



## CAPTION

Carol Ann Carter, Monica Parrilla, Rebecca Poyourow, William Tung, Roseanne Milazzo, Burt Siegel, Susan Cassanelli, Lee Cassanelli, Lynn Wachman, Michael Guttman, Maya Fonkeu, Brady Hill, Mary Ellen Balchunis, Tom DeWall, Stephanie McNulty and Janet Temin

v.

Leigh M. Chapman, in her official capacity as the Acting Secretary of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania ; Jessica Mathis, in her official capacity as Director for the Pennsylvania Bureau of Election Services and Notaries

Appeal of: Haroon Bashir, Valerie Biancaniello, Tegwyn Hughes, and Jeffrey Wenk, Possible Intervenors

## CASE INFORMATION

Initiating Document: Notice of Appeal

Case Status: Closed

Journal Number:

Case Category: Election Case Type(s): Redistricting

## CONSOLIDATED CASES

## RELATED CASES

Docket No / Reason	Type	Docket No / Reason	Type
10 MAP 2022 Sua Sponte	Consolidated	141 MM 2021 Same Record Below Carter, C. et al, Pets v. Degraffenreid, V. et al.	Related
		142 MM 2021 Same Record Below Gressman et al., Pet. v. Degraffenreid et al.	Related
		5 MAP 2022 Same Record Below Carter, C. et al v. Chapman, L. et al.	Related
		6 MAP 2022 Same Record Below Gressman et al. v. Chapman, L. et al.	Related
		10 MAP 2022 Same Record Below Gressman et al. v. Chapman, L. et al.	Related
		11 MAP 2022 Same Record Below Carter, C. et al v. Chapman, L. et al; Apl: Osche	Related
		12 MAP 2022 Same Record Below Gressman et al. v. Chapman, L. et al.; Apl: Osche	Related
		7 MM 2022 Same Record Below Carter, C. et al, Pets. v. Chapman, L., et al.	Related

## COUNSEL INFORMATION




---

**COUNSEL INFORMATION**


---

Attorney: Gallagher, Kathleen A.  
 Gallagher Giancola LLC  
 Address: 436 Seventh Ave 31st Fl  
 Pittsburgh, PA 15219  
 Phone No: (412) 717-1920  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Haroon Bashir, Valerie Biancaniello, Tegwyn Hughes, and Jeffrey Wenk, Appellant  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Giancola, Russell David  
 Gallagher Giancola LLC  
 Address: 436 Seventh Ave Fl 31  
 Pittsburgh, PA 15219  
 Phone No: (412) 717-1900  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Haroon Bashir, Valerie Biancaniello, Tegwyn Hughes, and Jeffrey Wenk, Appellant  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Duffy, Jeffrey William  
 Baker & Hostetler, LLP  
 Address: 1735 Market St Ste 3300  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103-7501  
 Phone No: (215) 564-2916  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Benninghoff, Kerry, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Cutler, Bryan, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Greenberg, Kevin Michael  
 Greenberg Traurig, LLP  
 Address: 1717 Arch St Ste 400  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 988-7800  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Maria Collett, et al, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---




---

**COUNSEL INFORMATION**


---

Attorney: Hill, John Brent  
 Hangle, Aronchick, Segal, Pudlin & Schiller  
 Address: 1 Logan Sq Fl 27  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 496-7049  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Chapman, Leigh M., Appellee  
   Pro Se: No  
   IFP Status:  
 Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Appellee  
   Pro Se: No  
   IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Holtzman, Anthony Richard  
 K & L Gates LLP  
 Address: 17 N 2ND St 18th Fl  
 Harrisburg, PA 17101-1507  
 Phone No: (717) 231-4500  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Corman, Jake, Appellee  
   Pro Se: No  
   IFP Status:  
 Representing: Ward, Kim, Appellee  
   Pro Se: No  
   IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Kotula, Kathleen Marie  
 Pennsylvania Department of State  
 Address: Bureau of Commissions, Elections  
 306 N Office Bldg 401 North St  
 Harrisburg, PA 17120-0500  
 Phone No: (717) 783-1657  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Bureau of Elections, Appellee  
   Pro Se: No  
   IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Rogers, Edward David  
 Ballard Spahr, LLP  
 Address: 1735 Market St Fl 51  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103-7599  
 Phone No: (610) 246-4701  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Carol Ann Carter, et al., Appellee  
   Pro Se: No  
   IFP Status:

---




---

**COUNSEL INFORMATION**


---

Attorney: Salkowski, Matthew S.  
 Pennsylvania House of Representatives  
 Address: House Democratic Caucus Ogc  
 620 Main Capitol Building  
 Harrisburg, PA 17111  
 Phone No: (717) 787-3002  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: McClinton, Joanna, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Voss, Joshua John  
 Kleinbard LLC  
 Address: 1717 Arch St Fl 5th  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (267) 443-4114  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Guy Reschenthaler, Jeffrey Varner, Tom Marino, Ryan Costello, Bud Shuster (Congressional  
 Intervenor), Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Wiygul, Robert Andrew  
 Hangley, Aronchick, Segal, Pudlin & Schiller  
 Address: 18TH Cherry Sts Fl 27  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 496-7042  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Chapman, Leigh M., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Wolf, Tom, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Woods, Corrie Allen  
 Woods Law Offices PLLC  
 Address: 200 Commerce Dr Ste 210  
 Moon Township, PA 15108  
 Phone No: (412) 329-7751  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Jay Costa, et al., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---




---

**COUNSEL INFORMATION**


---

Attorney: Attisano, Marco Santino  
 Flannery Georgalis, LLC  
 Address: 707 Grant St Ste 2750  
 Pittsburgh, PA 15219  
 Phone No: (412) 438-8209  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Jay Costa, et al., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Clark, Robert Joseph  
 Ballard Spahr, LLP  
 Address: 1735 Market St Fl 51  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 864-8659  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Carol Ann Carter, et al., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Enerson, Caleb Curtis  
 Pennsylvania Office of Attorney General, 16th Floor , Strawberry Square, Harrisburg, PA  
 Address: Pa Office Of Attorney General  
 Strawberry Sq Fl 15  
 Harrisburg, PA 17120  
 Phone No: (717) 705-5774  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Chapman, Leigh M., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Haverstick, Matthew Hermann  
 Address: Kleinbard LLC  
 Three Logan Square  
 1717 Arch St Fl 5  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 568-2000  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Guy Reschenthaler, Jeffrey Varner, Tom Marino, Ryan Costello, Bud Shuster (Congressional  
 Intervenor), Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---




---

**COUNSEL INFORMATION**


---

Attorney: Levine, Clifford B.  
 Dentons Cohen Grigsby  
 Address: 625 Liberty Ave; 5th floor  
 Pittsburgh, PA 15222  
 Phone No: (412) 297-4998  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Maria Collett, et al, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Mann, James Guthrie  
 Pennsylvania House of Representatives  
 Address: Ste B 6 Main Capitol  
 Po Box 202228  
 Harrisburg, PA 17120-2228  
 Phone No: (717) 783-1510  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Benninghoff, Kerry, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Cutler, Bryan, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Mavroudis, Dimitrios  
 Address: Tucker Law Group  
 1801 Market St Ste 2500  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 982-2280  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Chapman, Leigh M., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Wolf, Tom, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---




---

**COUNSEL INFORMATION**


---

Attorney: McDonald, Michael R.  
 Ballard Spahr LLP  
 Address: 1735 Market St Fl 51  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 864-8425  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:  
 Representing: Carol Ann Carter, et al., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Ort, Paul Keller  
 Ballard Spahr, LLP  
 Address: 1735 Market St Fl 51  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 864-8287  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Carol Ann Carter, et al., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Pratt, Anthony Michael  
 Greenberg Traurig, LLP  
 Address: 1717 Arch St Ste 400  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103-2799  
 Phone No: (215) 972-5916  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Maria Collett, et al, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Pratt, Marcel S.  
 Ballard Spahr LLP  
 Address: 1735 Market St 51st Fl  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 864-8506  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Carol Ann Carter, et al., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---




---

**COUNSEL INFORMATION**


---

Attorney: Rice, Caroline Layne  
 Hangle, Aronchick, Segal, Pudlin & Schiller  
 Address: Hangle Aronchick Segal  
 1 Logan Sq Fl 27  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 496-7032  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Chapman, Leigh M., Appellee  
   Pro Se: No  
   IFP Status:  
 Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Appellee  
   Pro Se: No  
   IFP Status:  
 Representing: Wolf, Tom, Appellee  
   Pro Se: No  
   IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Rickabaugh, Jessica Ann  
 Tucker Law Group, LLC  
 Address: 1801 Market St Ste 2500  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 875-0609  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Chapman, Leigh M., Appellee  
   Pro Se: No  
   IFP Status:  
 Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Appellee  
   Pro Se: No  
   IFP Status:  
 Representing: Wolf, Tom, Appellee  
   Pro Se: No  
   IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Senoff, David Samuel  
 Address: First Law Strategy Group LLC  
 121 S Broad St Ste 300  
 Philadelphia, PA 19107  
 Phone No: (215) 258-4700  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: McClinton, Joanna, Appellee  
   Pro Se: No  
   IFP Status:

---






---

**COUNSEL INFORMATION**


---

Attorney: Shoucair, Emma Frances Elizabeth  
 Dentons Cohen & Grigsby PC  
 Address: 625 Liberty Ave  
 Pittsburgh, PA 15222  
 Phone No: (412) 417-1889  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Maria Collett, et al, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Truong, Lam Dang  
 Pennsylvania House of Representatives  
 Address: Office of Chief Counsel  
 620 Main Capital Bldg  
 Harrisburg, PA 17120  
 Phone No: (717) 787-3002  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: McClinton, Joanna, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Tucker, Joe H., Jr.  
 Tucker Law Group, LLC  
 Address: 1801 Market Ste Ste 2500  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Phone No: (215) 875-0609  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Chapman, Leigh M., Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Wolf, Tom, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---

Attorney: Vaitl, Jonathan Richard  
 K & L Gates LLP  
 Address: 17 N Second St Fl 18  
 Harrisburg, PA 17101-1507  
 Phone No: (717) 231-5830  
 Receive Mail: Yes  
 Representing: Corman, Jake, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:  
 Representing: Ward, Kim, Appellee  
 Pro Se: No  
 IFP Status:

---



#### COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Vance, Shohin Hadizadeh

Address: Kleinbard LLC  
Three Logan Square  
1717 Arch St 5th Fl  
Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (215) 568-2000

Receive Mail: Yes

Representing: Guy Reschenthaler, Jeffrey Varner, Tom Marino, Ryan Costello, Bud Shuster (Congressional Intervenor), Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Zimmer, Samantha G.

Address: Kleinbard LLC  
Three Logan Square  
1717 Arch St 5th Fl  
Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (215) 568-2000

Receive Mail: Yes

Representing: Guy Reschenthaler, Jeffrey Varner, Tom Marino, Ryan Costello, Bud Shuster (Congressional Intervenor), Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

#### SUPREME COURT INFORMATION

Appeal From: the order of the Commonwealth Court at No. 464 MD 2021 dated January 14, 2022 denying intervenor status.

Appeal Filed Below: 1/24/2022 12:00:00AM

Probable Jurisdiction Noted: January 28, 2022      Docketed Date: January 25, 2022

Allocatur/Miscellaneous Granted:      Allocatur/Miscellaneous Docket No.:

Allocatur/Miscellaneous Grant Order:

#### FEE INFORMATION

Fee Dt	Fee Name	Fee Amt	Receipt Dt	Receipt No	Receipt Amt
01/24/2022	Notice of Appeal	90.25	01/26/2022	2022-SUP-M-000243	180.50

#### INTERMEDIATE APPELLATE COURT INFORMATION

Court Name:      Docket Number:

Date of Order:      Rearg/Recon Disp Date:

                                 Rearg/Recon Disposition:

Judge(s):

Intermediate Appellate Court Action:

Referring Court:

#### AGENCY/TRIAL COURT INFORMATION

## Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



## Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 9 MAP 2022

Page 11 of 12

January 27, 2025

Court Below: Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania  
 County: Division: Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania  
 Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: January 14, 2022  
 Docket Number: 464 MD 2021  
 Judge(s): McCullough, Patricia A. OTN:  
 Order Type: Order

## ORIGINAL RECORD CONTENT

Original Record Item	Filed Date	Content/Description
----------------------	------------	---------------------

## Record Remittal:

## DISPOSITION INFORMATION

Related Journal No:	Judgment Date:	January 28, 2022
Category: Decided	Disposition Author:	Per Curiam
Disposition: Affirmed	Disposition Date:	January 28, 2022
Dispositional Filing: <b>Order</b>	Author:	Per Curiam
Filed Date: January 28, 2022		

## DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
January 24, 2022	<b>Notice of Appeal</b>	Appellant	Haroon Bashir, Valerie Biancaniello, Tegwyn Hughes, and Jeffrey Wenk
January 24, 2022	<b>Jurisdictional Statement</b>	Appellant	Haroon Bashir, Valerie Biancaniello, Tegwyn Hughes, and Jeffrey Wenk
January 25, 2022	<b>No Answer Letter to Notice of Appeal &amp; Jurisdictional Statement</b>	Appellee	Maria Collett, et al
January 25, 2022	<b>No Answer Letter to Notice of Appeal &amp; Jurisdictional Statement</b>	Appellee	Guy Reschenthaler, Jeffrey Varner, Tom Marino, Ryan Costello, Bud Shuster (Congressional Intervenor)
January 25, 2022	<b>No Answer Letter to Notice of Appeal &amp; Jurisdictional Statement</b>	Appellee	Khalif Ali, et al



## DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
January 25, 2022	<b>No Answer Letter to Notice of Appeal &amp; Jurisdictional Statement</b>	Appellee Appellee	Corman, Jake Ward, Kim
January 25, 2022	<b>No Answer Letter to Notice of Appeal &amp; Jurisdictional Statement</b>	Appellee Appellee Appellee	Chapman, Leigh M. Mathis, Jessica Wolf, Tom
January 25, 2022	<b>No Answer Letter to Notice of Appeal &amp; Jurisdictional Statement</b>	Appellee	Carol Ann Carter, et al.
January 25, 2022	<b>Untimely No Answer Letter to Jurisdictional Statement Received &amp; Returned</b>	Appellee	McClinton, Joanna
Comments: Untimely. Due at 4:00 p.m.			
January 28, 2022	<b>Affirmed</b>		Per Curiam
Comments: AND NOW, this 28th day of January, 2022, probable jurisdiction is NOTED. As Appellants waited ten days to file a notice of appeal from the Commonwealth Court's order denying intervention, and at least one of the case deadlines established by that order has already passed, the Order of the Commonwealth Court is AFFIRMED. Cf. Pa.R.Civ.P. 2329(3) (allowing for denial of intervention if "the petitioner has unduly delayed in making application for intervention or the intervention will unduly delay . . . the trial or the adjudication of the rights of the parties").			
January 28, 2022	<b>Judgment Entered</b>		Office of the Prothonotary
February 17, 2022	<b>Remitted</b>		Office of the Prothonotary