Miscellaneous Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 478 MD 2024

Page 1 of 9

October 15, 2025



CAPTION

Patrick M. Browne, Secretary, Pennsylvania Department of Revenue,

Petitioner

٧.

Senate of PA, Joseph Pittman, Majority Leader; Kim Ward, President Pro Tempore of the Senate; Senate Intergovernmental Operations Committee, Jarrett Coleman, Chair; and Max Bartlebaugh, Sergeant of Arms of the Pennsylvania Senate,

Respondents

CASE INFORMATION

Initiating Document: Petition for Review

Case Status: Closed

Case Processing Status: December 2, 2024 Completed

Journal Number:

Case Category: Miscellaneous Case Type(s): Equity

CONSOLIDATED CASES RELATED CASES

Docket No / Reason Type
480 MD 2024 Related

Similar Issue(s)

COUNSEL INFORMATION

Petitioner Browne, Patrick M.

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Howell, Thomas Paul

Law Firm: Pennsylvania Governor's Office of General Counsel

Address: Governor's Office Of General Counsel

333 Market St 17th Fl Harrisburg, PA 17101

Phone No: (717) 783-6563 Fax No:

Miscellaneous Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 478 MD 2024

Page 2 of 9



October 15, 2025	;	
	COUNS	SEL INFORMATION
Respondent	Ward, Kim	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Attorney:	Voss, Joshua John	
Law Firm:	Kleinbard LLC	
Address:	1717 Arch St Fl 5th	
	Philadelphia, PA 19103	
Phone No:	(267) 443-4114	Fax No:
Attorney:	Haverstick, Matthew Hermann	
Law Firm:	Kleinbard, LLC	
Address:	Three Logan Square	
	1717 Arch St FI 5	
	Philadelphia, PA 19103	
Phone No:	(215) 568-2000	Fax No: (215) 568-0140
Attorney:	McIntosh, Gregory Burns	
Law Firm:	Kleinbard LLC	
Address:	1717 Arch St 5th FI	
	Philadelphia, PA 19103	
Phone No:	(571) 217-5017	Fax No:
Respondent	Senate of Pennsylvania	
Pro Se:	No	
IFP Status:		
Attorney:	Voss, Joshua John	
Law Firm:	Kleinbard LLC	
Address:	1717 Arch St Fl 5th	
51 11	Philadelphia, PA 19103	- W
Phone No:	(267) 443-4114	Fax No:
Attorney:	Haverstick, Matthew Hermann	
Law Firm:	Kleinbard, LLC	
Address:	Three Logan Square	
	1717 Arch St FI 5	
D. N.	Philadelphia, PA 19103	E N. (045) 500 0440
Phone No:	(215) 568-2000	Fax No: (215) 568-0140
Attorney:	McIntosh, Gregory Burns	
Law Firm:	Kleinbard LLC	
Address:	1717 Arch St 5th FI	
Diama N	Philadelphia, PA 19103	Fav Na.
Phone No:	(571) 217-5017	Fax No:

Miscellaneous Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 478 MD 2024

Page 3 of 9

October 15, 2025



COU	NOEL	INF	ORIV	IAI	IUN

Respondent Senate Intergovernmental Operations Committee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Voss, Joshua John
Law Firm: Kleinbard LLC
Address: 1717 Arch St Fl 5th
Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (267) 443-4114

67) 443-4114 Fax No:

Attorney: Haverstick, Matthew Hermann

Law Firm: Kleinbard, LLC
Address: Three Logan Square
1717 Arch St FI 5

1717 Arch St FI 5 Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (215) 568-2000 Fax No: (215) 568-0140

Attorney: McIntosh, Gregory Burns

Law Firm: Kleinbard LLC
Address: 1717 Arch St 5th Fl
Philadelphia, PA 19103

rilladelprila, FA 1910

Phone No: (571) 217-5017 Fax No:

Respondent Pittman, Joseph

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Voss, Joshua John
Law Firm: Kleinbard LLC
Address: 1717 Arch St Fl 5th
Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (267) 443-4114

Attorney: Haverstick, Matthew Hermann

Law Firm: Kleinbard, LLC
Address: Three Logan Square

1717 Arch St FI 5 Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (215) 568-2000 Fax No: (215) 568-0140

Attorney: McIntosh, Gregory Burns

Law Firm: Kleinbard LLC
Address: 1717 Arch St 5th FI

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (571) 217-5017 Fax No:

Fax No:

Miscellaneous Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 478 MD 2024

Page 4 of 9

October 15, 2025



COUNSEL INFORMATION

Fax No:

Respondent Coleman, Jarrett

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Voss, Joshua John Attorney: Kleinbard LLC Law Firm: 1717 Arch St FI 5th Address: Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (267) 443-4114

Attorney: Haverstick, Matthew Hermann

Law Firm: Kleinbard, LLC Address: Three Logan Square

1717 Arch St FI 5 Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (215) 568-2000 Fax No: (215) 568-0140

McIntosh, Gregory Burns Attorney:

Law Firm: Kleinbard LLC Address: 1717 Arch St 5th FI Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (571) 217-5017 Fax No:

Respondent Bartlebaugh, Max

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Anderson, Erik Roberts Law Firm: McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC

Address: 100 Pine St P.o. Box 1166

Harrisburg, PA 17108-1166

Phone No: (717) 237-5420 Fax No:

Gonder, Ryan T. Attorney:

Law Firm: Dauphin County Tax Claim Bureau

Address: 2 South Second Street

PO Box 1295

Harrisburg, PA 17101

Attorney: Hoke, Matthew L.

McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC Law Firm:

Address: 100 Pine St Po Box 1166

Harrisburg, PA 17108-1166

Phone No: (717) 237-5330 Fax No:

FEE INFORMATION

Fee Dt Receipt Amt Fee Name Fee Amt Receipt Dt Receipt No 10/07/2024 Miscellaneous Docket Filing Fee 70.25 10/08/2024 2024-CMW-H-001527 70.25

Content Description

Miscellaneous Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 478 MD 2024

Page 5 of 9

October 15, 2025



AGENCY/TRIAL COURT INFORMATION				
Order Appealed From: Order Type: Documents Received:	October 7, 2024	Notice of Appeal Filed:		
Court Below: County: Judge: Docket Number:		Division: OTN: Judicial District: ORIGINAL RECORD CONTENT		

Filed Date

Date of Remand of Record:

Original Record Item

		BRIEFING SCHEDULE		
None None				
		DOCKET ENTRY		
Filed Date	Docket Entry / Filer	Representing	Participant Type	Exit Date
October 7, 2024	Petition for Review Filed Browne, Patrick M.		Petitioner	
October 8, 2024	Notice Exited Commonwealth Court Filing Office			
October 8, 2024	Amended - Petition for Review Howell, Thomas Paul	Browne, Patrick M.	Petitioner	
October 8, 2024 Document Name:	Application for Emergency Relief Howell, Thomas Paul Petitioner's Application for Emerge	Browne, Patrick M. ency Expedited Special and Summ	Petitioner nary Relief	
October 9, 2024	Entry of Appearance			
,	Voss, Joshua John	Senate of Pennsylvania	Respondent	
	Voss, Joshua John	Pittman, Joseph	Respondent	
	Voss, Joshua John	Ward, Kim	Respondent	
	Voss, Joshua John	Coleman, Jarrett	Respondent	
	Voss, Joshua John	Senate Intergovernmental Ope	ration Respondent	
	Haverstick, Matthew Hermann	Senate of Pennsylvania	Respondent	
	McIntosh, Gregory Burns	Senate of Pennsylvania	Respondent	
	Haverstick, Matthew Hermann	Pittman, Joseph	Respondent	
	McIntosh, Gregory Burns	Pittman, Joseph	Respondent	
	Haverstick, Matthew Hermann	Ward, Kim	Respondent	
	McIntosh, Gregory Burns	Ward, Kim	Respondent	
	Haverstick, Matthew Hermann	Coleman, Jarrett	Respondent	
	McIntosh, Gregory Burns	Coleman, Jarrett	Respondent	
	Haverstick, Matthew Hermann	Senate Intergovernmental Ope	ration Respondent	
	McIntosh, Gregory Burns	Senate Intergovernmental Ope	ration Respondent	
Document Name:	Attys. Haverstick, McIntosh and V	oss for Respondents		

Miscellaneous Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 478 MD 2024

Page 6 of 9

October 15, 2025



		DOCKET ENTRY		
Filed Date	Docket Entry / Filer	Representing	Participant Type	Exit Date
October 9, 2024	Order Filed Per Curiam			10/09/2024
	NOW, October 9, 2024, the Tempore of the Senate; So Max Bartlebaugh, Sergeant answer or other response Relief no later than 12:00 PAC-File (the Pennsylvania ap	gency Expedited Relief is Due Oct e Senate of PA, Joseph Pittma enate Intergovernmental Operat of Arms of the Pennsylvania is to Petitioner's Application for p.m. on October 11, 2024. The pellate court electronic filing system e a copy of this Order by elect	an, Majority Leader; Kim ions Committee, Jarrett Senate (Respondents) sh Emergency Expedited S e answer or other respon m).	Coleman, Chair; and all file and serve an pecial and Summary nse shall be filed by
October 9, 2024	Entry of Appearance Anderson, Erik Roberts Atty. Anderson for Respondent	Bartlebaugh, Max	Respondent	
October 9, 2024	Entry of Appearance Gonder, Ryan T. Atty. Gonder for Respondent B	Bartlebaugh, Max	Respondent	
October 9, 2024	Entry of Appearance Hoke, Matthew L.	Bartlebaugh, Max	Respondent	
Document Name:	Atty. Hoke for Respondent Bar	tlebaugh		
	Status Conference Scheduled Per Curiam October 11, 2024, 3:00pm, via Telephone NOW, October 10, 2024, a joint status conference is hereby scheduled for Friday, October 11, 2024, at 3:00 p.m., in relation to Patrick M. Browne, Secretary, Pennsylvania Department of Revenue's (Petitioner Secretary) "Application for Emergency Expedited Special and Summary Relief" in 478 M.D. 2024, and in relation to Senator Jay Costa, Minority Leader, Senate of Pennsylvania; Senator Tina Tartaglione, Minority Chair, Senate Intergovernmental Operations Committee; Senator Vincent J. Hughes, and Senator Nikil Saval, Members, Senate Intergovernmental Operations Committee's (collectively, Petitioners) "Petition for Special Preliminary Injunctive Relief" and "Emergency Application for Expedited Hearing" in 480 M.D. 2024. The status conference shall be conducted by telephone call with counsel of record and shall be heard by a designated judge of this Court. The Court will contact counsel and parties of record to confirm the call and to provide the call-in information. While jointly scheduled for a status conference, 478 M.D. 2024 and 480 M.D. 2024 remain unconsolidated. Petitioner Secretary shall secure the services of a court stenographer for the Hearing. Petitioner Secretary and Petitioners shall immediately serve a copy of this Order on Respondents in each respective matter and promptly filed proof of service thereof.			
October 10, 2024	Certificate of Service Filed Howell, Thomas Paul Service of Oct. 10, 2024 Order	Browne, Patrick M.	Petitioner	

Miscellaneous Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 478 MD 2024

Page 7 of 9

October 15, 2025



		DOCKET ENTRY		
Filed Date	Docket Entry / Filer	Representing	Participant Type	Exit Date
October 11, 2024	Answer to Application for Emergence	cy Relief		
	Voss, Joshua John	Senate of Pennsylvania	Respondent	
	Voss, Joshua John	Pittman, Joseph	Respondent	
	Voss, Joshua John	Ward, Kim	Respondent	
	Voss, Joshua John	Coleman, Jarrett	Respondent	
	Voss, Joshua John	Senate Intergovernmental Operation	•	
Document Name:	Senate Respondents' Answer to Ap	plication for Emergency Relief and C	Cross Application for S	Summary
October 11, 2024	Answer to Application for Emergence	cy Relief		
	Anderson, Erik Roberts	Bartlebaugh, Max	Respondent	
	Respondent Bartlebaugh's Answer t	to Application for Emergency Relief	and Cross Application	for
Comment:	Summary Relief			
October 11, 2024	Order Filed			10/11/2024
	Per Curiam			
Document Name:	: Answers to Cross Applications for Summary Relief due Oct. 14, 2024, 12:00pm			
	t: NOW, October 11, 2024, Patrick M. Browne (Petitioner) shall file and serve an answer or other response to Senate of PA, Joseph Pittman, Majority Leader; Kim Ward, President Pro Tempore of the Senate; Senate Intergovernmental Operations Committee, Jarrett Coleman, Chair's (collectively, Senate Respondents) Cross-Application for Summary Relief, to which Max Bartlebaugh, Chief Sergeant-at-Arms of the Pennsylvania Senate (CSA Respondent) joins, no later than 12:00 p.m. on Monday, October 14, 2024. In addition, Petitioner shall file and serve an answer or other response to CSA Respondent's separate Cross-Application for Summary Relief no later than 12:00 p.m. on Monday, October 14, 2024. The answers or other responses shall be filed by PAC-File (the Pennsylvania appellate court electronic filing system). Senate Respondents are directed to serve a copy of this Order on Petitioner.			
October 14, 2024	Answer Filed			
	Howell, Thomas Paul	Browne, Patrick M.	Petitioner	
Document Name:	Answer to Senate Resps. Cross-Ap	p for Summary Rel.		
October 14, 2024	Answer Filed			
	Howell, Thomas Paul	Browne, Patrick M.	Petitioner	
	riowon, riioinao raai	,		

Miscellaneous Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 478 MD 2024

Page 8 of 9

October 15, 2025



		DOCKET ENTRY		
Filed Date	Docket Entry / Filer	Representing	Participant Type	Exit Date
October 15, 2024	Order Denying Application for E Wolf, Matthew S.	Emergency Relief		10/15/2024
	"Application for Emergency Exp	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	atrick M. ecretary Browne) elief" (Emergency	
	1 Through the Emergency Application, Secretary Browne seeks relief in the form of a writ prohibiting the Sergeant at Arms of the Senate from taking custody or otherwise compelling his physical movement and a judgment declaring that the Senate of Pennsylvania is without authority to compel him to disclose certain information requested in a July 10, 2024 Subpoena issued by the Senate Intergovernmental Operations Committee. See Emergency Application at 7. 2 Emergency relief is not warranted as the case is not ripe for determination. See Camiel v. Select Committee on State Contract Practices of the House of Representatives, 324 A.2d 862, 870 (Pa. Cmwlth. 1974). In Camiel, a select committee of the Pennsylvania House of Representatives issued a subpoena duces tecum to Peter J. Camiel, who challenged the subpoena on the grounds that it was so broad and indefinite that it violated his constitutional rights. We explained that while Camiel had "raised real issues which may some day have to be decided by the courts this case does not yet present a justiciable issue and therefore is not ripe for a decision on the merits." Id. at The case was not ripe because "there ha[d] been no confrontation." Id. at 866; see also Costa v. 290 A.3d 335, 349 (Pa. Cmwlth. 2023), vacated on other grounds, 310 A.3d 229 (Pa. 2024) ("[This] will not decide issues raised by a legislative subpoena that are capable of being resolved by negot and compromise or change of heart."). As in Camiel, there has been no confrontation, and the ir matter is therefore not yet justiciable. Accordingly, we withhold from "ruling on the merits of the ca any manner." Camiel, 324 A.2d at 870. Secretary Browne may "commence an action after def issues are struck, if he so desires." Id.			ority by the Select (Pa. Sunds While case e merits." Id. at 865 also Costa v. Ward . 2024) ("[This] Coursolved by negotiation tion, and the instant merits of the case in
October 16, 2024 Document Name:	Notice of Appeal to PA Supremo Howell, Thomas Paul 83 MAP 2024	e Court Filed Browne, Patrick M.	Petitioner	
October 16, 2024 Document Name:	Filed - Other Howell, Thomas Paul 83 MAP 2024-Jurisdictional Sta	Browne, Patrick M. atement.	Petitioner	
October 23, 2024	Transcript Filed Court Reporter			
Document Name:	Proceedings of 10/11/24.			
December 2, 2024	Praecipe for Discontinuance Howell, Thomas Paul	Browne, Patrick M.	Petitioner	
December 3, 2024	Discontinued Howell, Thomas Paul	Browne, Patrick M.	Petitioner	12/03/2024
December 3, 2024	Notice of Discontinuance Krimmel, Michael			

Miscellaneous Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 478 MD 2024

Page 9 of 9

October 15, 2025



	DO	CKET	ENTRY
--	----	------	--------------

Filed Date Docket Entry / Filer Representing Participant Type Exit Date

Quashed December 11, 2024

Supreme Court of Pennsylvania

Document Name: 83 MAP 2024

DISPOSITION INFORMATION

Final Disposition:

Yes

Discontinued

Related Journal No:

Judgment Date:

Filing Author:

Category: Disposition: Disposed Before Decision Disposition Author:

Disposition Date:

Howell, Thomas Paul December 3, 2024

Dispositional Filing:

Filed Date: