7:32 A.M. Sealed Documents

Commonwealth Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 1002 CD 2020

Page 1 of 6

April 19, 2025

Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania



CAPTION

Equity Forward and Mary Alice Carter, Petitioners

٧.

Pennsylvania Department of Human Services (Office of

Open Records), Respondent

CASE INFORMATION

Initiating Document: Petition for Review

Case Status: Closed

Case Processing Status: July 19, 2022 Completed

Journal Number: 19a-03-2022

Case Category: Administrative Agency Case Type(s): Right to Know Act

CONSOLIDATED CASES RELATED CASES

Docket No / ReasonTypeDocket No / ReasonType986 CD 2020Consolidated225 CD 2018Related

Ct Order - Sua Sponte Appeal After Remand

COUNSEL INFORMATION

Fax No:

Designated Petitioner Equity Forward

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Mutchler, Terry Lee
Address: Dilworth Paxson LLP
1500 Market Street

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (215) 575-7034

Designated Petitioner Carter, Mary Alice

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Mutchler, Terry Lee

Address: Dilworth Paxson LLP 1500 Market Street

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (215) 575-7034 Fax No:

Commonwealth Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 1002 CD 2020

Page 2 of 6

April 19, 2025



COUNSEL INFORMATION

Designated Respondent Real Alternatives, Inc.

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Voss, Joshua John
Law Firm: Kleinbard, LLC
Address: Kleinbard LLC
1717 Arch St FI 5th

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (267) 443-4114 Fax No:

Attorney: Zimmer, Samantha G. Address: Kleinbard LLC

1717 Arch St 5th FI Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (570) 352-8367 Fax No:

Designated Respondent Department of Human Services

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Cohan, Marisa Lynn

Law Firm: Pennsylvania Department of Human Services, Bureau of Hearings and Appeals

Address: Pa-Dhs-office Of General Counsel

625 Forster St 3rd Fl West Harrisburg, PA 17120

Phone No: (717) 783-2800 Fax No:

Attorney: Serafin, Kenneth J.

Law Firm: Pennsylvania Department of Human Services, Bureau of Hearings and Appeals

Address: Office Of General Counsel

625 Forster St 3rd Fl West Harrisburg, PA 17120

Phone No: (717) 783-2800 Fax No:

FEE INFORMATION

Fee Dt Fee Name Fee Amt Receipt Dt Receipt No Receipt Amt

10/13/2020 Petition for Review - Appellate 90.25 10/14/2020 2020-CMW-H-001926 90.25

AGENCY/TRIAL COURT INFORMATION

Order Appealed From: September 11, 2020 Notice of Appeal Filed:

Order Type: Decision

Documents Received: October 13, 2020

Court Below: Office of Open Records

County: Division: Office of Open Records

Judge: OTN:

Docket Number: AP 2017-2304 Judicial District:

Commonwealth Docket Sheet Docket Number: 1002 CD 2020

Page 3 of 6

April 19, 2025



ORIGINAL RECORD CONTENT				
Original Record Item	Filed Date	Content Description		
Agency Record	November 25, 2020			
Supplemental Record	December 01, 2020			

Date of Remand of Rec	Olu. 1 Gulualy 10, 2023			
		BRIEFING SCHEDULE		
	None		None	
		DOCKET ENTRY		
Filed Date	Docket Entry / Filer	Representing	Participant Type	Exit Date
October 13, 2020	Petition for Review Filed Carter, Mary Alice Equity Forward		Designated Petition Designated Petition	
October 19, 2020 Document Name:	Application for Intervention (Pa.F Voss, Joshua John Unopposed Application for Interv	Real Alternatives, Inc.	Designated Respo	ndent
October 21, 2020	Notice Exited Commonwealth Court Filing Office			10/21/2020
October 22, 2020	Order Granting Application for In			10/22/2020
	upon consideration of the "Unoppand it appearing that Real Alt Order of the Office of Open Real Alternatives shall proceed Services.	ernatives was a participant i Records giving rise to this p	n the administrative proceed petition for review, the Appli	cation is GRANTED
October 30, 2020	Docketing Statement Filed Mutchler, Terry Lee Mutchler, Terry Lee	Equity Forward Carter, Mary Alice	Designated Petition	
November 25, 2020 Document Name:	Agency Record Received Office of Open Records See Briefing Schedule at 986 CD	2020		
November 25, 2020	Briefing Schedule Issued Commonwealth Court Filing Office			
December 1, 2020	Sealed Supplemental Record Office of Open Records			
Document Name:	Sealed Program Development a	nd Advancement Agrrement.		
	Order Sua Sponte for Consolidat Per Curiam NOW, December 3, 2020, the ab Equity Forward and Mary Alic	ove-captioned matters are her	•	12/03/2020 2136. The briefing
	schedule previously issued at further filings in these consolidate	No. 1002 C.D. 2020 remain	ns in effect for these consc	

Commonwealth Docket Sheet
Docket Number: 1002 CD 2020

Page 4 of 6

April 19, 2025



Aprii 19, 2025		DOCKET ENTRY		~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~	
Filed Date	Docket Entry / Filer	Representing	Participant Type	Exit Date	
January 25, 2021	Entry of Appearance Zimmer, Samantha G.	Real Alternatives, Inc.	Designated Respondent		
Document Name:	Atty. Zimmer for Real Alternatives				
March 3, 2021	Tentative Session Date Krimmel, Michael				
Document Name:	May 2021				
April 7, 2021	Argument Scheduled Krimmel, Michael				
Document Name:	MONDAY, May 10, 2021 (Panel 2)	@9:30 a.m. via WebEx Video Confer	ence (No. 11 & 11a c	on the list)	
April 27, 2021	Filed - Other				
	Mutchler, Terry Lee	Equity Forward	Designated Petitioner		
	Mutchler, Terry Lee	Carter, Mary Alice	Designated Petitio	ner	
April 27, 2021	Application for Continuance				
-	Mutchler, Terry Lee	Equity Forward	Designated Petitioner		
	Mutchler, Terry Lee	Carter, Mary Alice	Designated Petitioner		
	Cohan, Marisa Lynn	Department of Human Services	Designated Respondent		
	Voss, Joshua John	Real Alternatives, Inc.	Designated Respo	ondent	
Document Name:	Jt. Motion for Continuance				
April 30, 2021	Argument Continued				
	Per Curiam				
Document Name:	Application for Continuance Grante	d			
Comment:	application is GRANTED. The	pril, 2021, upon consideration of argument scheduled for Monday, Ex videoconference is hereby CO xt available argument list.	May 10, 2021 a	at 9:30 a.m. on the	
May 3, 2021	Amended			05/03/2021	
Way 5, 2021	Per Curiam			03/03/2021	
Document Name:					
	AND NOW, this 3rd day of May, 2021, upon consideration of the Joint Motion for Continuance, the application is GRANTED. The argument scheduled for Monday, May 10, 2021 at 9:30 a.m. in the above-captioned matter via WebEx videoconference is hereby CONTINUED. In addition, the parties request for entry of the stipulated briefing schedule is hereby GRANTED. Designated Petitioners shall file a Response Brief to Designated Respondent's February 3, 2021 Brief within 14 days of entry of this Order and Designated Respondent shall file a Reply Brief within 14 days of service of Designated Petitioners Response Brief. The Prothonotary is hereby directed to list this matter for the next available argument list.				
	and Designated Respondent sha	ll file a Reply Brief within 14 da	ys of service of D	of entry of this Order esignated Petitioners	
 May 17, 2021	and Designated Respondent sha	ll file a Reply Brief within 14 da	ys of service of D	of entry of this Order esignated Petitioners	
May 17, 2021	and Designated Respondent sha Response Brief. The Prothonotary i	ll file a Reply Brief within 14 da	ys of service of D	of entry of this Order resignated Petitioners argument list.	
May 17, 2021	and Designated Respondent sha Response Brief. The Prothonotary i Memorandum of Law Filed	II file a Reply Brief within 14 da s hereby directed to list this matter fo	lys of service of D or the next available a	of entry of this Order resignated Petitioners argument list.	
Document Name:	and Designated Respondent sha Response Brief. The Prothonotary i Memorandum of Law Filed Mutchler, Terry Lee Mutchler, Terry Lee	Il file a Reply Brief within 14 da s hereby directed to list this matter for Equity Forward Carter, Mary Alice ioners Equity Forward and Mary Alice	by sof service of Department of the next available and Designated Petition Designated Petition	of entry of this Order resignated Petitioners argument list.	
Document Name: Comment:	and Designated Respondent sha Response Brief. The Prothonotary i Memorandum of Law Filed Mutchler, Terry Lee Mutchler, Terry Lee Response Brief of Designated Petit of Designated Respondent's Real A	Il file a Reply Brief within 14 da s hereby directed to list this matter for Equity Forward Carter, Mary Alice ioners Equity Forward and Mary Alice	by sof service of Department of the next available and Designated Petition Designated Petition	of entry of this Order resignated Petitioners argument list.	
	and Designated Respondent sha Response Brief. The Prothonotary i Memorandum of Law Filed Mutchler, Terry Lee Mutchler, Terry Lee Response Brief of Designated Petit of Designated Respondent's Real A Tentative Session Date Krimmel, Michael	Il file a Reply Brief within 14 da s hereby directed to list this matter for Equity Forward Carter, Mary Alice ioners Equity Forward and Mary Alice	by sof service of Department of the next available and Designated Petition Designated Petition	of entry of this Order lesignated Petitioners' argument list.	

Commonwealth Docket Sheet
Docket Number: 1002 CD 2020

Page 5 of 6

April 19, 2025

April 19, 2025				~(~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~
		DOCKET ENTRY		
Filed Date	Docket Entry / Filer	Representing	Participant Type	Exit Date
October 20, 2021	Argument Scheduled Krimmel, Michael			
	Thursday, November 18, 20 No. 38 & 38a on the list.	021, 9:30 a.m. (Panel) CR 5001, Pennsylvar	nia Judicial Center, Ha	arrisburg
November 17, 2021	Argument Continued Per Curiam			11/17/2021
	AND NOW, this 17th of unopposed Emergency A Thursday, November 18, available list.	for Continuance/ Continued to Next Available lay of November, 2021, Petitioners', Application for Relief Seeking Continuation 2021 at 9:30 a.m/1:00 p.m. is hereby Continuation d to schedule the matter for the next available	Equity Forward and ance for Oral Argu GRANTED and is co	ument scheduled for
December 27, 2021	Tentative Session Date Krimmel, Michael			
Document Name:				
January 28, 2022	Argument Scheduled Krimmel, Michael			
	Monday, March 7, 2022, 11 No. 19 & 19a on the list.	:30 a.m. (Panel) CR 3001, Pennsylvania Ju	dicial Center, Harrisbu	urg
July 19, 2022	Affirmed Fizzano Cannon, Christine			07/19/2022
	-	of July, 2022, the September 11, 2020 dge Cohn Jubelirer and Wallace did not part		
August 18, 2022	Petition for Allowance of Ap Carter, Mary Alice Equity Forward	peal to PA Supreme Court Filed	Designated Petition	
Document Name: Comment:	-		Booignated Found	
September 1, 2022	Real Alternatives, Inc.	peal to PA Supreme Court Filed	Designated Respo	ondent
Document Name: Comment:	378 MAL 2022 378 MAL 2022			
January 23, 2023	Per Curiam	Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court		01/24/2023
	355 & 378 MAL 2022 378 MAL 2022			
February 16, 2023	Remitted Commonwealth Court Filing Office	<u> </u>		
February 21, 2023	Acknowledgement of Record Office of Open Records	d Remittal		

7:32 A.M. Sealed Documents

Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

Commonwealth Docket Sheet
Docket Number: 1002 CD 2020

Page 6 of 6

April 19, 2025

SESSION INFORMATION

Journal Number: 19a-03-2022

Consideration Type: Oral Argument - Panel

Listed/Submitted Date: March 7, 2022

Panel Composition:

The Honorable Anne E. Covey

The Honorable Christine Fizzano Cannon

Judge

The Honorable Bonnie Brigance Leadbetter

Senior Judge

DISPOSITION INFORMATION

Final Disposition:

osition: Yes

Related Journal No:

Category: Decided Disposition Author: Fizzano Cannon, Christine

Disposition: Affirmed Disposition Date: July 19, 2022

Disposition Comment: AND NOW, this 19th day of July, 2022, the September 11, 2020 final determination of the Office of Open

Records is AFFIRMED. Judge Cohn Jubelirer and Wallace did not participate in the decision.

Judgment Date:

Dispositional Filing: **Opinion** Filing Author: Fizzano Cannon, Christine

Filed Date: 7/19/2022 12:00:00AM

Dispositional Filing: Dissenting Opinion Filing Author: Leadbetter, Bonnie Brigance

Filed Date: 7/19/2022 12:00:00AM