. Smith (collectively referred to as the "Citizen-Voter Intervenor")





## DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
<b>December 31, 2021</b>	<b>Application for Intervention</b>	Possible Intervenor	Jay Costa, et al.
Comments: Filed on Behalf of: Senator Jay Costa, Senator Judy Schwank, Senator Lisa Boscola, Senator James Brewster, Senator Amanda Cappelletti, Senator Carolyn Comitta, Senator Marty Flynn, Senator Art Haywood, Senator John Kane, Senator Tim Kearney, Senator Steve Santarsiero, Senator Nikil Saval, Senator Christine Tartaglione, Senator Lindsey Williams			
<b>January 5, 2022</b>	<b>Notice of Disclosure</b>		Brobson, P. Kevin
<b>January 7, 2022</b>	<b>Praeipice for Appearance</b>		
	Mathis, Jessica	Respondent	Tucker, Joe H., Jr.
	Degraffenreid, Veronica	Respondent	Tucker, Joe H., Jr.
<b>January 7, 2022</b>	<b>Application to be Admitted Pro Hac Vice (Matthew Gordon, Esquire)</b>		
	Carol Ann Carter, et al.	Petitioner	McDonald, Michael R.
<b>January 7, 2022</b>	<b>Praeipice for Appearance</b>		
	Mathis, Jessica	Respondent	Mavroudis, Dimitrios
	Degraffenreid, Veronica	Respondent	Mavroudis, Dimitrios
<b>January 7, 2022</b>	<b>Praeipice for Appearance</b>		
	Mathis, Jessica	Respondent	Rickabaugh, Jessica Ann
	Degraffenreid, Veronica	Respondent	Rickabaugh, Jessica Ann
<b>January 10, 2022</b>	<b>Order Denying Application for Extraordinary Relief</b>		Per Curiam
Comments: AND NOW, this 10th day of January, 2022, the Application for Extraordinary Relief is DENIED, WITHOUT PREJUDICE to Petitioners to reapply for similar relief in this Court, as future developments may dictate. Additionally, the denial is without prejudice to Petitioners to file an application in the Commonwealth Court, requesting that court to accelerate the timetable set forth in its December 20, 2021 scheduling order. The Application for Leave to File Proposed Intervenor-Petitioners' Response and the Application to Intervene of Senator Jay Costa, et al., are DISMISSED AS MOOT. Justice Wecht files a dissenting statement. Justice Donohue notes her dissent.			
<b>January 10, 2022</b>	<b>Order Exited</b>		Office of the Prothonotary
<b>February 9, 2022</b>	<b>Reconsideration Time Expired/Case Closed</b>		Office of the Prothonotary

## CROSS COURT ACTIONS

Docket Number: 464 MD 2021  
Docket Number: 5 MAP 2022