

Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 9 MAP 2022

Page 1 of 12

September 17, 2025

CAPTION

Carol Ann Carter, Monica Parrilla, Rebecca Poyourow, William Tung, Roseanne Milazzo, Burt Siegel, Susan Cassanelli, Lee Cassanelli, Lynn Wachman, Michael Guttman, Maya Fonkeu, Brady Hill, Mary Ellen Balchunis, Tom DeWall, Stephanie McNulty and Janet Temin

v.

Leigh M. Chapman, in her official capacity as the Acting Secretary of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania; Jessica Mathis, in her official capacity as Director for the Pennsylvania Bureau of Election Services and Notaries

Appeal of: Haroon Bashir, Valerie Biancaniello, Tegwyn Hughes, and Jeffrey Wenk, Possible Intervenors

CASE INFORMATION

Initiating Document: Notice of Appeal

Case Status: Closed

Journal Number:

Case Category: Election

Case Type(s): Redistricting

CONSOLIDATED CASES

RELATED CASES

Docket No / Reason	Type	Docket No / Reason	Type
10 MAP 2022	Consolidated	141 MM 2021	Related
Sua Sponte		Same Record Below	
		Carter, C. et al, Pets v. Degraffenreid, V. et al.	
		142 MM 2021	Related
		Same Record Below	
		Gressman et al., Pet. v. Degraffenreid et al.	
		5 MAP 2022	Related
		Same Record Below	
		Carter, C. et al v. Chapman, L. et al.	
		6 MAP 2022	Related
		Same Record Below	
		Gressman et al. v. Chapman, L. et al.	
		10 MAP 2022	Related
		Same Record Below	
		Gressman et al. v. Chapman, L. et al.	
		11 MAP 2022	Related
		Same Record Below	
		Carter, C. et al v. Chapman, L. et al; Apl: Osche	
		12 MAP 2022	Related
		Same Record Below	
		Gressman et al. v. Chapman, L. et al.; Apl: Osche	
		7 MM 2022	Related
		Same Record Below	
		Carter, C. et al, Pets. v. Chapman, L., et al.	

COUNSEL INFORMATION

Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 9 MAP 2022

Page 2 of 12

September 17, 2025

COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Gallagher, Kathleen A.
 Gallagher Giancola LLC
 Address: 436 Seventh Ave 31st Fl
 Pittsburgh, PA 15219
 Phone No: (412) 717-1920
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Haroon Bashir, Valerie Biancaniello, Tegwyn Hughes, and Jeffrey Wenk, Appellant
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Giancola, Russell David
 Gallagher Giancola LLC
 Address: 436 Seventh Ave Fl 31
 Pittsburgh, PA 15219
 Phone No: (412) 717-1900
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Haroon Bashir, Valerie Biancaniello, Tegwyn Hughes, and Jeffrey Wenk, Appellant
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Duffy, Jeffry William
 Baker & Hostetler, LLP
 Address: 1735 Market St Ste 3300
 Philadelphia, PA 19103-7501
 Phone No: (215) 564-2916
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Benninghoff, Kerry, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Cutler, Bryan, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Greenberg, Kevin Michael
 Greenberg Traurig, LLP
 Address: 1717 Arch St Ste 400
 Philadelphia, PA 19103
 Phone No: (215) 988-7800
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Maria Collett, et al, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 9 MAP 2022

Page 3 of 12

September 17, 2025

COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Hill, John Brent
 Hangle, Aronchick, Segal, Pudlin & Schiller
 Address: 1 Logan Sq Fl 27
 Philadelphia, PA 19103
 Phone No: (215) 496-7049
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Chapman, Leigh M., Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Holtzman, Anthony Richard
 K & L Gates LLP
 Address: 17 N 2ND St 18th Fl
 Harrisburg, PA 17101-1507
 Phone No: (717) 231-4500
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Corman, Jake, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Ward, Kim, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Kotula, Kathleen Marie
 Pennsylvania Department of State
 Address: Bureau of Commissions, Elections
 306 N Office Bldg 401 North St
 Harrisburg, PA 17120-0500
 Phone No: (717) 783-1657
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Bureau of Elections, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Rogers, Edward David
 Ballard Spahr, LLP
 Address: 1735 Market St Fl 51
 Philadelphia, PA 19103-7599
 Phone No: (610) 246-4701
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Carol Ann Carter, et al., Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 9 MAP 2022

Page 4 of 12

September 17, 2025

COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Salkowski, Matthew S.
 Pennsylvania House of Representatives
 Address: House Democratic Caucus Ogc
 620 Main Capitol Building
 Harrisburg, PA 17111
 Phone No: (717) 787-3002
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: McClinton, Joanna, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Voss, Joshua John
 Kleinbard LLC
 Address: 1717 Arch St Fl 5th
 Philadelphia, PA 19103
 Phone No: (267) 443-4114
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Guy Reschenthaler, Jeffrey Varner, Tom Marino, Ryan Costello, Bud Shuster (Congressional Intervenor), Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Wiygul, Robert Andrew
 Hangley, Aronchick, Segal, Pudlin & Schiller
 Address: 18TH Cherry Sts Fl 27
 Philadelphia, PA 19103
 Phone No: (215) 496-7042
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Chapman, Leigh M., Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Wolf, Tom, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Woods, Corrie Allen
 Woods Law Offices PLLC
 Address: 200 Commerce Dr Ste 210
 Moon Township, PA 15108
 Phone No: (412) 329-7751
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:
 Representing: Jay Costa, et al., Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 9 MAP 2022

Page 5 of 12

September 17, 2025

COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Attisano, Marco Santino
 Flannery Georgalis, LLC
 Address: 707 Grant St Ste 2750
 Pittsburgh, PA 15219
 Phone No: (412) 438-8209
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Jay Costa, et al., Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Clark, Robert Joseph
 Ballard Spahr, LLP
 Address: 1735 Market St Fl 51
 Philadelphia, PA 19103
 Phone No: (215) 864-8659
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Carol Ann Carter, et al., Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Enerson, Caleb Curtis
 Pennsylvania Office of Attorney General, 16th Floor, Strawberry Square, Harrisburg, PA
 Address: Pa Office Of Attorney General
 Strawberry Sq Fl 15
 Harrisburg, PA 17120
 Phone No: (717) 705-5774
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Chapman, Leigh M., Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Haverstick, Matthew Hermann
 Address: Kleinbard LLC
 Three Logan Square
 1717 Arch St Fl 5
 Philadelphia, PA 19103
 Phone No: (215) 568-2000
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Guy Reschenthaler, Jeffrey Varner, Tom Marino, Ryan Costello, Bud Shuster (Congressional Intervenor), Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 9 MAP 2022

Page 6 of 12

September 17, 2025

COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Levine, Clifford B.
 Dentons Cohen Grigsby
 Address: 625 Liberty Ave; 5th floor
 Pittsburgh, PA 15222
 Phone No: (412) 297-4998
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Maria Collett, et al, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Mann, James Guthrie
 Pennsylvania House of Representatives
 Address: Ste B 6 Main Capitol
 Po Box 202228
 Harrisburg, PA 17120-2228
 Phone No: (717) 783-1510
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Benninghoff, Kerry, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Cutler, Bryan, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Mavroudis, Dimitrios
 Address: Tucker Law Group
 1801 Market St Ste 2500
 Philadelphia, PA 19103
 Phone No: (215) 982-2280
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:
 Representing: Chapman, Leigh M., Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Wolf, Tom, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 9 MAP 2022

Page 7 of 12

September 17, 2025

COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: McDonald, Michael R.
 Ballard Spahr LLP
 Address: 1735 Market St Fl 51
 Philadelphia, PA 19103
 Phone No: (215) 864-8425
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:
 Representing: Carol Ann Carter, et al., Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Ort, Paul Keller
 Ballard Spahr, LLP
 Address: 1735 Market St Fl 51
 Philadelphia, PA 19103
 Phone No: (215) 864-8287
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Carol Ann Carter, et al., Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Pratt, Anthony Michael
 Greenberg Traurig, LLP
 Address: 1717 Arch St Ste 400
 Philadelphia, PA 19103-2799
 Phone No: (215) 972-5916
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Maria Collett, et al, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Pratt, Marcel S.
 Ballard Spahr LLP
 Address: 1735 Market St 51st Fl
 Philadelphia, PA 19103
 Phone No: (215) 864-8506
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Carol Ann Carter, et al., Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 9 MAP 2022

Page 8 of 12

September 17, 2025

COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Rice, Caroline Layne
 Hangle, Aronchick, Segal, Pudlin & Schiller
 Address: Hangle Aronchick Segal
 1 Logan Sq Fl 27
 Philadelphia, PA 19103
 Phone No: (215) 496-7032
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Chapman, Leigh M., Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Wolf, Tom, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Rickabaugh, Jessica Ann
 Tucker Law Group, LLC
 Address: 1801 Market St Ste 2500
 Philadelphia, PA 19103
 Phone No: (215) 875-0609
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Chapman, Leigh M., Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Wolf, Tom, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Senoff, David Samuel
 Address: First Law Strategy Group LLC
 121 S Broad St Ste 300
 Philadelphia, PA 19107
 Phone No: (215) 258-4700
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: McClinton, Joanna, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 9 MAP 2022

Page 9 of 12

September 17, 2025

COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Shoucair, Emma Frances Elizabeth
 Dentons Cohen & Grigsby PC
 Address: 625 Liberty Ave
 Pittsburgh, PA 15222
 Phone No: (412) 417-1889
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Maria Collett, et al, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Truong, Lam Dang
 Pennsylvania House of Representatives
 Address: Office of Chief Counsel
 620 Main Capital Bldg
 Harrisburg, PA 17120
 Phone No: (717) 787-3002
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: McClinton, Joanna, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Tucker, Joe H., Jr.
 Tucker Law Group, LLC
 Address: 1801 Market Ste Ste 2500
 Philadelphia, PA 19103
 Phone No: (215) 875-0609
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Chapman, Leigh M., Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Wolf, Tom, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Vaitl, Jonathan Richard
 K & L Gates LLP
 Address: 17 N Second St Fl 18
 Harrisburg, PA 17101-1507
 Phone No: (717) 231-5830
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Corman, Jake, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Ward, Kim, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 9 MAP 2022

Page 10 of 12

September 17, 2025

COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Vance, Shohin Hadizadeh

Address: Kleinbard LLC
Three Logan Square
1717 Arch St 5th Fl
Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (215) 568-2000

Receive Mail: Yes

Representing: Guy Reschenthaler, Jeffrey Varner, Tom Marino, Ryan Costello, Bud Shuster (Congressional Intervenor), Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Zimmer, Samantha G.

Address: Kleinbard LLC
Three Logan Square
1717 Arch St 5th Fl
Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (215) 568-2000

Receive Mail: Yes

Representing: Guy Reschenthaler, Jeffrey Varner, Tom Marino, Ryan Costello, Bud Shuster (Congressional Intervenor), Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

SUPREME COURT INFORMATION

Appeal From: the order of the Commonwealth Court at No. 464 MD 2021 dated January 14, 2022 denying intervenor status.

Appeal Filed Below: 1/24/2022 12:00:00AM

Probable Jurisdiction Noted: January 28, 2022 Docketed Date: January 25, 2022

Allocatur/Miscellaneous Granted: Allocatur/Miscellaneous Docket No.:

Allocatur/Miscellaneous Grant Order:

FEE INFORMATION

Fee Dt	Fee Name	Fee Amt	Receipt Dt	Receipt No	Receipt Amt
01/24/2022	Notice of Appeal	90.25	01/26/2022	2022-SUP-M-000243	180.50

INTERMEDIATE APPELLATE COURT INFORMATION

Court Name: Docket Number:

Date of Order: Rearg/Recon Disp Date:

 Rearg/Recon Disposition:

Judge(s):

Intermediate Appellate Court Action:

Referring Court:

AGENCY/TRIAL COURT INFORMATION

Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 9 MAP 2022

Page 11 of 12

September 17, 2025

Court Below: Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

County: Division: Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: January 14, 2022

Docket Number: 464 MD 2021

Judge(s): McCullough, Patricia OTN:

Order Type: Order

ORIGINAL RECORD CONTENT

Original Record Item	Filed Date	Content/Description
----------------------	------------	---------------------

Record Remittal:

DISPOSITION INFORMATION

Related Journal No:	Judgment Date:	January 28, 2022
Category: Decided	Disposition Author:	Per Curiam
Disposition: Affirmed	Disposition Date:	January 28, 2022
Dispositional Filing: Order	Author:	Per Curiam
Filed Date:	January 28, 2022	

DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
January 24, 2022	Notice of Appeal	Appellant	Haroon Bashir, Valerie Biancaniello, Tegwyn Hughes, and Jeffrey Wenk
January 24, 2022	Jurisdictional Statement	Appellant	Haroon Bashir, Valerie Biancaniello, Tegwyn Hughes, and Jeffrey Wenk
January 25, 2022	No Answer Letter to Notice of Appeal & Jurisdictional Statement	Appellee	Maria Collett, et al
January 25, 2022	No Answer Letter to Notice of Appeal & Jurisdictional Statement	Appellee	Guy Reschenthaler, Jeffrey Varner, Tom Marino, Ryan Costello, Bud Shuster (Congressional Intervenor)
January 25, 2022	No Answer Letter to Notice of Appeal & Jurisdictional Statement	Appellee	Khalif Ali, et al

Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 9 MAP 2022

Page 12 of 12

September 17, 2025

DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
January 25, 2022	No Answer Letter to Notice of Appeal & Jurisdictional Statement	Appellee Appellee	Corman, Jake Ward, Kim
January 25, 2022	No Answer Letter to Notice of Appeal & Jurisdictional Statement	Appellee Appellee Appellee	Chapman, Leigh M. Mathis, Jessica Wolf, Tom
January 25, 2022	No Answer Letter to Notice of Appeal & Jurisdictional Statement	Appellee	Carol Ann Carter, et al.
January 25, 2022	Untimely No Answer Letter to Jurisdictional Statement Received & Returned	Appellee	McClinton, Joanna
Comments: Untimely. Due at 4:00 p.m.			
January 28, 2022	Affirmed		Per Curiam
Comments: AND NOW, this 28th day of January, 2022, probable jurisdiction is NOTED. As Appellants waited ten days to file a notice of appeal from the Commonwealth Court's order denying intervention, and at least one of the case deadlines established by that order has already passed, the Order of the Commonwealth Court is AFFIRMED. Cf. Pa.R.Civ.P. 2329(3) (allowing for denial of intervention if "the petitioner has unduly delayed in making application for intervention or the intervention will unduly delay . . . the trial or the adjudication of the rights of the parties").			
January 28, 2022	Judgment Entered		Office of the Prothonotary
February 17, 2022	Remitted		Office of the Prothonotary