

Commonwealth Docket Sheet

Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

Docket Number: 1512 CD 2023

Page 1 of 8

January 30, 2026



CAPTION

PA Fair Elections and
Heather Honey,
Petitioners

v.

Pennsylvania Department of State
(Office of General Counsel),
Respondent

CASE INFORMATION

Initiating Document: Petition for Review

Case Status: Closed

Case Processing Status: May 2, 2025 Completed

Journal Number: 64-02-2025

Case Category: Administrative Agency Case Type(s): Election
Office of General Counsel - HAVA

CONSOLIDATED CASES

RELATED CASES

Docket No / Reason	Type
372 CD 2024 Similar Issue(s)	Related

COUNSEL INFORMATION

Petitioner PA Fair Elections

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: DiSalvo, Karen T.
Law Firm: Mohrman, Kaardal & Erickson, PA
Address: Election Research Institute
1451 Quentin Rd Ste 232
Lebanon, PA 17042
Phone No: (717) 281-1776 Fax No:

Attorney: Nielsen, Elizabeth Anne
Law Firm: Mohrman, Kaardal & Erickson, P.A.
Address: 150 S 5TH St Ste 3100
Ste 3100
Minneapolis, MN 55402
Phone No: (612) 465-0905 Fax No:

Attorney: Kaardal, Erick
Law Firm: Mohrman, Kaardal & Erickson, P.A.
Address: 150 South Fifth Street, Suite 3100
Minneapolis, MN 55402
Phone No: (612) 341-1074 Fax No:

Commonwealth Docket Sheet**Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania****Docket Number: 1512 CD 2023****Page 2 of 8****January 30, 2026****COUNSEL INFORMATION****Petitioner Honey, Heather**

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: DiSalvo, Karen T.
 Law Firm: Mohrman, Kaardal & Erickson, PA
 Address: Election Research Institute
 1451 Quentin Rd Ste 232
 Lebanon, PA 17042

Phone No: (717) 281-1776 Fax No:

Attorney: Kaardal, Erick
 Law Firm: Mohrman, Kaardal & Erickson, P.A.
 Address: 150 South Fifth Street, Suite 3100
 Minneapolis, MN 55402

Phone No: (612) 341-1074 Fax No:

Respondent Pennsylvania Department of State

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Mullen, Kathleen Ann
 Law Firm: Pennsylvania Governor's Office of General Counsel
 Address: Dept of State
 306 N Office Building
 Harrisburg, PA 17120-0102

Phone No: (717) 743-7563 Fax No:

Attorney: Kotula, Kathleen Marie
 Law Firm: Pennsylvania Department of State
 Address: Pa Dept Of State
 401 North St Rm 306
 Harrisburg, PA 17120

Phone No: (717) 783-1657 Fax No:

Attorney: Everhart, Ian Blythe
 Law Firm: Pennsylvania Department of State, Bureau of Elections
 Address: 11 Stanwix St Ste 340
 Pittsburgh, PA 15222

Phone No: (717) 996-8723 Fax No:

Attorney: Fischer, Michael John
 Law Firm: Pennsylvania Office of General Counsel
 Address: Pa Office Of General Counsel
 30 N Third St Ste 200
 Harrisburg, PA 17101

Phone No: (717) 831-2847 Fax No:

FEE INFORMATION

Fee Dt	Fee Name	Fee Amt	Receipt Dt	Receipt No	Receipt Amt
12/21/2023	Petition for Review - Appellate	90.25	12/22/2023	2023-CMW-H-002092	90.25

Commonwealth Docket Sheet

Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

Docket Number: 1512 CD 2023

Page 3 of 8

January 30, 2026



AGENCY/TRIAL COURT INFORMATION

OrderAppealed From: November 21, 2023 Notice of Appeal Filed:
 Order Type: Decision
 Documents Received: December 21, 2023

Court Below: HAVA (Office of General Council)
 County:
 Judge:
 Docket Number: 2023-001 Division: HAVA (Office of General Council)
 OTN:
 Judicial District:

ORIGINAL RECORD CONTENT

Original Record Item	Filed Date	Content Description
Agency Record	April 17, 2024	

Date of Remand of Record: July 2, 2025

BRIEFING SCHEDULE

Petitioner	Respondent
Honey, Heather Brief Due: May 29, 2024	Pennsylvania Department of State Brief Due: July 8, 2024
	Filed: June 28, 2024

Reply Brief
Due: Filed: July 12, 2024

PA Fair Elections
Reply Brief
Due: Filed: July 12, 2024

Reproduced Record
Due: Filed: May 29, 2024

DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Filer	Representing	Participant Type	Exit Date
December 21, 2023	Petition for Review Filed Honey, Heather PA Fair Elections		Petitioner Petitioner	
December 21, 2023	Filed - Other Honey, Heather		Petitioner	
	Document Name: Stmt. regarding transcript			
December 28, 2023	Defect Correction Notice Commonwealth Court Filing Office			12/28/2023
	Document Name: DEFECT: Permission for email or fax service			
January 2, 2024	No Response to Defect Correction Notice Commonwealth Court Filing Office			
	Document Name: Service sufficient to move forward			

Commonwealth Docket Sheet

Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

Docket Number: 1512 CD 2023

Page 4 of 8

January 30, 2026



DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Filer	Representing	Participant Type	Exit Date
January 2, 2024	Notice Exited Commonwealth Court Filing Office			
January 16, 2024	Entry of Appearance Mullen, Kathleen Ann Document Name: Atty. Mullen for Department of State	Pennsylvania Department of State	Respondent	
January 16, 2024	Entry of Appearance Fogal, Matthew Drew Document Name: Atty. Fogel for Department of State	Pennsylvania Department of State	Respondent	
February 8, 2024	Praecipe for Withdrawal of Appearance Fogal, Matthew Drew Document Name: Atty. Fogal for Department of State	Pennsylvania Department of State	Respondent	
February 27, 2024	Application for Relief Mullen, Kathleen Ann Document Name: Application to Exclude Artificial Entity Pa Fair Elections as Pro Se Participant	Pennsylvania Department of State	Respondent	
March 25, 2024	Entry of Appearance DiSalvo, Karen T. Document Name: Atty. DiSalvo for Pa Fair Elections	PA Fair Elections	Petitioner	
April 5, 2024	Notice Exited Commonwealth Court Filing Office Document Name: CORRECTED			
April 14, 2024	Docketing Statement Filed DiSalvo, Karen T.	PA Fair Elections	Petitioner	
April 15, 2024	Entry of Appearance Everhart, Ian Blythe Document Name: Atty. Everhart for Respondents	Pennsylvania Department of State	Respondent	
April 17, 2024	Agency Record Received HAVA (Office of General Council)			
April 19, 2024	Briefing Schedule Issued Commonwealth Court Filing Office			
May 3, 2024	Application to be Admitted Pro Hac Vice Filed DiSalvo, Karen T. Document Name: for Attorney Erick Kaardal	PA Fair Elections	Petitioner	
May 20, 2024	Designation of Contents of Reproduced Record DiSalvo, Karen T.	PA Fair Elections	Petitioner	

Commonwealth Docket Sheet

Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

Docket Number: 1512 CD 2023

Page 5 of 8

January 30, 2026



DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Filer	Representing	Participant Type	Exit Date
May 22, 2024	Order Granting Application to be Admitted Pro Hac Vice Per Curiam Document Name: Erick Kaardal, Esq. for Petitioner			05/22/2024
	Comment: NOW, May 22, 2023, upon consideration of Karen DiSalvo, Esq.'s Motion for Admission Pro Hac Vice of Erick Kaardal, Esq. on behalf of Petitioner PA Fair Elections, it is hereby ordered: (1) Erick Kaardal, Esq. is admitted pro hac vice to the bar of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania under Pennsylvania Bar Admission Rule 301, as co-counsel on behalf of this Petitioner in this matter; (2) Erick Kaardal, Esq. shall abide by the rules of this Court including all disciplinary rules; (3) Erick Kaardal, Esq. shall immediately notify this Court of any matter affecting his standing at the bar of any other court where he may be admitted to practice; and, (4) Karen DiSalvo, Esq., the moving attorney herein, shall continue to be responsible as counsel of record for the conduct of this matter on behalf of this Petitioner.			
May 22, 2024	Designation of Contents of Reproduced Record Mullen, Kathleen Ann	Pennsylvania Department of State	Respondent	
May 29, 2024	Petitioner's Reproduced Record Filed DiSalvo, Karen T.	PA Fair Elections	Petitioner	
May 29, 2024	Petitioner's Brief Filed Honey, Heather		Petitioner	
June 3, 2024	Order Filed Per Curiam Document Name: Application to exclude PA Fair Elections as Pro Se participant is denied			06/03/2024
	Comment: NOW, June 3, 2024, upon review of the Pennsylvania Department of State's (Respondent) "Application to Exclude Artificial Entity PA Fair Elections as Pro Se Participant" (Application), to which no answer has been filed, the Application is DENIED. The Application seeks an order directing PA Fair Elections, "an association of Pennsylvania citizens concerned with the fairness and integrity of elections in Pennsylvania, including issues of election system vulnerabilities," Certified Record, Item No. 1 ¶1, to obtain counsel. On May 22, 2024, the Court granted Attorney Karen DiSalvo's2 "Motion for Admission Pro Hac Vice" of Erick Kaadal, Esq. as counsel on behalf of PA Fair Elections. Thus, the Court's docket reflects that Attorneys DiSalvo and Kaadal appear on behalf of PA Fair Elections.			
June 28, 2024	Respondent's Brief Filed Pennsylvania Department of State		Respondent	
July 12, 2024	Petitioner's Reply Brief Filed Honey, Heather PA Fair Elections		Petitioner Petitioner	
August 26, 2024	Tentative Session Date Krimmel, Michael Document Name: November, 2024 (Philadelphia)			
September 23, 2024	Tentative Session Date Krimmel, Michael Document Name: November 2024 (Harrisburg)			

Commonwealth Docket Sheet

Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

Docket Number: 1512 CD 2023

Page 6 of 8

January 30, 2026



DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Filer	Representing	Participant Type	Exit Date
September 25, 2024	Application for Relief Mullen, Kathleen Ann	Pennsylvania Department of State	Respondent	
	Document Name: (Request for Submission on Briefs or Continuance of Oral Argument)			
September 27, 2024	Order Filed Per Curiam			09/27/2024
	Document Name: Answers to Request to Submit Case on the Briefs is due by Oct. 2, 2024			
	Comment: NOW, September 27, 2024, upon review of Respondent Pennsylvania Department of State's "Application for Relief" (Application), seeking submission of the above Petition for Review on the briefs previously filed or a continuance of the tentative argument scheduled for the Court's November 2024 Argument Session, Petitioners PA Fair Elections and Heather Honey may file and serve an answer to the Application no later than Wednesday, October 2, 2024, 12:00 p.m.			
October 7, 2024	Order Granting Application for Relief Per Curiam			10/07/2024
	Document Name: The Prothonotary is directed to list this matter for En Banc Argument on the next available list			
	Comment: NOW, October 7, 2024, upon consideration of Respondent's Application for Relief (Application), seeking to either submit this matter on the briefs previously filed or, alternatively, to continue oral argument on this matter,1 to which Petitioners do not consent,2 the Application is GRANTED to the extent it seeks a continuance. The Prothonotary is directed to list this matter for oral argument before the Court en banc on the next available list.			
	1 At the time the Application was filed, this matter was tentatively scheduled for oral argument in November. 2 Consistent with Rule 3707 of the Pennsylvania Rules of Appellate Procedure, Pa.R.A.P. 3707, Respondent contacted Petitioners to inquire whether they consent to the relief sought and Petitioners indicated they did not. (Application ¶ 6.) The Court issued an order requesting that any answer to the Application be filed by October 2, 2024, but no response was filed.			
October 7, 2024	Tentative Session Date Krimmel, Michael			
	Document Name: December 2024 (Harrisburg)			
October 18, 2024	Order Filed Per Curiam			10/18/2024
	Document Name: Prothonotary shall list the matter for oral argument during the Court's February 2025 Argument			
	Comment: Upon review of the above matter, the Prothonotary shall list the matter for oral argument during the Court's February 2025 Argument Session, seriatim with the matter of PA Fair Elections v. Pennsylvania Department of State (Pa. Cmwlth., No. 372 C.D. 2024).			
November 18, 2024	Tentative Session Date Krimmel, Michael			
	Document Name: February 2025 (Pittsburgh)			
January 7, 2025	Argument Scheduled Krimmel, Michael			
	Document Name: Wednesday, February 5, 2025, 9:30 am (En Banc), Supreme Court Courtroom, 8th Fl., City-County Bldg.			
	Comment: Pittsburgh, PA No. 64 on the list.			

Commonwealth Docket Sheet

Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

Docket Number: 1512 CD 2023

Page 7 of 8

January 30, 2026



DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Filer	Representing	Participant Type	Exit Date
January 13, 2025	Entry of Appearance Nielsen, Elizabeth Anne	PA Fair Elections	Petitioner	
	Document Name: Atty. Nielsen for PA Fair Elections			
January 31, 2025	Entry of Appearance Fischer, Michael John	Pennsylvania Department of State	Respondent	
	Document Name: Attorney Michael J. Fischer for Respondent			
February 4, 2025	Application for Relief DiSalvo, Karen T. DiSalvo, Karen T.	Honey, Heather PA Fair Elections	Petitioner Petitioner	
	Document Name: Attorney's Request to be Excused from Oral Argument			
February 4, 2025	Order Granting Application for Relief Per Curiam			02/04/2025
	Document Name: Atty. DiSalvo's request to be excused from attending Oral Argument is Granted			
	Comment: NOW, February 4, 2025, upon consideration of the correspondence received from Attorney Karen DiSalvo (Application), requesting to be excused from attending Oral Argument as the sponsoring attorney for Erick Kaardal, the Application is GRANTED.			
May 2, 2025	Affirmed Covey, Anne E.			05/02/2025
	Document Name: Opinion: Final Determination of PA Department of State, Office of General Counsel is affirmed.			
	Comment: AND NOW, this 2nd day of May, 2025, the Pennsylvania Department of State, Office of General Counsel's November 21, 2023 Final Determination is affirmed.			
July 2, 2025	Remitted Commonwealth Court Filing Office			

SESSION INFORMATION

Journal Number: 64-02-2025
 Consideration Type: En Banc Argument
 Listed/Submitted Date: February 5, 2025

Panel Composition:

The Honorable Renee Cohn Jubelirer	President Judge
The Honorable Patricia McCullough	Judge
The Honorable Anne E. Covey	Judge
The Honorable Michael H. Wojcik	Judge
The Honorable Lori A. Dumas	Judge
The Honorable Stacy Wallace	Judge
The Honorable Matthew S. Wolf	Judge

DISPOSITION INFORMATION

Final Disposition:	Yes	Judgment Date:	
Related Journal No:		Disposition Author:	Covey, Anne E.
Category:	Decided	Disposition Date:	May 2, 2025
Disposition:	Affirmed		

Commonwealth Docket Sheet

Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

Docket Number: 1512 CD 2023

Page 8 of 8

January 30, 2026



DISPOSITION INFORMATION

Disposition Comment: AND NOW, this 2nd day of May, 2025, the Pennsylvania Department of State, Office of General Counsel's November 21, 2023 Final Determination is affirmed.

Dispositional Filing: **Opinion** Filing Author: **Covey, Anne E.**
Filed Date: 5/2/2025 12:00:00AM