

## Commonwealth Docket Sheet

## Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

Docket Number: 158 CD 2019

Page 1 of 8

September 15, 2025



## CAPTION

Jane Ladley and Christopher Meier,  
Appellants

v.

Pennsylvania State Education Association

## CASE INFORMATION

Initiating Document:	Notice of Appeal		
Case Status:	Closed		
Case Processing Status:	March 8, 2022	Completed	
Journal Number:	34-12-2019		
Case Category:	Civil	Case Type(s):	Declaratory Judgment

## CONSOLIDATED CASES

## RELATED CASES

## COUNSEL INFORMATION

**Appellant**      **Meier, Christopher**

Pro Se:              No

IFP Status:

Attorney:	Osborne, David Randel	
Address:	Goldstein Law Partners, LLC 11 Church Rd. Hatfield, PA 19440	
Phone No:	(610) 949-0444	Fax No: (610) 296-7720

Attorney:	McGrath, Nathan John	
Law Firm:	The Fairness Center	
Address:	500 North Third Street Suite600B Harrisburg, PA 17101	
Phone No:	(844) 293-1001	Fax No:

## Commonwealth Docket Sheet

## Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

Docket Number: 158 CD 2019

Page 2 of 8

September 15, 2025



## COUNSEL INFORMATION

**Appellant**      **Ladley, Jane**

Pro Se:              No

IFP Status:

Attorney:              Osborne, David Randel  
 Address:              Goldstein Law Partners, LLC  
                              11 Church Rd.  
                              Hatfield, PA 19440  
 Phone No:            (610) 949-0444              Fax No: (610) 296-7720

Attorney:              McGrath, Nathan John  
 Law Firm:            The Fairness Center  
 Address:              500 North Third Street  
                              Suite600B  
                              Harrisburg, PA 17101  
 Phone No:            (844) 293-1001              Fax No:

**Appellee**      **Pennsylvania State Education Association**

Pro Se:              No

IFP Status:

Attorney:              Scott, Thomas W.  
 Address:              Killian & Gephart, LLP  
                              218 Pine Street  
                              PO Box 886  
                              Harrisburg, PA 17101-1352  
 Phone No:            (717) 232-1851              Fax No:

## FEE INFORMATION

Fee Dt	Fee Name	Fee Amt	Receipt Dt	Receipt No	Receipt Amt
02/14/2019	Transfer	50.00	02/26/2019	2019-CMW-H-000431	50.00
07/23/2019	Petition for Reargument	15.00	07/24/2019	2019-CMW-H-001570	15.00

## AGENCY/TRIAL COURT INFORMATION

Order Appealed From:    October 29, 2018              Notice of Appeal Filed:    November 28, 2018  
 Order Type:              Order Dated  
 Documents Received:    February 13, 2019

Court Below:              Lancaster County Court of Common Pleas  
 County:                  Lancaster                      Division:                      Lancaster County Civil Division  
 Judge:                    Brown, Leonard G., III              OTN:  
 Docket Number:        CI-14-08552                      Judicial District:              02

Court Below:  
 County:                      Division:  
 Judge:                      OTN:  
 Docket Number:        Superior Court No. 1942 MDA 2018              Judicial District:

## ORIGINAL RECORD CONTENT

Original Record Item	Filed Date	Content Description
Trial Court Record	February 14, 2019	

**Date of Remand of Record:** March 8, 2022

## Commonwealth Docket Sheet

## Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

Docket Number: 158 CD 2019

Page 3 of 8

September 15, 2025



## BRIEFING SCHEDULE

## Appellant

Ladley, Jane

## Amended Brief

Due: August 8, 2019

Filed: August 8, 2019

## Appellee

Pennsylvania State Education Association

## Brief

Due: April 29, 2019

Filed: April 26, 2019

## Brief

Due: March 27, 2019

Filed: March 27, 2019

## Reply Brief

Due:

Filed: May 10, 2019

Due: August 8, 2019

Filed: August 8, 2019

## Reproduced Record

Due: March 27, 2019

Filed: March 27, 2019

## DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Filer	Representing	Participant Type	Exit Date
<b>November 28, 2018</b>	Notice of Appeal Filed Ladley, Jane & Christopher Meier Ladley, Jane Meier, Christopher		Appellant Appellant Appellant	
<b>January 2, 2019</b>	Order - Transfer to Commonwealth Court Superior Court of Pennsylvania			01/02/2019
<b>February 13, 2019</b>	Transfer from Another Court Commonwealth Court Document Name: Case was transferred from 1942 MDA 2018 Comment: Case was transferred from 1942 MDA 2018			02/13/2019
<b>February 14, 2019</b>	Trial Court Record Received Lancaster County Court of Common Pleas			
<b>February 15, 2019</b>	Notice of Docketing Appeal Exited Commonwealth Court Filing Office			02/15/2019
<b>February 15, 2019</b>	Briefing Schedule Issued Commonwealth Court Filing Office			
<b>February 25, 2019</b>	Docketing Statement Filed Osborne, David Randel Osborne, David Randel	Ladley, Jane Meier, Christopher	Appellant Appellant	
<b>February 25, 2019</b>	Designation of Contents of Reproduced Record Osborne, David Randel Osborne, David Randel	Ladley, Jane Meier, Christopher	Appellant Appellant	

## Commonwealth Docket Sheet

## Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

Docket Number: 158 CD 2019

Page 4 of 8

September 15, 2025



DOCKET ENTRY				
Filed Date	Docket Entry / Filer	Representing	Participant Type	Exit Date
<b>March 27, 2019</b>	Appellant's Brief Filed			
	Osborne, David Randel	Ladley, Jane	Appellant	
	Osborne, David Randel	Meier, Christopher	Appellant	
	Ladley, Jane		Appellant	
<b>March 27, 2019</b>	Appellant's Reproduced Record Filed			
	Osborne, David Randel	Ladley, Jane	Appellant	
	Osborne, David Randel	Meier, Christopher	Appellant	
<b>April 26, 2019</b>	Appellee's Brief Filed			
	Pennsylvania State Education Association		Appellee	
<b>May 6, 2019</b>	Application to Strike			
	Scott, Thomas W.	Pennsylvania State Education Assoc	Appellee	
	Document Name: Appellee's Application for Relief in the Nature of a Motion to Strike Portions of Apts' Br. and the Comment: Entirety of "Exhibit A" Attached to Appellants' Brief			
<b>May 6, 2019</b>	Memorandum of Law Filed			
	Scott, Thomas W.	Pennsylvania State Education Assoc	Appellee	
	Document Name: Memo of Law in Support of Motion to Strike Portions of Appellants' Brief			
<b>May 9, 2019</b>	Tentative Session Date			
	Krimmel, Michael			
	Document Name: September 2019 (Harrisburg)			
<b>May 10, 2019</b>	Appellant's Reply Brief			
	Ladley, Jane		Appellant	
<b>May 10, 2019</b>	Answer to Application to Strike			
	Osborne, David Randel	Ladley, Jane	Appellant	
	Osborne, David Randel	Meier, Christopher	Appellant	
	Miller, Justin Thomas	Ladley, Jane	Appellant	
	Miller, Justin Thomas	Meier, Christopher	Appellant	
	Document Name: Response to PA State Education Association's Application to Strike and New Matter			
<b>May 14, 2019</b>	Order Filed			05/15/2019
	Wojcik, Michael H.			
	Document Name: Argument on appellee's motion to strike portions of appellants' brief is set for 6-17-19, 1:30 pm.			
	Comment: The argument shall be conducted by telephone call to the offices of counsel of record and shall originate from the chambers of a designated judge of the Comm. Ct. sitting in HBG. Cell phones may not be used.			
<b>May 30, 2019</b>	Answer Filed			
	Scott, Thomas W.	Pennsylvania State Education Assoc	Appellee	
	Document Name: An Administrative Motion Pursuant to PA. R.A.P. 3305: Appellee's Reply to New Matter Contained in			
	Comment: the Appellants' Answer Application for Relief in the Nature of a Motion to Strike Portions of Appellants' Brief and the Entirety of "Exhibit A" Attached to Appellants' Brief - msp			
<b>June 6, 2019</b>	Order Filed			06/07/2019
	Per Curiam			
	Document Name: Argument on appellee's motion to strike set for 6-17-19 is rescheduled to 6-25-19 at 10:00 am. The			
	Comment: argument shall be conducted by telephone call to the offices of counsel of record and shall originate from the chambers of a designated judge of the Comm. Ct. sitting in HBG. Cell phones may not be used.			

## Commonwealth Docket Sheet

## Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

Docket Number: 158 CD 2019

Page 5 of 8

September 15, 2025



## DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Filer	Representing	Participant Type	Exit Date
<b>June 14, 2019</b>	Notice			
	Miller, Justin Thomas	Ladley, Jane & Christopher Meier	Appellant	
	Miller, Justin Thomas	Ladley, Jane	Appellant	
	Miller, Justin Thomas	Meier, Christopher	Appellant	
	Osborne, David Randel	Ladley, Jane	Appellant	
	Osborne, David Randel	Ladley, Jane & Christopher Meier	Appellant	
	Osborne, David Randel	Meier, Christopher	Appellant	
	Document Name: Notice of Constitutional Challenge to a Statute			
<b>June 24, 2019</b>	Filed - Other			
	Osborne, David Randel	Ladley, Jane	Appellant	
	Osborne, David Randel	Meier, Christopher	Appellant	
	Miller, Justin Thomas	Ladley, Jane	Appellant	
	Miller, Justin Thomas	Meier, Christopher	Appellant	
	Miller, Justin Thomas	Ladley, Jane & Christopher Meier	Appellant	
	Document Name: Notice of Change in Status of Authorities			
<b>July 9, 2019</b>	Memorandum and Order			07/09/2019
	Cohn Jubelirer, Renee			
	Document Name: Memorandum and Order (7 pages) : PSEA's motion to strike will be granted in			
	Comment: part and denied in part. The Court will strike the 11 collective bargaining agreements Objectors submitted that are not part of the certified record on appeal, and will strike the arguments made by Objectors that rely upon this extra-record evidence. The collective bargaining agreement for Penn Manor School District, and Objectors' argument that PSEA failed to amend this agreement, will not be stricken. Objectors are hereby directed to file an amended brief and amended reply brief without the stricken documents, or any reference thereto, on or before August 8, 2019.			
<b>July 23, 2019</b>	Application for Reargument			
	Osborne, David Randel	Ladley, Jane	Appellant	
	Osborne, David Randel	Meier, Christopher	Appellant	
	Miller, Justin Thomas	Ladley, Jane	Appellant	
	Miller, Justin Thomas	Meier, Christopher	Appellant	
	Document Name: Of July 9, 2019 Memorandum and Order Judge Cohn Jubelirer			
<b>July 31, 2019</b>	Application for Extension of Time to File Amended Brief			
	Osborne, David Randel	Ladley, Jane	Appellant	
	Osborne, David Randel	Meier, Christopher	Appellant	
<b>July 31, 2019</b>	Answer to Application for Reargument			
	Scott, Thomas W.	Pennsylvania State Education Assoc	Appellee	
	Document Name: Appellee's Ans. to Appellants' App for Reargument of Judge Cohn Jubelirer's Order dated July 9, 2019			
<b>August 1, 2019</b>	Order Denying Application for Reargument			08/01/2019
	Per Curiam			
	Document Name: Appellants' App. for Reargument is denied. Appellants' unopposed app. for ext. of time is granted.			
	Comment: Appellants shall have 7 days from the date of this order to file an amended brief and reply brief without the documents or reference to the documents struck from the record by this court's 7-9-19 order.			
<b>August 8, 2019</b>	Amended Brief of Appellant Filed			
	Osborne, David Randel	Ladley, Jane	Appellant	
	Osborne, David Randel	Meier, Christopher	Appellant	

## Commonwealth Docket Sheet

## Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

Docket Number: 158 CD 2019

Page 6 of 8

September 15, 2025



## DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Filer	Representing	Participant Type	Exit Date
<b>August 8, 2019</b>	Appellant's Reply Brief			
	Osborne, David Randel	Ladley, Jane	Appellant	
	Osborne, David Randel	Meier, Christopher	Appellant	
	Document Name: Amended			
<b>August 12, 2019</b>	Tentative Session Date			
	Krimmel, Michael			
	Document Name: December 2019 (Harrisburg)			
<b>October 23, 2019</b>	Argument Scheduled			10/23/2019
	Krimmel, Michael			
	Document Name: Wednesday, 12-11-19, 9:30 am, En Banc, CR 5001, PJC, HBG. No. 34 on list.			
	Comment: Please file 4 additional copies of appellant's amended brief, appellant's amended reply brief, the RR, and appellee's brief with the court within 10 days of this notice.			
<b>January 23, 2020</b>	Application for Relief			
	Scott, Thomas W.	Pennsylvania State Education Assoc Appellee		
	Document Name: Application of Appellee, PSEA, For Leave to File Post-Submission Communication			
<b>June 1, 2020</b>	Letter			
	Osborne, David Randel	Ladley, Jane	Appellant	
	Osborne, David Randel	Meier, Christopher	Appellant	
	Document Name: Update of Contact Information			
<b>June 25, 2020</b>	Application for Post-Submission Communication			
	Scott, Thomas W.	Pennsylvania State Education Assoc Appellee		
	Document Name: Application for Leave Pursuant to Pa. R.A.P. 123, filed by Appellee PSEA for leave to File			
	Comment: Post-Submission Communication Pursuant to Pa. R.A.P. 2501(a)			
<b>January 6, 2021</b>	Praecipe for Withdrawal of Appearance			
	Miller, Justin Thomas	Ladley, Jane & Christopher Meier	Appellant	
	Miller, Justin Thomas	Ladley, Jane	Appellant	
	Miller, Justin Thomas	Meier, Christopher	Appellant	
<b>January 11, 2021</b>	Entry of Appearance			
	McGrath, Nathan John	Ladley, Jane	Appellant	
	McGrath, Nathan John	Meier, Christopher	Appellant	
<b>March 9, 2021</b>	Letter			
	McGrath, Nathan John	Ladley, Jane	Appellant	
	Document Name: Change of Address for Nathan J. McGrath			

## Commonwealth Docket Sheet

## Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

Docket Number: 158 CD 2019

Page 7 of 8

September 15, 2025



## DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Filer	Representing	Participant Type	Exit Date
<b>January 4, 2022</b>	Reversed/Remanded McCullough, Patricia			01/04/2022
	<p>Document Name: Opinion (17 pages)</p> <p>Comment: AND NOW, this 4th day of January, 2022, the October 29, 2018 order of the Court of Common Pleas of Lancaster County (trial court) is REVERSED and the matter is REMANDED to the trial court. On remand, the trial court shall determine whether Jane Ladley and Christopher Meier (Teachers) are the prevailing party pursuant to 42 U.S.C. §1988 and, if so, whether they are entitled to reasonable attorney's fees and costs in this action. In making this determination, the trial court shall render a decision with regard to the merits of Teachers' constitutional claims and enter an appropriate order reflecting its findings of fact and conclusions of law.</p> <p>The Application for Leave to File Post-Submission Communication filed by the Pennsylvania State Education Association (PSEA) on January 23, 2020, namely to provide the Court with additional legal authority pursuant to Pa.R.A.P. 2501(a), is hereby GRANTED.</p> <p>The Application for Leave to File Post-Submission Communication filed by PSEA on June 25, 2020, namely to provide the Court with supplemental legal authority pursuant to Pa.R.A.P. 2501(a), is hereby GRANTED.</p> <p>Jurisdiction relinquished.</p>			
<b>March 8, 2022</b>	Remitted Commonwealth Court Filing Office			
<b>March 14, 2022</b>	Acknowledgement of Record Remittal Lancaster County Court of Common Pleas			

## SESSION INFORMATION

Journal Number: 34-12-2019  
 Consideration Type: En Banc Argument  
 Listed/Submitted Date: December 11, 2019

## Panel Composition:

The Honorable Mary Hannah Leavitt	President Judge
The Honorable Renee Cohn Jubelirer	Judge
The Honorable Patricia McCullough	Judge
The Honorable Anne E. Covey	Judge
The Honorable Christine Fizzano Cannon	Judge
The Honorable Ellen Ceisler	Judge
The Honorable P. Kevin Brobson	Judge

## DISPOSITION INFORMATION

Final Disposition:	Yes	Judgment Date:	
Related Journal No:		Disposition Author:	McCullough, Patricia
Category:	Decided	Disposition Date:	January 4, 2022
Disposition:	Reversed/Remanded		

## Commonwealth Docket Sheet

## Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

Docket Number: 158 CD 2019

Page 8 of 8

September 15, 2025



## DISPOSITION INFORMATION

Disposition Comment: AND NOW, this 4th day of January, 2022, the October 29, 2018 order of the Court of Common Pleas of Lancaster County (trial court) is REVERSED and the matter is REMANDED to the trial court. On remand, the trial court shall determine whether Jane Ladley and Christopher Meier (Teachers) are the prevailing party pursuant to 42 U.S.C. §1988 and, if so, whether they are entitled to reasonable attorney's fees and costs in this action. In making this determination, the trial court shall render a decision with regard to the merits of Teachers' constitutional claims and enter an appropriate order reflecting its findings of fact and conclusions of law.

The Application for Leave to File Post-Submission Communication filed by the Pennsylvania State Education Association (PSEA) on January 23, 2020, namely to provide the Court with additional legal authority pursuant to Pa.R.A.P. 2501(a), is hereby GRANTED.

The Application for Leave to File Post-Submission Communication filed by PSEA on June 25, 2020, namely to provide the Court with supplemental legal authority pursuant to Pa.R.A.P. 2501(a), is hereby GRANTED.

Jurisdiction relinquished.

Dispositional Filing:	<b>Opinion</b>	Filing Author:	McCullough, Patricia
Filed Date:	1/4/2022 12:00:00AM		

Dispositional Filing:	<b>Concurring Statement</b>	Filing Author:	Cohn Jubelirer, Renee
Filed Date:	1/4/2022 12:00:00AM		

## REARGUMENT / RECONSIDERATION / REMITTAL

Filed Date:	July 23, 2019
Disposition:	
Disposition Date:	
Record Remittal:	March 8, 2022
Filed Date:	July 23, 2019
Disposition:	
Disposition Date:	
Record Remittal:	March 8, 2022