12:01 A.M. Sealed Documents

Commonwealth Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 1002 CD 2020

Page 1 of 6

December 23, 2025

Equity Forward and

Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania



CAPTION

Mary Alice Carter, Petitioners v.

Pennsylvania Department of Human Services (Office of

Open Records), Respondent

CASE INFORMATION

Initiating Document: Petition for Review

Case Status: Closed

Case Processing Status: July 19, 2022 Completed

Journal Number: 19a-03-2022

Case Category: Administrative Agency Case Type(s): Right to Know Act

CONSOLIDATED CASES RELATED CASES

Docket No / ReasonTypeDocket No / ReasonType986 CD 2020Consolidated225 CD 2018Related

Ct Order - Sua Sponte Appeal After Remand

COUNSEL INFORMATION

Designated Petitioner Equity Forward

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Mutchler, Terry Lee
Address: Dilworth Paxson LLP
1500 Market Street

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (215) 575-7034 Fax No:

Designated Petitioner Carter, Mary Alice

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Mutchler, Terry Lee
Address: Dilworth Paxson LLP

1500 Market Street

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (215) 575-7034 Fax No:

Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

Commonwealth Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 1002 CD 2020

Page 2 of 6

December 23, 2025



COUNSEL INFORMATION

Designated Respondent Real Alternatives, Inc.

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Voss, Joshua John
Law Firm: Kleinbard, LLC
Address: Kleinbard LLC
1717 Arch St Fl 5th

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (267) 443-4114 Fax No:

Attorney: Zimmer, Samantha G.
Address: Kleinbard LLC

1717 Arch St 5th FI Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (570) 352-8367 Fax No:

Designated Respondent Department of Human Services

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Cohan, Marisa Lynn

Law Firm: Pennsylvania Department of Human Services, Bureau of Hearings and Appeals

Address: Pa-Dhs-office Of General Counsel

625 Forster St 3rd Fl West Harrisburg, PA 17120

Phone No: (717) 783-2800 Fax No:

Attorney: Serafin, Kenneth J.

Law Firm: Pennsylvania Department of Human Services, Bureau of Hearings and Appeals

Address: Office Of General Counsel

625 Forster St 3rd Fl West Harrisburg, PA 17120

Phone No: (717) 783-2800 Fax No:

FEE INFORMATION

Fee Dt Fee Name Fee Amt Receipt Dt Receipt No Receipt Amt

10/13/2020 Petition for Review - Appellate 90.25 10/14/2020 2020-CMW-H-001926 90.25

AGENCY/TRIAL COURT INFORMATION

Order Appealed From: September 11, 2020 Notice of Appeal Filed:

Order Type: Decision

Documents Received: October 13, 2020

Court Below: Office of Open Records

County: Division: Office of Open Records

Judge: OTN:

Docket Number: AP 2017-2304 Judicial District:

12:01 A.M. Sealed Documents

Commonwealth Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 1002 CD 2020

Page 3 of 6

December 23, 2025





ORIGINAL RECORD CONTENT				
Original Record Item	Filed Date	Content Description		
Agency Record	November 25, 2020			
Supplemental Record	December 01, 2020			

		BRIEFING SCHEDULE			
	None		None		
		DOCKET ENTRY			
Filed Date	Docket Entry / Filer	Representing	Participant Type	Exit Date	
October 13, 2020	Petition for Review Filed Carter, Mary Alice Equity Forward		•	Designated Petitioner Designated Petitioner	
October 19, 2020 Document Name:	Application for Intervention (Pa. Voss, Joshua John Unopposed Application for Inter	Real Alternatives, Inc.	Designated Respo	Designated Respondent	
October 21, 2020	Notice Exited Commonwealth Court Filing Office			10/21/2020	
October 22, 2020	Order Granting Application for I Per Curiam	ntervention		10/22/2020	
	and it appearing that Real A Order of the Office of Open	oposed Application To Intervene b Iternatives was a participant in Records giving rise to this po eed as a party principally ali	n the administrative procee etition for review, the Appl	ication is GRANTED	
October 30, 2020	Docketing Statement Filed Mutchler, Terry Lee Mutchler, Terry Lee	Equity Forward Carter, Mary Alice	Designated Petitio Designated Petitio		
November 25, 2020	Agency Record Received Office of Open Records See Briefing Schedule at 986 C	D 2020			
November 25, 2020	Briefing Schedule Issued Commonwealth Court Filing Office	2 2020			
December 1, 2020 Document Name:	Sealed Supplemental Record Office of Open Records Sealed Program Development a	and Advancement Agrrement.			
December 3, 2020	Order Sua Sponte for Consolida Per Curiam	ation		12/03/2020	
	NOW, December 3, 2020, the a Equity Forward and Mary Al schedule previously issued a	above-captioned matters are here ice Carter are Designated Pe t No. 1002 C.D. 2020 remain atted matters shall be captioned as	titioners under Pa. R.A.P. s in effect for these cons	-	

Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

Commonwealth Docket Sheet Docket Number: 1002 CD 2020

Page 4 of 6



December 23, 2025	i			
		DOCKET ENTRY		
Filed Date	Docket Entry / Filer	Representing	Participant Type	Exit Date
January 25, 2021 Document Name:	Entry of Appearance Zimmer, Samantha G. Atty. Zimmer for Real Alternatives	Real Alternatives, Inc.	Designated Respo	ndent
March 3, 2021	Tentative Session Date Krimmel, Michael			
Document Name:	May 2021			
April 7, 2021	Argument Scheduled Krimmel, Michael			
Document Name:	MONDAY, May 10, 2021 (Panel 2)	@9:30 a.m. via WebEx Video Confe	rence (No. 11 & 11a c	n the list)
April 27, 2021	Filed - Other Mutchler, Terry Lee Mutchler, Terry Lee	Equity Forward Carter, Mary Alice	Designated Petitio	
April 27, 2021 Document Name:	Application for Continuance Mutchler, Terry Lee Mutchler, Terry Lee Cohan, Marisa Lynn Voss, Joshua John Jt. Motion for Continuance	Equity Forward Carter, Mary Alice Department of Human Services Real Alternatives, Inc.	Designated Petitio Designated Petitio Designated Respo	ner ndent
April 30, 2021	Argument Continued			
	application is GRANTED. The	April, 2021, upon consideration of argument scheduled for Monday, bEx videoconference is hereby Co	May 10, 2021 a	it 9:30 a.m. on the
May 3, 2021	Amended			
	Per Curiam			05/03/2021
Document Name:	-			05/03/2021
	Amended Order AND NOW, this 3rd day of Mapplication is GRANTED. The above-captioned matter via We request for entry of the stipulate a Response Brief to Designated and Designated Respondent sha	May, 2021, upon consideration of e argument scheduled for Mondage bEx videoconference is hereby GR de briefing schedule is hereby GR Respondent's February 3, 2021 B all file a Reply Brief within 14 dais hereby directed to list this matter for	y, May 10, 2021 CONTINUED. In ANTED. Designated rief within 14 days ays of service of D	for Continuance, the at 9:30 a.m. in the addition, the parties Petitioners shall file of entry of this Order esignated Petitioners
	Amended Order AND NOW, this 3rd day of Mapplication is GRANTED. The above-captioned matter via We request for entry of the stipulate a Response Brief to Designated and Designated Respondent sha Response Brief. The Prothonotary Memorandum of Law Filed Mutchler, Terry Lee	e argument scheduled for Monda ebEx videoconference is hereby of ed briefing schedule is hereby GR Respondent's February 3, 2021 B all file a Reply Brief within 14 da is hereby directed to list this matter for Equity Forward	y, May 10, 2021 CONTINUED. In ANTED. Designated rief within 14 days ays of service of Dor the next available and Designated Petitio	for Continuance, the at 9:30 a.m. in the addition, the parties Petitioners shall file of entry of this Order esignated Petitioners rgument list.
May 17, 2021 Document Name:	Amended Order AND NOW, this 3rd day of Mapplication is GRANTED. The above-captioned matter via We request for entry of the stipulate a Response Brief to Designated and Designated Respondent share Response Brief. The Prothonotary Memorandum of Law Filed Mutchler, Terry Lee Mutchler, Terry Lee	e argument scheduled for Monday bebEx videoconference is hereby of ed briefing schedule is hereby GR Respondent's February 3, 2021 B all file a Reply Brief within 14 da is hereby directed to list this matter for Equity Forward Carter, Mary Alice tioners Equity Forward and Mary Alice	y, May 10, 2021 CONTINUED. In ANTED. Designated rief within 14 days ays of service of D or the next available a Designated Petitio Designated Petitio	for Continuance, the at 9:30 a.m. in the addition, the parties Petitioners shall file of entry of this Order esignated Petitioners rgument list.
May 17, 2021 Document Name:	Amended Order AND NOW, this 3rd day of Mapplication is GRANTED. The above-captioned matter via We request for entry of the stipulate a Response Brief to Designated and Designated Respondent sha Response Brief. The Prothonotary Memorandum of Law Filed Mutchler, Terry Lee Mutchler, Terry Lee Response Brief of Designated Petitof Designated Respondent's Real of Tentative Session Date Krimmel, Michael	e argument scheduled for Monday bebEx videoconference is hereby of ed briefing schedule is hereby GR Respondent's February 3, 2021 B all file a Reply Brief within 14 da is hereby directed to list this matter for Equity Forward Carter, Mary Alice tioners Equity Forward and Mary Alice	y, May 10, 2021 CONTINUED. In ANTED. Designated rief within 14 days ays of service of D or the next available a Designated Petitio Designated Petitio	for Continuance, the at 9:30 a.m. in the addition, the parties' Petitioners shall file of entry of this Order esignated Petitioners' irgument list.

Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

Commonwealth Docket Sheet
Docket Number: 1002 CD 2020

Page 5 of 6

December 23, 2025



DOCKET ENTRY			
	Participant Type Exit Date		
•			
	io Judicial Cantar Harrishura		
• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •	la Judicial Center, Harrisburg		
	11/17/2021		
	A		
unopposed Emergency Application for Relief Seeking Continua Thursday, November 18, 2021 at 9:30 a.m/1:00 p.m. is hereby Gavailable list.	nce for Oral Argument scheduled for RANTED and is continued until the ne		
<u> </u>	e list.		
•			
March 2022			
Argument Scheduled			
Krimmel, Michael			
Monday, March 7, 2022, 11:30 a.m. (Panel) CR 3001, Pennsylvania Jud	licial Center, Harrisburg		
No. 19 & 19a on the list.			
Affirmed	07/19/2022		
Fizzano Cannon, Christine			
Opinion (30 pages)			
opilion (ee pages)			
AND NOW, this 19th day of July, 2022, the September 11, 2020	· ·		
AND NOW, this 19th day of July, 2022, the September 11, 2020 Records is AFFIRMED. Judge Cohn Jubelirer and Wallace did not particle.	· ·		
AND NOW, this 19th day of July, 2022, the September 11, 2020 Records is AFFIRMED. Judge Cohn Jubelirer and Wallace did not partition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Filed	cipate in the decision.		
AND NOW, this 19th day of July, 2022, the September 11, 2020 Records is AFFIRMED. Judge Cohn Jubelirer and Wallace did not partition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Filed Carter, Mary Alice	cipate in the decision . Designated Petitioner		
AND NOW, this 19th day of July, 2022, the September 11, 2020 Records is AFFIRMED. Judge Cohn Jubelirer and Wallace did not partition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Filed Carter, Mary Alice Equity Forward	cipate in the decision.		
AND NOW, this 19th day of July, 2022, the September 11, 2020 Records is AFFIRMED. Judge Cohn Jubelirer and Wallace did not partition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Filed Carter, Mary Alice Equity Forward 355 MAL 2022	cipate in the decision . Designated Petitioner		
AND NOW, this 19th day of July, 2022, the September 11, 2020 Records is AFFIRMED. Judge Cohn Jubelirer and Wallace did not partition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Filed Carter, Mary Alice Equity Forward 355 MAL 2022 355 MAL 2022	cipate in the decision . Designated Petitioner		
AND NOW, this 19th day of July, 2022, the September 11, 2020 Records is AFFIRMED. Judge Cohn Jubelirer and Wallace did not particle Petition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Filed Carter, Mary Alice Equity Forward 355 MAL 2022 Petition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Filed	Designated Petitioner Designated Petitioner		
AND NOW, this 19th day of July, 2022, the September 11, 2020 Records is AFFIRMED. Judge Cohn Jubelirer and Wallace did not partition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Filed Carter, Mary Alice Equity Forward 355 MAL 2022 Petition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Filed Real Alternatives, Inc.	cipate in the decision . Designated Petitioner		
AND NOW, this 19th day of July, 2022, the September 11, 2020 Records is AFFIRMED. Judge Cohn Jubelirer and Wallace did not particle Petition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Filed Carter, Mary Alice Equity Forward 355 MAL 2022 Petition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Filed Real Alternatives, Inc. 378 MAL 2022	Designated Petitioner Designated Petitioner		
AND NOW, this 19th day of July, 2022, the September 11, 2020 Records is AFFIRMED. Judge Cohn Jubelirer and Wallace did not partition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Filed Carter, Mary Alice Equity Forward 355 MAL 2022 Petition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Filed Real Alternatives, Inc.	Designated Petitioner Designated Petitioner		
AND NOW, this 19th day of July, 2022, the September 11, 2020 Records is AFFIRMED. Judge Cohn Jubelirer and Wallace did not particle Petition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Filed Carter, Mary Alice Equity Forward 355 MAL 2022 355 MAL 2022 Petition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Filed Real Alternatives, Inc. 378 MAL 2022 Order Denying Petition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court	Designated Petitioner Designated Petitioner		
AND NOW, this 19th day of July, 2022, the September 11, 2020 Records is AFFIRMED. Judge Cohn Jubelirer and Wallace did not particle Petition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Filed Carter, Mary Alice Equity Forward 355 MAL 2022 355 MAL 2022 Petition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Filed Real Alternatives, Inc. 378 MAL 2022 Order Denying Petition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Per Curiam	Designated Petitioner Designated Petitioner Designated Petitioner Designated Respondent		
AND NOW, this 19th day of July, 2022, the September 11, 2020 Records is AFFIRMED. Judge Cohn Jubelirer and Wallace did not particle Petition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Filed Carter, Mary Alice Equity Forward 355 MAL 2022 355 MAL 2022 Petition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Filed Real Alternatives, Inc. 378 MAL 2022 Order Denying Petition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Per Curiam 355 & 378 MAL 2022	Designated Petitioner Designated Petitioner Designated Petitioner Designated Respondent		
AND NOW, this 19th day of July, 2022, the September 11, 2020 Records is AFFIRMED. Judge Cohn Jubelirer and Wallace did not particle Petition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Filed Carter, Mary Alice Equity Forward 355 MAL 2022 355 MAL 2022 Petition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Filed Real Alternatives, Inc. 378 MAL 2022 Order Denying Petition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Per Curiam	Designated Petitioner Designated Petitioner Designated Petitioner Designated Respondent		
AND NOW, this 19th day of July, 2022, the September 11, 2020 Records is AFFIRMED. Judge Cohn Jubelirer and Wallace did not particle Petition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Filed Carter, Mary Alice Equity Forward 355 MAL 2022 355 MAL 2022 Petition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Filed Real Alternatives, Inc. 378 MAL 2022 Order Denying Petition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Per Curiam 355 & 378 MAL 2022	Designated Petitioner Designated Petitioner Designated Petitioner Designated Respondent		
AND NOW, this 19th day of July, 2022, the September 11, 2020 Records is AFFIRMED. Judge Cohn Jubelirer and Wallace did not particle Petition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Filed Carter, Mary Alice Equity Forward 355 MAL 2022 Petition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Filed Real Alternatives, Inc. 378 MAL 2022 Order Denying Petition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Per Curiam 355 & 378 MAL 2022 378 MAL 2022	Designated Petitioner Designated Petitioner Designated Petitioner Designated Respondent		
AND NOW, this 19th day of July, 2022, the September 11, 2020 Records is AFFIRMED. Judge Cohn Jubelirer and Wallace did not particle Petition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Filed Carter, Mary Alice Equity Forward 355 MAL 2022 S55 MAL 2022 Petition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Filed Real Alternatives, Inc. 378 MAL 2022 Order Denying Petition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Per Curiam 355 & 378 MAL 2022 Remitted	Designated Petitioner Designated Petitioner Designated Petitioner Designated Respondent		
AND NOW, this 19th day of July, 2022, the September 11, 2020 Records is AFFIRMED. Judge Cohn Jubelirer and Wallace did not particle Petition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Filed Carter, Mary Alice Equity Forward 355 MAL 2022 September 12, 2022 Petition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Filed Real Alternatives, Inc. 378 MAL 2022 September 19, 2022 September 2022 Remitted Commonwealth Court Filing	Designated Petitioner Designated Petitioner Designated Petitioner Designated Respondent		
	The Prothonotary is directed to schedule the matter for the next available Tentative Session Date Krimmel, Michael March 2022 Argument Scheduled Krimmel, Michael Monday, March 7, 2022, 11:30 a.m. (Panel) CR 3001, Pennsylvania Juc No. 19 & 19a on the list. Affirmed Fizzano Cannon, Christine		

12:01 A.M. Sealed Documents

Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

Docket Number: 1002 CD 2020

Commonwealth Docket Sheet

Page 6 of 6

December 23, 2025



SESSION INFORMATION

Journal Number: 19a-03-2022

Consideration Type: Oral Argument - Panel

Listed/Submitted Date: March 7, 2022

Panel Composition:

Judge The Honorable Anne E. Covey The Honorable Christine Fizzano Cannon Judge Senior Judge The Honorable Bonnie Brigance Leadbetter

DISPOSITION INFORMATION

Final Disposition:

Yes

Related Journal No: Judgment Date:

Decided Category: Disposition Author: Fizzano Cannon, Christine

Disposition: Affirmed Disposition Date: July 19, 2022

Disposition Comment: AND NOW, this 19th day of July, 2022, the September 11, 2020 final determination of the Office of Open

Records is AFFIRMED. Judge Cohn Jubelirer and Wallace did not participate in the decision.

Fizzano Cannon, Christine Dispositional Filing: **Opinion** Filing Author:

Filed Date: 7/19/2022 12:00:00AM

Dispositional Filing: **Dissenting Opinion** Filing Author: Leadbetter, Bonnie Brigance

Filed Date: 7/19/2022 12:00:00AM