Supreme Court of Pennsylvania

Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 65 MAP 2022

November 28, 2026

CAPTION

Ivy Hill Congregation of Jehovah's Witnesses, Appellant
v.
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, Department of Human Services, Appellee

CASE INFORMATION

Initiating Document:	Notice of Appeal		
Case Status:	Closed		
Journal Number:	J-47-2023 September 14, 2023		
Case Category:	Administrative Agency	Case Type(s):	Human Services, Department of Declaratory Judgment

CONSOLIDATED CASES

RELATED CASES

COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney:	Haverstick, Matthew Hermann		
	None/Not Applicable		
Address:	Kleinbard LLC 1717 Arch St 5th Fl Philadelphia, PA 19103		
Phone No:	(215) 496-7225		
Receive Mail:	Yes		
Receive EMail:	Yes	Email:	
Representing:	Ivy Hill Congregation of Jehovah's Witnesses, Appellant		
Pro Se:	No		
IFP/Waiver:			

Attorney:	Seiberling, Mark Edward		
	None/Not Applicable		
Address:	Kleinbard LLC 1717 Arch St 5th Fl Philadelphia, PA 19103		
Phone No:	(215) 496-7222		
Receive Mail:	Yes		
Receive EMail:	Yes	Email:	
Representing:	Ivy Hill Congregation of Jehovah's Witnesses, Appellant		
Pro Se:	No		
IFP/Waiver:			

Neither the Appellate Courts nor the Administrative Office of Pennsylvania Courts assumes any liability
for inaccurate or delayed data, errors or omissions on the docket sheets.

Supreme Court of Pennsylvania

Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 65 MAP 2022

November 28, 2026

COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney:	Vance, Shohin Hadizadeh
Address:	Kleinbard LLC 1717 Arch St 5th Fl Three Logan Square Philadelphia, PA 19103
Phone No:	(215) 568-2000
Receive Mail:	Yes
Receive EMail:	Yes Email:
Representing:	Ivy Hill Congregation of Jehovah's Witnesses, Appellant
Pro Se:	No
IFP/Waiver:	

Attorney:	Voss, Joshua John
Address:	Kleinbard LLC Three Logan Square 1717 Arch St Fl 5th Philadelphia, PA 19103
Phone No:	(215) 568-2000
Receive Mail:	Yes
Receive EMail:	Yes Email:
Representing:	Ivy Hill Congregation of Jehovah's Witnesses, Appellant
Pro Se:	No
IFP/Waiver:	

Attorney:	Serafin, Kenneth J.
Address:	Pennsylvania Department of Human Services, Bureau of Hearings and Appeals Office Of General Counsel 625 Forster St 3rd Fl West Harrisburg, PA 17120
Phone No:	(717) 783-2800
Receive Mail:	Yes
Receive EMail:	Yes Email:
Representing:	Department of Human Services, Appellee
Pro Se:	No
IFP/Waiver:	

Attorney:	DiTomo, Nicole Rue
Address:	Pennsylvania Office of Attorney General Pa Ofc Of Attorney General 1000 Madison Ave Ste 310 Norristown, PA 19403
Phone No:	(610) 631-6205
Receive Mail:	Yes
Receive EMail:	Yes Email:
Representing:	Department of Human Services, Appellee
Pro Se:	No
IFP/Waiver:	

Neither the Appellate Courts nor the Administrative Office of Pennsylvania Courts assumes any liability
for inaccurate or delayed data, errors or omissions on the docket sheets.

Supreme Court of Pennsylvania

Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 65 MAP 2022

November 28, 2026

COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney:	Henry, Michelle Ann
	Pennsylvania Office of Attorney General
Address:	Pa Office Of Attorney General
	Strawberry Sq Fl 16
	Harrisburg, PA 17120
Phone No:	(717) 580-0195
Receive Mail:	Yes
Representing:	Department of Human Services, Appellee
Pro Se:	No
IFP/Waiver:	

Attorney:	McLees, Matthew John
	Pennsylvania Department of Human Services, Bureau of Hearings and Appeals
Address:	Pa-Dhs-office Of General Counsel
	625 Forster St 3rd Fl West
	Harrisburg, PA 17120
Phone No:	(717) 783-2800
Receive Mail:	Yes
Receive EMail:	Yes Email:
Representing:	Department of Human Services, Appellee
Pro Se:	No
IFP/Waiver:	

Attorney:	Scarinci, Michael John
	Pennsylvania Office of Attorney General, 16th Floor , Strawberry Square, Harrisburg, PA
Address:	Pa Office Of Attorney General
	15TH Floor Strawberry Sq
	Harrisburg, PA 17120
Phone No:	(717) 857-2184
Receive Mail:	Yes
Receive EMail:	Yes Email:
Representing:	Department of Human Services, Appellee
Pro Se:	No
IFP/Waiver:	

Attorney:	Solimine, Cara Lunell
	Pennsylvania Department of Human Services, Bureau of Hearings and Appeals
Address:	Pa-Dhs-office Of General Counsel
	Third Floor West
	Health & Welfare Building
	Harrisburg, PA 17120
Phone No:	(717) 783-2800
Receive Mail:	Yes
Receive EMail:	Yes Email:
Representing:	Department of Human Services, Appellee
Pro Se:	No
IFP/Waiver:	

Neither the Appellate Courts nor the Administrative Office of Pennsylvania Courts assumes any liability
for inaccurate or delayed data, errors or omissions on the docket sheets.

Supreme Court of Pennsylvania

Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 65 MAP 2022

November 28, 2026

SUPREME COURT INFORMATION

Appeal From: the Order of the Commonwealth Court at No. 316 MD 2020 dated May 10, 2022.
Appeal Filed Below: 6/3/2022 12:00:00AM

Probable Jurisdiction Noted: August 2, 2022
Docketed Date: June 3, 2022
Allocatur/Miscellaneous Granted:
Allocatur/Miscellaneous Docket No.:
Allocatur/Miscellaneous Grant Order:

FEE INFORMATION

Fee Dt	Fee Name	Fee Amt	Receipt Dt	Receipt No	Receipt Amt
06/03/2022	Notice of Appeal	90.25	06/08/2022	2022-SUP-M-001318	90.25

INTERMEDIATE APPELLATE COURT INFORMATION

Court Name:
Docket Number:
Date of Order:
Rearg/Recon Disp Date:
Rearg/Recon Disposition:

Judge(s):
Intermediate Appellate Court Action:
Referring Court:

AGENCY/TRIAL COURT INFORMATION

Court Below: Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania
County:
Division: Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania
Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: May 10, 2022
Docket Number: 316 MD 2020
Judge(s): Ceisler, Ellen
Cohn Jubelirer, Renee
Covey, Anne E.
Dumas, Lori A.
McCullough, Patricia
Wallace, Stacy
Wojcik, Michael H.
OTN:
Order Type: Order

ORIGINAL RECORD CONTENT

Original Record Item	Filed Date	Content/Description
Part(s)	August 03, 2022	35

Record Remittal: March 5, 2024

BRIEFING SCHEDULE

Appellant
Ivy Hill Congregation of Jehovah's Witnesses
Brief
Due: September 26, 2022 Filed: September 26, 2022

Reply Brief
Due: January 3, 2023 Filed: January 3, 2023

Appellee
Department of Human Services
Brief
Due: November 30, 2022 Filed: November 30, 2022

Neither the Appellate Courts nor the Administrative Office of Pennsylvania Courts assumes any liability
for inaccurate or delayed data, errors or omissions on the docket sheets.

Supreme Court of Pennsylvania

Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 65 MAP 2022

November 28, 2026

BRIEFING SCHEDULE

Appellant
Ivy Hill Congregation of Jehovah's Witnesses

Reproduced Record
Due: September 26, 2022 Filed: September 26, 2022

SESSION INFORMATION

Journal Number: J-47-2023
Listed/Submitted Date: September 14, 2023
Consideration Type: Oral Argument Supreme Ct.

DISPOSITION INFORMATION

Related Journal No:	J-47-2023	Judgment Date:	February 13, 2024
Category:	Decided	Disposition Author:	Todd, Debra
Disposition:	Vacated/Remanded	Disposition Date:	February 13, 2024
Dispositional Filing:	**Majority Opinion**	Author:	Todd, Debra
Filed Date:	February 13, 2024		

Justice:	Donohue, Christine	Vote:	Joins
Justice:	Dougherty, Kevin M.	Vote:	Joins
Justice:	Wecht, David N.	Vote:	Joins
Justice:	Mundy, Sallie U.	Vote:	Joins
Justice:	Brobson, P. Kevin	Vote:	Did Not Participate in Consid/Decision of Case

DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
June 3, 2022	**Notice of Appeal**	Appellant	Ivy Hill Congregation of Jehovah's Witnesses
June 3, 2022	**Jurisdictional Statement**	Appellant	Ivy Hill Congregation of Jehovah's Witnesses
June 8, 2022	**Praecipe for Appearance** Department of Human Services	Appellee	Scarinci, Michael John
August 2, 2022	**Probable Jurisdiction Noted**		Dreibelbis, Amy

Comments:
AND NOW, this 2nd day of August, 2022, probable jurisdiction is noted. Justice Brobson did not participate in the consideration or decision of this matter.

August 2, 2022	**Order Exited**		Office of the Prothonotary

Neither the Appellate Courts nor the Administrative Office of Pennsylvania Courts assumes any liability
for inaccurate or delayed data, errors or omissions on the docket sheets.

Supreme Court of Pennsylvania

Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 65 MAP 2022

November 28, 2026

DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
August 3, 2022	**Commonwealth Court Record Received**		Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania
August 12, 2022	**Designation of Contents of Reproduced Record**	Appellant	Ivy Hill Congregation of Jehovah's Witnesses
September 7, 2022	**Application for Extension of Time to File Brief - First Request**	Appellant	Ivy Hill Congregation of Jehovah's Witnesses
September 7, 2022	**Application for Leave to File Over-Length Brief**	Appellant	Ivy Hill Congregation of Jehovah's Witnesses
September 8, 2022	**No Answer Letter to Application for Leave to File Over-Length Brief**	Appellee	Department of Human Services
September 8, 2022	**Order Granting Application for Extension of Time to File Brief and Reproduced Record**		Dreibelbis, Amy
Comments: AND NOW, this 8th day of September 2022, Appellant's application for extension of time is granted. Appellant's Brief and Reproduced Record shall be filed on or before September 26, 2022.			
September 8, 2022	**Order Exited**		Office of the Prothonotary
September 20, 2022	**Order Denying Application for Leave to File Over-Length Brief**		Per Curiam
Comments: AND NOW, this 20th day of September, 2022, the Application for Leave to File Over-length Brief is DENIED. Justice Brobson did not participate in the consideration or decision of this matter.			
September 20, 2022	**Order Exited**		Office of the Prothonotary
September 26, 2022	**Appellant's Brief**	Appellant	Ivy Hill Congregation of Jehovah's Witnesses
September 26, 2022	**Appellant's Reproduced Record Filed**	Appellant	Ivy Hill Congregation of Jehovah's Witnesses
October 13, 2022	**Application for Extension of Time to File Brief - First Request**	Appellee	Department of Human Services
October 13, 2022	**Order Granting Application for Extension of Time to File Appellee Brief**		Dreibelbis, Amy
Comments: AND NOW, this 13th day of October, 2022, Appellee's application for extension of time is granted. Appellee's Brief shall be filed on or before November 30, 2022.			

Neither the Appellate Courts nor the Administrative Office of Pennsylvania Courts assumes any liability
for inaccurate or delayed data, errors or omissions on the docket sheets.

Supreme Court of Pennsylvania

Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 65 MAP 2022

November 28, 2026

DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
October 13, 2022	**Order Exited**		Office of the Prothonotary
November 30, 2022	**Appellee's Brief**	Appellee	Department of Human Services
December 12, 2022	**Application for Extension of Time to File Reply Brief**	Appellant	Ivy Hill Congregation of Jehovah's Witnesses
December 12, 2022	**No Answer Letter to Application for Extension of Time**	Appellee	Department of Human Services
December 14, 2022	**Order Granting Application for Extension of Time to File Brief**		Dreibelbis, Amy

Comments:
AND NOW, this 14th day of December, 2022, Appellant's application for extension of time is granted. Appellant's Reply Brief shall be filed on or before January 3, 2023.

December 14, 2022	**Order Exited**		Office of the Prothonotary
January 3, 2023	**Appellant's Reply Brief**	Appellant	Ivy Hill Congregation of Jehovah's Witnesses
April 19, 2023	**Dispositional Memo Order**		Per Curiam

Comments:
AND NOW, this 19th day of April, 2023, oral argument is GRANTED, LIMITED to the following issue as phrased by Appellant:

Does the Commonwealth Court's opinion dismissing this matter violate the coordinate jurisdiction and law of the case doctrines, where a previous en banc panel in the action presented with identical legal questions reached a contrary conclusion and the only intervening change was that the allegations in the underlying pleading were established as undisputed facts?

The remaining issue in the appeal is submitted on the briefs, and the Court will not entertain it at oral argument.

Justice Brobson did not participate in the consideration or decision of this matter.

April 19, 2023	**Order Exited**		Office of the Prothonotary
July 13, 2023	**Acknowledgement of Argument Notice**		
	Ivy Hill Congregation of Jehovah's Witnesses	Appellant	Haverstick, Matthew Hermann
July 14, 2023	**Acknowledgement of Argument Notice**		
	Department of Human Services	Appellee	Scarinci, Michael John

Neither the Appellate Courts nor the Administrative Office of Pennsylvania Courts assumes any liability
for inaccurate or delayed data, errors or omissions on the docket sheets.

Supreme Court of Pennsylvania

Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 65 MAP 2022

November 28, 2026

DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
September 14, 2023	**Argued**		
	Ivy Hill Congregation of Jehovah's Witnesses	Appellant	Haverstick, Matthew Hermann
	Department of Human Services	Appellee	Scarinci, Michael John
February 13, 2024	**Vacated/Remanded**		Todd, Debra

Comments:
To reiterate, we vacate the lower court's order dismissing Appellant's Petition and its Motion for Summary Relief, as we conclude the court's determinations that Appellant does not have standing, and that a grant of declaratory relief would not terminate the controversy, violated the coordinate jurisdiction rule. Accordingly, we remand the case for further proceedings.
Order reversed. Case remanded.

Justices Donohue, Dougherty, Wecht and Mundy join the opinion.

Justice Brobson did not participate in the consideration or decision of this matter.

February 13, 2024	**Judgment Entered**	Office of the Prothonotary
March 5, 2024	**Original Record Remitted to Commonwealth Court**	Office of the Prothonotary
March 6, 2024	**Acknowledgement of Record Remittal**	Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

CROSS COURT ACTIONS

Docket Number: 316 MD 2020

Neither the Appellate Courts nor the Administrative Office of Pennsylvania Courts assumes any liability
for inaccurate or delayed data, errors or omissions on the docket sheets.