

Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 9 MAP 2022

Page 1 of 12

November 9, 2025

CAPTION

Carol Ann Carter, Monica Parrilla, Rebecca Poyourow, William Tung, Roseanne Milazzo, Burt Siegel, Susan Cassanelli, Lee Cassanelli, Lynn Wachman, Michael Guttman, Maya Fonkeu, Brady Hill, Mary Ellen Balchunis, Tom DeWall, Stephanie McNulty and Janet Temin

٧.

Leigh M. Chapman, in her official capacity as the Acting Secretary of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania; Jessica Mathis, in her official capacity as Director for the Pennsylvania Bureau of Election Services and Notaries

Appeal of: Haroon Bashir, Valerie Biancaniello, Tegwyn Hughes, and Jeffrey Wenk, Possible Intervenors

CASE INFORMATION

Initiating Document: Notice of Appeal

Case Status: Closed

Journal Number:

Case Category: Election Case Type(s): Redistricting

cc	NSOLIDATED CASES		RELATED CASES	
Docket No / Reason	Туре	Docket No / Reason	Туре	
10 MAP 2022 Sua Sponte	Consolidated	141 MM 2021 Same Record Below	Related	
		Carter, C. et al, Pets v. Degraffenreid, V. et al.		
		142 MM 2021 Same Record Below	Related	
		Gressman et al., Pet.	v. Degraffenreid et al.	
		5 MAP 2022 Same Record Below	Related	
		Carter, C. et al v. Chapman, L. et al.		
		6 MAP 2022 Same Record Below	Related	
		Gressman et al. v. Ch	apman, L. et al.	
		10 MAP 2022 Same Record Below	Related	
		Gressman et al. v. Ch	apman, L. et al.	
		11 MAP 2022 Same Record Below	Related	
		Carter, C. et al v. Cha	pman, L. et al; Apl: Osche	
		12 MAP 2022 Same Record Below	Related	
		Gressman et al. v. Ch	apman, L. et al.; Apl: Osche	
		7 MM 2022 Same Record Below Carter, C. et al, Pets.	Related	

COUNSEL INFORMATION



Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 9 MAP 2022

Page 2 of 12

November 9, 2025

COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Gallagher, Kathleen A.

Gallagher Giancola LLC

Address: 436 Seventh Ave 31st FI

Pittsburgh, PA 15219

Phone No: (412) 717-1920

Receive Mail: Yes

Representing: Haroon Bashir, Valerie Biancaniello, Tegwyn Hughes, and Jeffrey Wenk, Appellant

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Giancola, Russell David

Gallagher Giancola LLC

Address: 436 Seventh Ave FI 31

Pittsburgh, PA 15219

Phone No: (412) 717-1900

Receive Mail: Yes

Representing: Haroon Bashir, Valerie Biancaniello, Tegwyn Hughes, and Jeffrey Wenk, Appellant

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Duffy, Jeffry William

Baker & Hostetler, LLP

Address: 1735 Market St Ste 3300

Philadelphia, PA 19103-7501

Phone No: (215) 564-2916

Receive Mail: Yes

Representing: Benninghoff, Kerry, Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Representing: Cutler, Bryan, Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Greenberg, Kevin Michael

Greenberg Traurig, LLP

Address: 1717 Arch St Ste 400

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (215) 988-7800

Receive Mail: Yes

Representing: Maria Collett, et al, Appellee

Pro Se: No



Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 9 MAP 2022

Page 3 of 12

November 9, 2025

COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Hill, John Brent

Hangley, Aronchick, Segal, Pudlin & Schiller

Address: 1 Logan Sq Fl 27

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (215) 496-7049

Receive Mail: Yes

Representing: Chapman, Leigh M., Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Holtzman, Anthony Richard

K & L Gates LLP

Address: 17 N 2ND St 18th FI

Harrisburg, PA 17101-1507

Phone No: (717) 231-4500

Receive Mail: Yes

Representing: Corman, Jake, Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Representing: Ward, Kim, Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Kotula, Kathleen Marie

Pennsylvania Department of State

Address: Bureau of Commissions, Elections

306 N Office Bldg 401 North St

Harrisburg, PA 17120-0500

Phone No: (717) 783-1657

Receive Mail: Yes

Representing: Bureau of Elections, Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Rogers, Edward David

Ballard Spahr, LLP

Address: 1735 Market St FI 51

Philadelphia, PA 19103-7599

Phone No: (610) 246-4701

Receive Mail: Yes

Representing: Carol Ann Carter, et al., Appellee

Pro Se: No



Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 9 MAP 2022

Page 4 of 12

November 9, 2025

COUNSEL INFORMATION

Salkowski, Matthew S. Attorney:

Pennsylvania House of Representatives

Address: House Democratic Caucus Ogc

620 Main Capitol Building

Harrisburg, PA 17111

Phone No: (717) 787-3002

Receive Mail: Yes

Representing: McClinton, Joanna, Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Voss, Joshua John Attorney:

Kleinbard LLC

Address: 1717 Arch St FI 5th

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (267) 443-4114

Receive Mail: Yes

Representing: Guy Reschenthaler, Jeffrey Varner, Tom Marino, Ryan Costello, Bud Shuster (Congressional

Intervenor), Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Wiygul, Robert Andrew Attorney:

Hangley, Aronchick, Segal, Pudlin & Schiller

Address: 18TH Cherry Sts FI 27

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (215) 496-7042

Receive Mail: Yes

Representing: Chapman, Leigh M., Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Representing: Wolf, Tom, Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Woods, Corrie Allen Attorney:

Woods Law Offices PLLC

Address: 200 Commerce Dr Ste 210

Moon Township, PA 15108

Phone No: (412) 329-7751

Receive Mail: Yes

Receive EMail: Yes

Representing: Jay Costa, et al., Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Neither the Appellate Courts nor the Administrative Office of Pennsylvania Courts assumes any liability for inaccurate or delayed data, errors or omissions on the docket sheets.

Email:



Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 9 MAP 2022

Page 5 of 12

November 9, 2025

COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Attisano, Marco Santino

Flannery Georgalis, LLC

Address: 707 Grant St Ste 2750

Pittsburgh, PA 15219

Phone No: (412) 438-8209

Receive Mail: Yes

Representing: Jay Costa, et al., Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Clark, Robert Joseph

Ballard Spahr, LLP

Address: 1735 Market St Fl 51

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (215) 864-8659

Receive Mail: Yes

Representing: Carol Ann Carter, et al., Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Enerson, Caleb Curtis

Pennsylvania Office of Attorney General, 16th Floor, Strawberry Square, Harrisburg, PA

Address: Pa Office Of Attorney General

Strawberry Sq Fl 15 Harrisburg, PA 17120

Phone No: (717) 705-5774

Receive Mail: Yes

Representing: Chapman, Leigh M., Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Haverstick, Matthew Hermann

Address: Kleinbard LLC

Three Logan Square 1717 Arch St FI 5 Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (215) 568-2000

Receive Mail: Yes

Representing: Guy Reschenthaler, Jeffrey Varner, Tom Marino, Ryan Costello, Bud Shuster (Congressional

Intervenor), Appellee

Pro Se: No



Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 9 MAP 2022

Page 6 of 12

November 9, 2025

COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Levine, Clifford B.

Dentons Cohen Grigsby

Address: 625 Liberty Ave; 5th floor

Pittsburgh, PA 15222

Phone No: (412) 297-4998

Receive Mail: Yes

Representing: Maria Collett, et al, Appellee

Pro Se:

IFP Status:

Mann, James Guthrie Attorney:

Pennsylvania House of Representatives

Address: Ste B 6 Main Capitol

Po Box 202228

Harrisburg, PA 17120-2228

Phone No: (717) 783-1510

Receive Mail: Yes

Representing: Benninghoff, Kerry, Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Representing: Cutler, Bryan, Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Mavroudis, Dimitrios Attorney:

Address: Tucker Law Group

> 1801 Market St Ste 2500 Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (215) 982-2280

Receive Mail: Yes

Receive EMail: Yes

Representing: Chapman, Leigh M., Appellee

Pro Se:

IFP Status:

Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Representing: Wolf, Tom, Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Email:



Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 9 MAP 2022

Page 7 of 12

November 9, 2025

COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: McDonald, Michael R.

Ballard Spahr LLP

Address: 1735 Market St FI 51

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (215) 864-8425

Receive Mail: Yes

Receive EMail: Yes Email:

Representing: Carol Ann Carter, et al., Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Ort, Paul Keller

Ballard Spahr, LLP

Address: 1735 Market St FI 51

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (215) 864-8287

Receive Mail: Yes

Representing: Carol Ann Carter, et al., Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Pratt, Anthony Michael

Greenberg Traurig, LLP

Address: 1717 Arch St Ste 400

Philadelphia, PA 19103-2799

Phone No: (215) 972-5916

Receive Mail: Yes

Representing: Maria Collett, et al, Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Pratt, Marcel S.

Ballard Spahr LLP

Address: 1735 Market St 51st Fl

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (215) 864-8506

Receive Mail: Yes

Representing: Carol Ann Carter, et al., Appellee

Pro Se: No



Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 9 MAP 2022

Page 8 of 12

November 9, 2025

COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Rice, Caroline Layne

Hangley, Aronchick, Segal, Pudlin & Schiller

Address: Hangley Aronchick Segal

1 Logan Sq Fl 27

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (215) 496-7032

Receive Mail: Yes

Representing: Chapman, Leigh M., Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Representing: Wolf, Tom, Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Rickabaugh, Jessica Ann

Tucker Law Group, LLC

Address: 1801 Market St Ste 2500

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (215) 875-0609

Receive Mail: Yes

Representing: Chapman, Leigh M., Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Representing: Wolf, Tom, Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Senoff, David Samuel

Address: First Law Strategy Group LLC

121 S Broad St Ste 300 Philadelphia, PA 19107

(215) 258-4700

Receive Mail: Yes

Representing: McClinton, Joanna, Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Phone No:

Neither the Appellate Courts nor the Administrative Office of Pennsylvania Courts assumes any liability

for inaccurate or delayed data, errors or omissions on the docket sheets.



Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 9 MAP 2022

Page 9 of 12

November 9, 2025

COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Shoucair, Emma Frances Elizabeth

Dentons Cohen & Grigsby PC

Address: 625 Liberty Ave

Pittsburgh, PA 15222

Phone No: (412) 417-1889

Receive Mail: Yes

Representing: Maria Collett, et al, Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Truong, Lam Dang

Pennsylvania House of Representatives

Address: Office of Chief Counsel

620 Main Capital Bldg Harrisburg, PA 17120

Phone No: (717) 787-3002

Receive Mail: Yes

Representing: McClinton, Joanna, Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Tucker, Joe H., Jr.

Tucker Law Group, LLC

Address: 1801 Market Ste Ste 2500

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (215) 875-0609

Receive Mail: Yes

Representing: Chapman, Leigh M., Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Representing: Wolf, Tom, Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Vaitl, Jonathan Richard

K & L Gates LLP

Address: 17 N Second St FI 18

Harrisburg, PA 17101-1507

Phone No: (717) 231-5830

Receive Mail: Yes

Representing: Corman, Jake, Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Representing: Ward, Kim, Appellee

Pro Se: No



Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 9 MAP 2022

Page 10 of 12

November 9, 2025

COUNSEL INFORMATION

Vance, Shohin Hadizadeh Attorney:

Address: Kleinbard LLC

> Three Logan Square 1717 Arch St 5th FI Philadelphia, PA 19103

(215) 568-2000 Phone No:

Receive Mail: Yes

Representing: Guy Reschenthaler, Jeffrey Varner, Tom Marino, Ryan Costello, Bud Shuster (Congressional

Intervenor), Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Zimmer, Samantha G. Attorney:

Address: Kleinbard LLC

> Three Logan Square 1717 Arch St 5th FI Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (215) 568-2000

Receive Mail:

Representing: Guy Reschenthaler, Jeffrey Varner, Tom Marino, Ryan Costello, Bud Shuster (Congressional

Intervenor), Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

SUPREME COURT INFORMATION

the Order of the Commonwealth Court at No. 464 MD 2021 dated January Appeal From:

14, 2022 denying intervenor status.

Appeal Filed Below: 1/24/2022 12:00:00AM

Probable Jurisdiction Noted: January 28, 2022 Docketed Date: January 25, 2022

Allocatur/Miscellaneous Granted: Allocatur/Miscellaneous Docket No.:

Allocatur/Miscellaneous Grant Order:

FEE INFORMATION

Fee Dt	Fee Name	Fee Amt	Receipt Dt	Receipt No	Receipt Amt
01/24/2022	Notice of Appeal	90.25	01/26/2022	2022-SUP-M-000243	180.50

INTERMEDIATE APPELLATE COURT INFORMATION

Court Name: Docket Number:

Date of Order: Rearg/Recon Disp Date:

Rearg/Recon Disposition:

Judge(s):

Intermediate Appellate Court Action:

Referring Court:

AGENCY/TRIAL COURT INFORMATION



Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 9 MAP 2022

Page 11 of 12

November 9, 2025

Court Below: Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

County: Division: Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: January 14, 2022

Docket Number: 464 MD 2021

Judge(s): McCullough, Patricia OTN:

Order Type: Order

ORIGINAL RECORD CONTENT

Original Record Item Filed Date Content/Description

Record Remittal:

DISPOSITION INFORMATION

Related Journal No: Judgment Date: January 28, 2022

Category: Decided Disposition Author: Per Curiam

Disposition: Affirmed Disposition Date: January 28, 2022

Dispositional Filing: Order Author: Per Curiam

Filed Date: January 28, 2022

	D	OCKET ENTRY		
Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By	
January 24, 2022	Notice of Appeal			
		Appellant	Haroon Bashir, Valerie Biancaniello, Tegwyn Hughes, and Jeffrey Wenk	
January 24, 2022	Jurisdictional Statement			
		Appellant	Haroon Bashir, Valerie Biancaniello, Tegwyn Hughes, and Jeffrey Wenk	
January 25, 2022	No Answer Letter to Notice of Appeal & Jurisdictional Statement			
		Appellee	Maria Collett, et al	
January 25, 2022	No Answer Letter to Notice of Appeal & Jurisdictional Statement			
		Appellee	Guy Reschenthaler, Jeffrey Varner, Tom Marino, Ryan Costello, Bud Shuster (Congressional Intervenor)	
January 25, 2022	No Answer Letter to Notice of Appeal & Jurisdictional Statement			
		Appellee	Khalif Ali, et al	



Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 9 MAP 2022

Page 12 of 12

November 9, 2025

	ם	OCKET ENTRY		
Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By	
January 25, 2022	No Answer Letter to Notice of Appeal & Jurisdictional Statement			
		Appellee	Corman, Jake	
		Appellee	Ward, Kim	
January 25, 2022	No Answer Letter to Notice of Appeal & Jurisdictional Statement			
		Appellee	Chapman, Leigh M.	
		Appellee	Mathis, Jessica	
		Appellee	Wolf, Tom	
January 25, 2022	No Answer Letter to Notice of Appeal & Jurisdictional Statement			
-		Appellee	Carol Ann Carter, et al.	
January 25, 2022	Untimely No Answer Letter to Jurisdictional Statement Received & Returned			
		Appellee	McClinton, Joanna	
Comments: Untimely. Due at 4:0	0 p.m.			
January 28, 2022	Affirmed			
			Per Curiam	

Comments:

AND NOW, this 28th day of January, 2022, probable jurisdiction is NOTED. As Appellants waited ten days to file a notice of appeal from the Commonwealth Court's order denying intervention, and at least one of the case deadlines established by that order has already passed, the Order of the Commonwealth Court is AFFIRMED. Cf. Pa.R.Civ.P. 2329(3) (allowing for denial of intervention if "the petitioner has unduly delayed in making application for intervention or the intervention will unduly delay . . . the trial or the adjudication of the rights of the parties").

January 28, 2022	Judgment Entered	
		Office of the Prothonotary
February 17, 2022	Remitted	
		Office of the Prothonotary