

## Commonwealth Docket Sheet

Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

Docket Number: 1002 CD 2020

Page 1 of 6

April 5, 2026



## CAPTION

Equity Forward and  
Mary Alice Carter,  
Petitioners

v.

Pennsylvania Department of  
Human Services (Office of  
Open Records),  
Respondent

## CASE INFORMATION

Initiating Document: Petition for Review

Case Status: Closed

Case Processing Status: July 19, 2022 Completed

Journal Number: 19a-03-2022

Case Category: Administrative Agency Case Type(s): Right to Know Act

## CONSOLIDATED CASES

## RELATED CASES

| Docket No / Reason                   | Type         | Docket No / Reason                 | Type    |
|--------------------------------------|--------------|------------------------------------|---------|
| 986 CD 2020<br>Ct Order - Sua Sponte | Consolidated | 225 CD 2018<br>Appeal After Remand | Related |

## COUNSEL INFORMATION

## Designated Petitioner Equity Forward

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Mutchler, Terry Lee  
Address: Dilworth Paxson LLP  
1500 Market Street  
Philadelphia, PA 19103  
Phone No: (215) 575-7034

Fax No:

## Designated Petitioner Carter, Mary Alice

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Mutchler, Terry Lee  
Address: Dilworth Paxson LLP  
1500 Market Street  
Philadelphia, PA 19103  
Phone No: (215) 575-7034

Fax No:



## Commonwealth Docket Sheet

Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

Docket Number: 1002 CD 2020

Page 3 of 6

April 5, 2026



## ORIGINAL RECORD CONTENT

| Original Record Item | Filed Date        | Content Description |
|----------------------|-------------------|---------------------|
| Agency Record        | November 25, 2020 |                     |
| Supplemental Record  | December 01, 2020 |                     |

Date of Remand of Record: February 16, 2023

## BRIEFING SCHEDULE

None

None

## DOCKET ENTRY

| Filed Date               | Docket Entry / Filer   | Representing                         | Participant Type                               | Exit Date  |
|--------------------------|--|--------------------------------------|--|------------|
| <b>October 13, 2020</b>  | Petition for Review Filed<br>Carter, Mary Alice<br>Equity Forward  |                                      | Designated Petitioner<br>Designated Petitioner |            |
| <b>October 19, 2020</b>  | Application for Intervention (Pa.R.A.P. 1531b)<br>Voss, Joshua John<br>Document Name: Unopposed Application for Intervention by Real Alternatives  | Real Alternatives, Inc.              | Designated Respondent                          |            |
| <b>October 21, 2020</b>  | Notice Exited<br>Commonwealth Court Filing<br>Office   |                                      |  | 10/21/2020 |
| <b>October 22, 2020</b>  | Order Granting Application for Intervention<br>Per Curiam<br>Document Name: upon consideration of the "Unopposed Application To Intervene by Real Alternatives,"<br>Comment: and it appearing that Real Alternatives was a participant in the administrative proceedings that led to the Order of the Office of Open Records giving rise to this petition for review, the Application is GRANTED. Real Alternatives shall proceed as a party principally aligned with Respondent Department of Human Services. |                                      |  | 10/22/2020 |
| <b>October 30, 2020</b>  | Docketing Statement Filed<br>Mutchler, Terry Lee<br>Mutchler, Terry Lee  | Equity Forward<br>Carter, Mary Alice | Designated Petitioner<br>Designated Petitioner |            |
| <b>November 25, 2020</b> | Agency Record Received<br>Office of Open Records<br>Document Name: See Briefing Schedule at 986 CD 2020  |                                      |  |            |
| <b>November 25, 2020</b> | Briefing Schedule Issued<br>Commonwealth Court Filing<br>Office  |                                      |  |            |
| <b>December 1, 2020</b>  | Sealed Supplemental Record<br>Office of Open Records<br>Document Name: Sealed Program Development and Advancement Agreement.   |                                      |  |            |
| <b>December 3, 2020</b>  | Order Sua Sponte for Consolidation<br>Per Curiam<br>Document Name: NOW, December 3, 2020, the above-captioned matters are hereby consolidated.<br>Comment: Equity Forward and Mary Alice Carter are Designated Petitioners under Pa. R.A.P. 2136. The briefing schedule previously issued at No. 1002 C.D. 2020 remains in effect for these consolidated matters. All further filings in these consolidated matters shall be captioned as set forth above.   |                                      |  | 12/03/2020 |

## Commonwealth Docket Sheet

## Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

Docket Number: 1002 CD 2020

Page 4 of 6

April 5, 2026



## DOCKET ENTRY

| Filed Date              | Docket Entry / Filer  | Representing  | Participant Type   | Exit Date  |
|-------------------------|---|---|--|------------|
| <b>January 25, 2021</b> | Entry of Appearance<br>Zimmer, Samantha G.<br>Document Name: Atty. Zimmer for Real Alternatives   | Real Alternatives, Inc.   | Designated Respondent  |            |
| <b>March 3, 2021</b>    | Tentative Session Date<br>Krimmel, Michael<br>Document Name: May 2021   |   |  |            |
| <b>April 7, 2021</b>    | Argument Scheduled<br>Krimmel, Michael<br>Document Name: MONDAY, May 10, 2021 (Panel 2) @9:30 a.m. via WebEx Video Conference (No. 11 & 11a on the list)  |   |  |            |
| <b>April 27, 2021</b>   | Filed - Other<br>Mutchler, Terry Lee<br>Mutchler, Terry Lee   | Equity Forward<br>Carter, Mary Alice  | Designated Petitioner<br>Designated Petitioner   |            |
| <b>April 27, 2021</b>   | Application for Continuance<br>Mutchler, Terry Lee<br>Mutchler, Terry Lee<br>Cohan, Marisa Lynn<br>Voss, Joshua John<br>Document Name: Jt. Motion for Continuance   | Equity Forward<br>Carter, Mary Alice<br>Department of Human Services<br>Real Alternatives, Inc. | Designated Petitioner<br>Designated Petitioner<br>Designated Respondent<br>Designated Respondent |            |
| <b>April 30, 2021</b>   | Argument Continued<br>Per Curiam<br>Document Name: Application for Continuance Granted<br>Comment: AND NOW, this 30th day of April, 2021, upon consideration of the Joint Motion for Continuance, the application is GRANTED. The argument scheduled for Monday, May 10, 2021 at 9:30 a.m. on the above-captioned matter via WebEx videoconference is hereby CONTINUED. The prothonotary is hereby directed to list this matter for the next available argument list.   |   |  |            |
| <b>May 3, 2021</b>      | Amended<br>Per Curiam<br>Document Name: Amended Order<br>Comment: AND NOW, this 3rd day of May, 2021, upon consideration of the Joint Motion for Continuance, the application is GRANTED. The argument scheduled for Monday, May 10, 2021 at 9:30 a.m. in the above-captioned matter via WebEx videoconference is hereby CONTINUED. In addition, the parties' request for entry of the stipulated briefing schedule is hereby GRANTED. Designated Petitioners shall file a Response Brief to Designated Respondent's February 3, 2021 Brief within 14 days of entry of this Order and Designated Respondent shall file a Reply Brief within 14 days of service of Designated Petitioners' Response Brief. The Prothonotary is hereby directed to list this matter for the next available argument list. |   |  | 05/03/2021 |
| <b>May 17, 2021</b>     | Memorandum of Law Filed<br>Mutchler, Terry Lee<br>Mutchler, Terry Lee<br>Document Name: Response Brief of Designated Petitioners Equity Forward and Mary Alice Carter to Brief<br>Comment: of Designated Respondent's Real Alternatives   | Equity Forward<br>Carter, Mary Alice  | Designated Petitioner<br>Designated Petitioner   |            |
| <b>June 30, 2021</b>    | Tentative Session Date<br>Krimmel, Michael<br>Document Name: November 2021  |   |  |            |

## Commonwealth Docket Sheet

## Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

Docket Number: 1002 CD 2020

Page 5 of 6

April 5, 2026



## DOCKET ENTRY

| Filed Date               | Docket Entry / Filer  | Representing | Participant Type                               | Exit Date  |
|--------------------------|---|--------------|--|------------|
| <b>October 20, 2021</b>  | Argument Scheduled<br>Krimmel, Michael<br>Document Name: Thursday, November 18, 2021, 9:30 a.m. (Panel) CR 5001, Pennsylvania Judicial Center, Harrisburg<br>Comment: No. 38 & 38a on the list.   |              |  |            |
| <b>November 17, 2021</b> | Argument Continued<br>Per Curiam<br>Document Name: Order Granting Application for Continuance/ Continued to Next Available Argument List<br>Comment: AND NOW, this 17th day of November, 2021, Petitioners', Equity Forward and Mary Alice Carter, unopposed Emergency Application for Relief Seeking Continuance for Oral Argument scheduled for Thursday, November 18, 2021 at 9:30 a.m/1:00 p.m. is hereby GRANTED and is continued until the next available list.<br>The Prothonotary is directed to schedule the matter for the next available list. |              |  | 11/17/2021 |
| <b>December 27, 2021</b> | Tentative Session Date<br>Krimmel, Michael<br>Document Name: March 2022   |              |  |            |
| <b>January 28, 2022</b>  | Argument Scheduled<br>Krimmel, Michael<br>Document Name: Monday, March 7, 2022, 11:30 a.m. (Panel) CR 3001, Pennsylvania Judicial Center, Harrisburg<br>Comment: No. 19 & 19a on the list.  |              |  |            |
| <b>July 19, 2022</b>     | Affirmed<br>Fizzano Cannon, Christine<br>Document Name: Opinion (30 pages)<br>Comment: AND NOW, this 19th day of July, 2022, the September 11, 2020 final determination of the Office of Open Records is AFFIRMED. Judge Cohn Jubelirer and Wallace did not participate in the decision.  |              |  | 07/19/2022 |
| <b>August 18, 2022</b>   | Petition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Filed<br>Carter, Mary Alice<br>Equity Forward<br>Document Name: 355 MAL 2022<br>Comment: 355 MAL 2022  |              | Designated Petitioner<br>Designated Petitioner |            |
| <b>September 1, 2022</b> | Petition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Filed<br>Real Alternatives, Inc.<br>Document Name: 378 MAL 2022<br>Comment: 378 MAL 2022   |              | Designated Respondent                          |            |
| <b>January 23, 2023</b>  | Order Denying Petition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court<br>Per Curiam<br>Document Name: 355 & 378 MAL 2022<br>Comment: 378 MAL 2022  |              |  | 01/24/2023 |
| <b>February 16, 2023</b> | Remitted<br>Commonwealth Court Filing<br>Office   |              |  |            |
| <b>February 21, 2023</b> | Acknowledgement of Record Remittal<br>Office of Open Records  |              |  |            |

## Commonwealth Docket Sheet

Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

Docket Number: 1002 CD 2020

Page 6 of 6

April 5, 2026



## SESSION INFORMATION

Journal Number: 19a-03-2022  
 Consideration Type: Oral Argument - Panel  
 Listed/Submitted Date: March 7, 2022

## Panel Composition:

|  |              |
|--|--------------|
| The Honorable Anne E. Covey              | Judge        |
| The Honorable Christine Fizzano Cannon   | Judge        |
| The Honorable Bonnie Brigance Leadbetter | Senior Judge |

## DISPOSITION INFORMATION

|                       |  |                     |                             |
|-----------------------|--|---------------------|-----------------------------|
| Final Disposition:    | Yes  | Judgment Date:      |                             |
| Related Journal No:   |  | Disposition Author: | Fizzano Cannon, Christine   |
| Category:             | Decided  | Disposition Date:   | July 19, 2022               |
| Disposition:          | Affirmed   |                     |                             |
| Disposition Comment:  | AND NOW, this 19th day of July, 2022, the September 11, 2020 final determination of the Office of Open Records is AFFIRMED. Judge Cohn Jubelirer and Wallace did not participate in the decision . |                     |                             |
| Dispositional Filing: | <b>Opinion</b>   | Filing Author:      | Fizzano Cannon, Christine   |
| Filed Date:           | 7/19/2022 12:00:00AM   |                     |                             |
| Dispositional Filing: | <b>Dissenting Opinion</b>  | Filing Author:      | Leadbetter, Bonnie Brigance |
| Filed Date:           | 7/19/2022 12:00:00AM   |                     |                             |