

Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 6 MAP 2022

Page 1 of 14

October 29, 2024

CAPTION

Philip T. Gressman; Ron Y. Donagi; Kristopher R. Tapp; Pamela Gorkin; David P. Marsh; James L. Rosenberger; Amy Myers; Eugene Boman; Gary Gordon; Liz McMahon; Timothy G. Feeman; and Garth Isaak

v.

Leigh M. Chapman, in her official capacity as the Acting Secretary of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania; Jessica Mathis, in her official capacity as Director for the Pennsylvania Bureau of Election Services and Notaries

Appeal of: Khalif Ali, Maryn Formley, Richard Rafferty, Patrick Beaty, Susan Gobreski, Barbara Hill, Judy Hines, Jodi Greene, John Thompson, Cynthia Alvarado, and Timothy L. Kauffman, Possible Intervenors

CASE INFORMATION

Initiating Document: Notice of Appeal

Case Status: Closed

Journal Number:

Case Category: Election Case Type(s): Redistricting

CONSOLIDATED CASES

RELATED CASES

Docket No / Reason	Type	Docket No / Reason	Type
5 MAP 2022 Sua Sponte	Consolidated	141 MM 2021 Same Record Below Carter, C. et al, Pets v. Degraffenreid, V. et al.	Related
		142 MM 2021 Same Record Below Gressman et al., Pet. v. Degraffenreid et al.	Related
		5 MAP 2022 Same Record Below Carter, C. et al v. Chapman, L. et al.	Related
		9 MAP 2022 Same Record Below Carter, C. et al v. Chapman, L. et al.	Related
		10 MAP 2022 Same Record Below Gressman et al. v. Chapman, L. et al.	Related
		11 MAP 2022 Same Record Below Carter, C. et al v. Chapman, L. et al; Apl: Osche	Related
		12 MAP 2022 Same Record Below Gressman et al. v. Chapman, L. et al.; Apl: Osche	Related
		7 MM 2022 Same Record Below Carter, C. et al, Pets. v. Chapman, L., et al.	Related

COUNSEL INFORMATION



COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Geffen, Benjamin David
Public Interest Law Center (The)
Address: 1500 JFK Blvd Ste 802
Philadelphia, PA 19102
Phone No: (267) 546-1308
Receive Mail: Yes
Representing: Khalif Ali, et al, Appellant
Pro Se: No
IFP Status:

Attorney: Black, Martin Jay
Dechert LLP
Address: 2929 Arch St
Philadelphia, PA 19104-2808
Phone No: (215) 994-2664
Receive Mail: Yes
Representing: Khalif Ali, et al, Appellant
Pro Se: No
IFP Status:

Attorney: McKenzie, Mary M.
Public Interest Law Center (The)
Address: Public Interest Law Center Two Penn Center
1500 Jfk Blvd Ste 802
Philadelphia, PA 19102
Phone No: (267) 546-1319
Receive Mail: Yes
Representing: Khalif Ali, et al, Appellant
Pro Se: No
IFP Status:

Attorney: Rocco, Andrew Michael
Dechert LLP
Address: 2929 Arch St Cira Ctr
Philadelphia, PA 19104
Phone No: (856) 693-0378
Receive Mail: Yes
Representing: Khalif Ali, et al, Appellant
Pro Se: No
IFP Status:



COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Duffy, Jeffrey William
 Baker & Hostetler, LLP
 Address: 1735 Market St Ste 3300
 Philadelphia, PA 19103-7501
 Phone No: (215) 564-2916
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Benninghoff, Kerry, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Cutler, Bryan, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Greenberg, Kevin Michael
 Greenberg Traurig, LLP
 Address: 1717 Arch St Ste 400
 Philadelphia, PA 19103
 Phone No: (215) 988-7800
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Maria Collett, et al, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Holtzman, Anthony Richard
 K & L Gates LLP
 Address: 17 N 2ND St 18th Fl
 Harrisburg, PA 17101-1507
 Phone No: (717) 231-4500
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:
 Representing: Corman, Jake, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Ward, Kim, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Kotula, Kathleen Marie
 Pennsylvania Department of State
 Address: Bureau of Commissions, Elections
 306 N Office Bldg 401 North St
 Harrisburg, PA 17120-0500
 Phone No: (717) 783-1657
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Bureau of Elections, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:



COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Pratt, Anthony Michael
 Greenberg Traurig, LLP
 Address: 1717 Arch Street, Suite 400
 Philadelphia, PA 19103
 Phone No: (215) 972-5916
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Maria Collett, et al, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: McClinton, Joanna, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Voss, Joshua John
 Kleinbard LLC
 Address: 1717 Arch St Fl 5th
 Philadelphia, PA 19103
 Phone No: (267) 443-4114
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Guy Reschenthaler, Jeffrey Varner, Tom Marino, Ryan Costello, Bud Shuster (Congressional
 Intervenor), Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Watterson, Kim M.
 Reed Smith LLP
 Address: 225 5TH Ave Ste 1200
 Pittsburgh, PA 15222-2716
 Phone No: (412) 288-7996
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:
 Representing: Philip T. Gressman, et al., Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Wiygul, Robert Andrew
 Hangle, Aronchick, Segal, Pudlin & Schiller
 Address: 18TH Cherry Sts Fl 27
 Philadelphia, PA 19103
 Phone No: (215) 496-7042
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Chapman, Leigh M., Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Wolf, Tom, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:



COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Woods, Corrie Allen
 Woods Law Offices PLLC
 Address: 200 Commerce Dr Ste 210
 Moon Township, PA 15108
 Phone No: (412) 329-7751
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Receive EMail: Yes
 Representing: Jay Costa, et al., Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Email:

Attorney: Attisano, Marco Santino
 Flannery Georgalis, LLC
 Address: 707 Grant St Ste 2750
 Pittsburgh, PA 15219
 Phone No: (412) 438-8209
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Jay Costa, et al., Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Enerson, Caleb Curtis
 Pennsylvania Office of Attorney General, 16th Floor , Strawberry Square, Harrisburg, PA
 Address: Pa Office Of Attorney General
 Strawberry Sq Fl 15
 Harrisburg, PA 17120
 Phone No: (717) 705-5774
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Chapman, Leigh M., Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Haverstick, Matthew Hermann
 Address: Kleinbard LLC
 Three Logan Square
 1717 Arch St Fl 5
 Philadelphia, PA 19103
 Phone No: (215) 568-2000
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Guy Reschenthaler, Jeffrey Varner, Tom Marino, Ryan Costello, Bud Shuster (Congressional
 Intervenor), Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:



COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Hill, John Brent
 Hangley, Aronchick, Segal, Pudlin & Schiller
 Address: 1 Logan Sq Fl 27
 Philadelphia, PA 19103
 Phone No: (215) 496-7049
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:
 Representing: Chapman, Leigh M., Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Levine, Clifford B.
 Dentons Cohen Grigsby
 Address: 625 Liberty Ave; 5th floor
 Pittsburgh, PA 15222
 Phone No: (412) 297-4998
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Maria Collett, et al, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Mann, James Guthrie
 Pennsylvania House of Representatives
 Address: Ste B 6 Main Capitol
 Po Box 202228
 Harrisburg, PA 17120-2228
 Phone No: (717) 783-1510
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Benninghoff, Kerry, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Cutler, Bryan, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:



COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Mavroudis, Dimitrios

 Address: Tucker Law Group
 1801 Market St Ste 2500
 Philadelphia, PA 19103
 Phone No: (215) 982-2280
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:
 Representing: Chapman, Leigh M., Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Wolf, Tom, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: McClure, Shannon Elise
 Reed Smith LLP
 Address: 1717 Arch St Ste 3100
 Philadelphia, PA 19103
 Phone No: (215) 851-8226
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Philip T. Gressman, et al., Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Misour, Devin Michael
 Reed Smith LLP
 Address: 225 Fifth Ave Fl 9
 Pittsburgh, PA 15222
 Phone No: (412) 288-3091
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:
 Representing: Philip T. Gressman, et al., Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:



COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Rice, Caroline Layne
 Hangle, Aronchick, Segal, Pudlin & Schiller
 Address: Hangle Aronchick Segal
 1 Logan Sq Fl 27
 Philadelphia, PA 19103
 Phone No: (215) 496-7032
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Chapman, Leigh M., Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Wolf, Tom, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Rickabaugh, Jessica Ann
 Tucker Law Group, LLC
 Address: 1801 Market St Ste 2500
 Philadelphia, PA 19103
 Phone No: (215) 875-0609
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Chapman, Leigh M., Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Wolf, Tom, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Senoff, David Samuel
 Address: First Law Strategy Group LLC
 121 S Broad St Ste 300
 Philadelphia, PA 19107
 Phone No: (215) 258-4700
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: McClinton, Joanna, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:



COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Shoucair, Emma Frances Elizabeth
 Dentons Cohen & Grigsby PC
 Address: 625 Liberty Ave
 Pittsburgh, PA 15222
 Phone No: (412) 417-1889
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Maria Collett, et al, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Truong, Lam Dang
 Pennsylvania House of Representatives
 Address: Office of Chief Counsel
 620 Main Capital Bldg
 Harrisburg, PA 17120
 Phone No: (717) 787-3002
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: McClinton, Joanna, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Tucker, Joe H., Jr.
 Tucker Law Group, LLC
 Address: 1801 Market Ste Ste 2500
 Philadelphia, PA 19103
 Phone No: (215) 875-0609
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Chapman, Leigh M., Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Wolf, Tom, Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Vance, Shohin Hadizadeh
 Address: Kleinbard LLC
 Three Logan Square
 1717 Arch St 5th Fl
 Philadelphia, PA 19103
 Phone No: (215) 568-2000
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Representing: Guy Reschenthaler, Jeffrey Varner, Tom Marino, Ryan Costello, Bud Shuster (Congressional Intervenor), Appellee
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



Appeal Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 6 MAP 2022

Page 10 of 14

October 29, 2024

COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Zimmer, Samantha G.

Address: Kleinbard LLC
Three Logan Square
1717 Arch St 5th Fl
Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (215) 568-2000

Receive Mail: Yes

Representing: Guy Reschenthaler, Jeffrey Varner, Tom Marino, Ryan Costello, Bud Shuster (Congressional Intervenor), Appellee

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

SUPREME COURT INFORMATION

Appeal From: the order of the Commonwealth Court at No. 465 MD 2021 dated January 14, 2022 denying intervenor status.

Appeal Filed Below: 1/20/2022 12:00:00AM

Probable Jurisdiction Noted: January 23, 2022 Docketed Date: January 21, 2022

Allocatur/Miscellaneous Granted: Allocatur/Miscellaneous Docket No.:

Allocatur/Miscellaneous Grant Order:

FEE INFORMATION

Fee Dt	Fee Name	Fee Amt	Receipt Dt	Receipt No	Receipt Amt
01/21/2022	Notice of Appeal	90.25	01/26/2022	2022-SUP-M-000242	90.25

INTERMEDIATE APPELLATE COURT INFORMATION

Court Name: Docket Number:

Date of Order: Rearg/Recon Disp Date:

 Rearg/Recon Disposition:

Judge(s):

Intermediate Appellate Court Action:

Referring Court:

AGENCY/TRIAL COURT INFORMATION

Court Below: Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

County: Division: Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: January 14, 2022

Docket Number: 465 MD 2021

Judge(s): McCullough, Patricia A. OTN:

Order Type: Order

ORIGINAL RECORD CONTENT

Original Record Item	Filed Date	Content/Description
Part(s)	January 24, 2022	3
Transcript(s)	January 24, 2022	1



Record Remittal: February 11, 2022

BRIEFING SCHEDULE

Appellant**Khalif Ali, et al
Brief**

Due: January 24, 2022

Filed: January 24, 2022

Reproduced Record

Due: January 24, 2022

Filed: January 24, 2022

Appellee**Benninghoff, Kerry
Letter in Lieu of Brief**

Due: January 25, 2022

Filed: January 25, 2022

**Bureau of Elections
Brief**

Due: January 25, 2022

Filed:

**Chapman, Leigh M.
Brief**

Due: January 25, 2022

Filed:

**Corman, Jake
Brief**

Due: January 25, 2022

Filed:

**Cutler, Bryan
Letter in Lieu of Brief**

Due: January 25, 2022

Filed:

**Guy Reschenthaler, Jeffrey Varner, Tom Marino,
Ryan Costello, Bud Shuster (Congressional
Intervenor)
Brief**

Due: January 25, 2022

Filed: January 25, 2022

**Jay Costa, et al.
Brief**

Due: January 25, 2022

Filed:

**Maria Collett, et al
Letter in Lieu of Brief**

Due: January 25, 2022

Filed: January 25, 2022

**Mathis, Jessica
Brief**

Due: January 25, 2022

Filed:

**McClinton, Joanna
Brief**

Due: January 25, 2022

Filed:

**Philip T. Gressman, et al.
Brief**

Due: January 25, 2022

Filed: January 25, 2022



BRIEFING SCHEDULE

Appellee

Ward, Kim

Brief

Due: January 25, 2022 Filed:

Wolf, Tom

Brief

Due: January 25, 2022 Filed:

DISPOSITION INFORMATION

Related Journal No:		Judgment Date:	January 26, 2022
Category:	Decided	Disposition Author:	Per Curiam
Disposition:	Affirmed	Disposition Date:	January 26, 2022
Dispositional Filing:	Order	Author:	Per Curiam
Filed Date:	January 26, 2022		

DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
January 20, 2022	Notice of Appeal	Appellant	Khalif Ali, et al
January 20, 2022	Jurisdictional Statement	Appellant	Khalif Ali, et al
January 21, 2022	No Answer Letter to Notice of Appeal & Jurisdictional Statement	Appellee	Maria Collett, et al
January 21, 2022	No Answer Letter to Notice of Appeal & Jurisdictional Statement	Appellee	Philip T. Gressman, et al.
January 21, 2022	No Answer Letter to Notice of Appeal & Jurisdictional Statement	Appellee Appellee	Corman, Jake Ward, Kim
January 21, 2022	No Answer Letter to Notice of Appeal & Jurisdictional Statement	Appellee Appellee Appellee	Mathis, Jessica Wolf, Tom Chapman, Leigh M.
January 21, 2022	Answer to Notice of Appeal & Jurisdictional Statement	Appellee	Guy Reschenthaler, Jeffrey Varner, Tom Marino, Ryan Costello, Bud Shuster (Congressional Intervenor)



DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
January 23, 2022	Probable Jurisdiction Noted and Briefing Schedule Issued		Per Curiam
Comments: AND NOW, this 23rd day of January, 2022, probable jurisdiction is NOTED. Appellants' Brief and Reproduced Record shall be filed on or before 12:00 noon, Monday, January 24, 2022. Any responsive Briefs shall be filed on or before 12:00 noon, Tuesday, January 25, 2022. Reply Briefs will not be permitted. Extensions of time will not be entertained.			
January 23, 2022	Order Exited		Office of the Prothonotary
January 24, 2022	Appellant's Brief	Appellant	Khalif Ali, et al
January 24, 2022	Appellant's Reproduced Record Filed	Appellant	Khalif Ali, et al
January 24, 2022	Notice of Disclosure		Todd, Debra
January 24, 2022	Commonwealth Court Record Received		Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania
January 25, 2022	Letter in Lieu of Brief - Appellee	Appellee Appellee	Benninghoff, Kerry Cutler, Bryan
January 25, 2022	Appellee's Brief	Appellee	Philip T. Gressman, et al.
January 25, 2022	Appellee's Brief	Appellee	Guy Reschenthaler, Jeffrey Varner, Tom Marino, Ryan Costello, Bud Shuster (Congressional Intervenor)
January 25, 2022	Letter in Lieu of Brief - Appellee	Appellee	Maria Collett, et al
January 25, 2022	Untimely combined No Answer Letter to Jurisdictional Statement and Letter in Lieu of Brief received	Appellee	McClinton, Joanna
January 26, 2022	Affirmed		Per Curiam
Comments: AND NOW, this 26th day of January, 2022, the order of the Commonwealth Court is AFFIRMED.			
January 26, 2022	Judgment Entered		Office of the Prothonotary
February 11, 2022	Remitted		Office of the Prothonotary



CROSS COURT ACTIONS

Docket Number: 142 MM 2021
Docket Number: 465 MD 2021