



## CAPTION

Carol Ann Carter, Monica Parrilla, Rebecca Poyourow, William Tung, Roseanne Milazzo, Burt Siegel, Susan Cassanelli, Lee Cassanelli, Lynn Wachman, Michael Guttman, Maya Fonkeu, Brady Hill, Mary Ellen Balchunis, Tom DeWall, Stephanie McNulty and Janet Temin

v.

Leigh M. Chapman, in her official capacity as the Acting Secretary of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania; Jessica Mathis, in her official capacity as Director for the Pennsylvania Bureau of Election Services and Notaries

Appeal of: Khalif Ali, Maryn Formley, Richard Rafferty, Patrick Beaty, Susan Gobreski, Barbara Hill, Judy Hines, Jodi Greene, John Thompson, Cynthia Alvarado, and Timothy L. Kauffman, Possible Intervenors

## CASE INFORMATION

Initiating Document: Notice of Appeal

Case Status: Closed

Journal Number:

Case Category: Election Case Type(s): Redistricting

## CONSOLIDATED CASES

## RELATED CASES

Docket No / Reason	Type	Docket No / Reason	Type
6 MAP 2022 Sua Sponte	Consolidated	141 MM 2021 Same Record Below Carter, C. et al, Pets v. Degraffenreid, V. et al.	Related
		142 MM 2021 Same Record Below Gressman et al., Pet. v. Degraffenreid et al.	Related
		6 MAP 2022 Same Record Below Gressman et al. v. Chapman, L. et al.	Related
		9 MAP 2022 Same Record Below Carter, C. et al v. Chapman, L. et al.	Related
		10 MAP 2022 Same Record Below Gressman et al. v. Chapman, L. et al.	Related
		11 MAP 2022 Same Record Below Carter, C. et al v. Chapman, L. et al; Apl: Osche	Related
		12 MAP 2022 Same Record Below Gressman et al. v. Chapman, L. et al.; Apl: Osche	Related
		7 MM 2022 Same Record Below Carter, C. et al, Pets. v. Chapman, L., et al.	Related

## COUNSEL INFORMATION



## COUNSEL INFORMATION

---

Attorney: Geffen, Benjamin David  
Public Interest Law Center (The)  
Address: 1500 JFK Blvd Ste 802  
Philadelphia, PA 19102  
Phone No: (267) 546-1308  
Receive Mail: Yes  
Representing: Khalif Ali, et al, Appellant  
Pro Se: No  
IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Black, Martin Jay  
Dechert LLP  
Address: 2929 Arch St  
Philadelphia, PA 19104-2808  
Phone No: (215) 994-2664  
Receive Mail: Yes  
Representing: Khalif Ali, et al, Appellant  
Pro Se: No  
IFP Status:

---

Attorney: McKenzie, Mary M.  
Public Interest Law Center (The)  
Address: Public Interest Law Center Two Penn Center  
1500 Jfk Blvd Ste 802  
Philadelphia, PA 19102  
Phone No: (267) 546-1319  
Receive Mail: Yes  
Representing: Khalif Ali, et al, Appellant  
Pro Se: No  
IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Rocco, Andrew Michael  
Dechert LLP  
Address: 2929 Arch St Cira Ctr  
Philadelphia, PA 19104  
Phone No: (856) 693-0378  
Receive Mail: Yes  
Representing: Khalif Ali, et al, Appellant  
Pro Se: No  
IFP Status:

---



## COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Duffy, Jeffrey William  
 Baker & Hostetler, LLP  
 Address: 1735 Market St Ste 3300  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103-7501  
 Phone No: (215) 564-2916  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Benninghoff, Kerry, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Cutler, Bryan, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Greenberg, Kevin Michael  
 Greenberg Traurig, LLP  
 Address: 1717 Arch St Ste 400  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 988-7800  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Maria Collett, et al, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Hill, John Brent  
 Hangle, Aronchick, Segal, Pudlin & Schiller  
 Address: 1 Logan Sq Fl 27  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 496-7049  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Chapman, Leigh M., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Holtzman, Anthony Richard  
 K & L Gates LLP  
 Address: 17 N 2ND St 18th Fl  
 Harrisburg, PA 17101-1507  
 Phone No: (717) 231-4500  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Corman, Jake, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Ward, Kim, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:




---

**COUNSEL INFORMATION**


---

Attorney: Kotula, Kathleen Marie  
 Address: Pennsylvania Department of State  
 Bureau of Commissions, Elections  
 306 N Office Bldg 401 North St  
 Harrisburg, PA 17120-0500  
 Phone No: (717) 783-1657  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Bureau of Elections, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Rogers, Edward David  
 Address: Ballard Spahr, LLP  
 1735 Market St Fl 51  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103-7599  
 Phone No: (610) 246-4701  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Carol Ann Carter, et al., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Salkowski, Matthew S.  
 Address: Pennsylvania House of Representatives  
 House Democratic Caucus Ogc  
 620 Main Capitol Building  
 Harrisburg, PA 17111  
 Phone No: (717) 787-3002  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: McClinton, Joanna, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Voss, Joshua John  
 Address: Kleinbard LLC  
 1717 Arch St Fl 5th  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (267) 443-4114  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Guy Reschenthaler, Jeffrey Varner, Tom Marino, Ryan Costello, Bud Shuster (Congressional  
 Intervenor), Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---




---

**COUNSEL INFORMATION**


---

Attorney: Wiygul, Robert Andrew  
 Hangle, Aronchick, Segal, Pudlin & Schiller  
 Address: 18TH Cherry Sts Fl 27  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 496-7042  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Chapman, Leigh M., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Wolf, Tom, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Woods, Corrie Allen  
 Woods Law Offices PLLC  
 Address: 200 Commerce Dr Ste 210  
 Moon Township, PA 15108  
 Phone No: (412) 329-7751  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Jay Costa, et al., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Attisano, Marco Santino  
 Flannery Georgalis, LLC  
 Address: 707 Grant St Ste 2750  
 Pittsburgh, PA 15219  
 Phone No: (412) 438-8209  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Jay Costa, et al., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Clark, Robert Joseph  
 Ballard Spahr, LLP  
 Address: 1735 Market St Fl 51  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 864-8659  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Carol Ann Carter, et al., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---




---

**COUNSEL INFORMATION**


---

Attorney: Enerson, Caleb Curtis  
 Pennsylvania Office of Attorney General, 16th Floor , Strawberry Square, Harrisburg, PA  
 Address: Pa Office Of Attorney General  
 Strawberry Sq Fl 15  
 Harrisburg, PA 17120  
 Phone No: (717) 705-5774  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Chapman, Leigh M., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Haverstick, Matthew Hermann  
 Address: Kleinbard LLC  
 Three Logan Square  
 1717 Arch St Fl 5  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 568-2000  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Guy Reschenthaler, Jeffrey Varner, Tom Marino, Ryan Costello, Bud Shuster (Congressional  
 Intervenor), Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Levine, Clifford B.  
 Dentons Cohen Grigsby  
 Address: 625 Liberty Ave; 5th floor  
 Pittsburgh, PA 15222  
 Phone No: (412) 297-4998  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Maria Collett, et al, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Mann, James Guthrie  
 Pennsylvania House of Representatives  
 Address: Ste B 6 Main Capitol  
 Po Box 202228  
 Harrisburg, PA 17120-2228  
 Phone No: (717) 783-1510  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Benninghoff, Kerry, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Cutler, Bryan, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---




---

**COUNSEL INFORMATION**


---

Attorney: Mavroudis, Dimitrios  
  
 Address: Tucker Law Group  
 1801 Market St Ste 2500  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 982-2280  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Chapman, Leigh M., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Wolf, Tom, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: McDonald, Michael R.  
 Ballard Spahr LLP  
 Address: 1735 Market St Fl 51  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 864-8425  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Carol Ann Carter, et al., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Ort, Paul Keller  
 Ballard Spahr, LLP  
 Address: 1735 Market St Fl 51  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 864-8287  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Carol Ann Carter, et al., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Pratt, Anthony Michael  
 Greenberg Traurig, LLP  
 Address: 1717 Arch St Ste 400  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103-2799  
 Phone No: (215) 972-5916  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Maria Collett, et al, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---




---

**COUNSEL INFORMATION**


---

Attorney: Pratt, Marcel S.  
 Ballard Spahr LLP  
 Address: 1735 Market St 51st Fl  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 864-8506  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Carol Ann Carter, et al., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Rice, Caroline Layne  
 Hangley, Aronchick, Segal, Pudlin & Schiller  
 Address: Hangley Aronchick Segal  
 1 Logan Sq Fl 27  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 496-7032  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Chapman, Leigh M., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Wolf, Tom, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Rickabaugh, Jessica Ann  
 Tucker Law Group, LLC  
 Address: 1801 Market St Ste 2500  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 875-0609  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Chapman, Leigh M., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Wolf, Tom, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---






---

**COUNSEL INFORMATION**


---

Attorney: Senoff, David Samuel  
 Address: First Law Strategy Group LLC  
 121 S Broad St Ste 300  
 Philadelphia, PA 19107  
 Phone No: (215) 258-4700  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: McClinton, Joanna, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Shoucair, Emma Frances Elizabeth  
 Dentons Cohen & Grigsby PC  
 Address: 625 Liberty Ave  
 Pittsburgh, PA 15222  
 Phone No: (412) 417-1889  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Maria Collett, et al, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Truong, Lam Dang  
 Pennsylvania House of Representatives  
 Address: Office of Chief Counsel  
 620 Main Capital Bldg  
 Harrisburg, PA 17120  
 Phone No: (717) 787-3002  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: McClinton, Joanna, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Tucker, Joe H., Jr.  
 Tucker Law Group, LLC  
 Address: 1801 Market Ste Ste 2500  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 875-0609  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Chapman, Leigh M., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Wolf, Tom, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---



#### COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Vaitl, Jonathan Richard  
 K & L Gates LLP  
 Address: 17 N Second St Fl 18  
 Harrisburg, PA 17101-1507  
 Phone No: (717) 231-5830  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Corman, Jake, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Ward, Kim, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Vance, Shohin Hadizadeh  
 Address: Kleinbard LLC  
 Three Logan Square  
 1717 Arch St 5th Fl  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 568-2000  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Guy Reschenthaler, Jeffrey Varner, Tom Marino, Ryan Costello, Bud Shuster (Congressional  
 Intervenor), Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Zimmer, Samantha G.  
 Address: Kleinbard LLC  
 Three Logan Square  
 1717 Arch St 5th Fl  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 568-2000  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Guy Reschenthaler, Jeffrey Varner, Tom Marino, Ryan Costello, Bud Shuster (Congressional  
 Intervenor), Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

#### SUPREME COURT INFORMATION

Appeal From: the Order of the Commonwealth Court at No. 464 MD 2021 dated January  
 14, 2022 denying intervenor status.  
 Appeal Filed Below: 1/20/2022 12:00:00AM

Probable Jurisdiction Noted: January 23, 2022      Docketed Date: January 21, 2022  
 Allocatur/Miscellaneous Granted:      Allocatur/Miscellaneous Docket No.:  
 Allocatur/Miscellaneous Grant Order:

#### FEE INFORMATION

Fee Dt	Fee Name	Fee Amt	Receipt Dt	Receipt No	Receipt Amt
01/21/2022	Notice of Appeal	90.25	01/26/2022	2022-SUP-M-000241	90.25


**INTERMEDIATE APPELLATE COURT INFORMATION**

Court Name: Docket Number:  
 Date of Order: Rearg/Recon Disp Date:  
 Rearg/Recon Disposition:  
 Judge(s):  
 Intermediate Appellate Court Action:  
 Referring Court:

**AGENCY/TRIAL COURT INFORMATION**

Court Below: Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania  
 County: Division: Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania  
 Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: January 14, 2022  
 Docket Number: 464 MD 2021  
 Judge(s): McCullough, Patricia A. OTN:  
 Order Type: Order

**ORIGINAL RECORD CONTENT**

Original Record Item	Filed Date	Content/Description
Part(s)	January 24, 2022	3
Transcript(s)	January 24, 2022	1-6-2022 Hearing
O.R. moved to No. 7 MM 2022	February 02, 2022	

**Record Remittal: February 11, 2022**

**BRIEFING SCHEDULE**

Appellant	Appellee
<b>Khalif Ali, et al</b>	<b>Benninghoff, Kerry</b>
<b>Brief</b>	<b>Letter in Lieu of Brief</b>
Due: January 24, 2022	Due: January 25, 2022
Filed: January 24, 2022	Filed: January 25, 2022
<b>Reproduced Record</b>	<b>Bureau of Elections</b>
Due: January 24, 2022	<b>Brief</b>
Filed: January 24, 2022	Due: January 25, 2022
	Filed:
	<b>Carol Ann Carter, et al.</b>
	<b>Letter in Lieu of Brief</b>
	Due: January 25, 2022
	Filed: January 25, 2022
	<b>Chapman, Leigh M.</b>
	<b>Brief</b>
	Due: January 25, 2022
	Filed:
	<b>Corman, Jake</b>
	<b>Brief</b>
	Due: January 25, 2022
	Filed:
	<b>Cutler, Bryan</b>



## BRIEFING SCHEDULE

**Appellee****Cutler, Bryan****Letter in Lieu of Brief**

Due: January 25, 2022

Filed: January 25, 2022

**Guy Reschenthaler, Jeffrey Varner, Tom Marino,  
Ryan Costello, Bud Shuster (Congressional  
Intervenor)****Brief**

Due: January 25, 2022

Filed: January 25, 2022

**Jay Costa, et al.****Brief**

Due: January 25, 2022

Filed:

**Maria Collett, et al****Letter in Lieu of Brief**

Due: January 25, 2022

Filed: January 25, 2022

**Mathis, Jessica****Brief**

Due: January 25, 2022

Filed:

**McClinton, Joanna****Brief**

Due: January 25, 2022

Filed:

**Ward, Kim****Brief**

Due: January 25, 2022

Filed:

**Wolf, Tom****Brief**

Due: January 25, 2022

Filed:

## DISPOSITION INFORMATION

Related Journal No:		Judgment Date:	January 26, 2022
Category:	Decided	Disposition Author:	Per Curiam
Disposition:	Affirmed	Disposition Date:	January 26, 2022
Dispositional Filing:	<b>Order</b>	Author:	Per Curiam
Filed Date:	January 26, 2022		

## DOCKET ENTRY

## Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



## Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 5 MAP 2022

Page 13 of 14

March 28, 2025

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
January 20, 2022	Notice of Appeal	Appellant	Khalif Ali, et al
January 20, 2022	Jurisdictional Statement	Appellant	Khalif Ali, et al
January 21, 2022	No Answer Letter to Notice of Appeal & Jurisdictional Statement	Appellee	Maria Collett, et al
January 21, 2022	Answer to Notice of Appeal & Jurisdictional Statement	Appellee	Guy Reschenthaler, Jeffrey Varner, Tom Marino, Ryan Costello, Bud Shuster (Congressional Intervenor)
January 21, 2022	No Answer Letter to Notice of Appeal & Jurisdictional Statement	Appellee Appellee	Corman, Jake Ward, Kim
January 21, 2022	No Answer Letter to Notice of Appeal & Jurisdictional Statement	Appellee	Carol Ann Carter, et al.
January 21, 2022	No Answer Letter to Notice of Appeal & Jurisdictional Statement	Appellee Appellee Appellee	Mathis, Jessica Wolf, Tom Chapman, Leigh M.
January 23, 2022	Probable Jurisdiction Noted and Briefing Schedule Issued		Per Curiam
Comments: AND NOW, this 23rd day of January, 2022, probable jurisdiction is NOTED. Appellants' Brief and Reproduced Record shall be filed on or before 12:00 noon, Monday, January 24, 2022. Any responsive Briefs shall be filed on or before 12:00 noon, Tuesday, January 25, 2022. Reply Briefs will not be permitted. Extensions of time will not be entertained.			
January 23, 2022	Order Exited		Office of the Prothonotary
January 24, 2022	Appellant's Brief	Appellant	Khalif Ali, et al
January 24, 2022	Appellant's Reproduced Record Filed	Appellant	Khalif Ali, et al
January 24, 2022	Notice of Disclosure		Todd, Debra
January 24, 2022	Commonwealth Court Record Received		Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania
January 25, 2022	Letter in Lieu of Brief - Appellee	Appellee Appellee	Benninghoff, Kerry Cutler, Bryan



## DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
January 25, 2022	Letter in Lieu of Brief - Appellee	Appellee	Carol Ann Carter, et al.
January 25, 2022	Appellee's Brief	Appellee	Guy Reschenthaler, Jeffrey Varner, Tom Marino, Ryan Costello, Bud Shuster (Congressional Intervenor)
January 25, 2022	Letter in Lieu of Brief - Appellee	Appellee	Maria Collett, et al
January 25, 2022	Untimely combined No Answer Letter to Jurisdictional Statement and Letter in Lieu of Brief received	Appellee	McClinton, Joanna
January 26, 2022	Affirmed		Per Curiam
Comments: AND NOW, this 26th day of January, 2022, the order of the Commonwealth Court is AFFIRMED.			
January 26, 2022	Judgment Entered		Office of the Prothonotary
February 11, 2022	Remitted		Office of the Prothonotary

## CROSS COURT ACTIONS

Docket Number: 141 MM 2021  
Docket Number: 464 MD 2021