10:35 A.M. Sealed Documents

Commonwealth Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 1002 CD 2020

Page 1 of 6

April 25, 2024

Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania



CAPTION

Equity Forward and Mary Alice Carter, Petitioners

٧.

Pennsylvania Department of Human Services (Office of

Open Records), Respondent

CASE INFORMATION

Initiating Document: Petition for Review

Case Status: Closed

Case Processing Status: July 19, 2022 Completed

Journal Number: 19a-03-2022

Case Category: Administrative Agency Case Type(s): Right to Know Act

CONSOLIDATED CASES RELATED CASES

Docket No / ReasonTypeDocket No / ReasonType986 CD 2020Consolidated225 CD 2018Related

Ct Order - Sua Sponte Appeal After Remand

COUNSEL INFORMATION

Designated Petitioner Equity Forward

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Mutchler, Terry Lee
Address: Dilworth Paxson LLP
1500 Market Street

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (215) 575-7034 Fax No:

Designated Petitioner Carter, Mary Alice

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Mutchler, Terry Lee
Address: Dilworth Paxson LLP

1500 Market Street
Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (215) 575-7034 Fax No:

Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

Commonwealth Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 1002 CD 2020

Page 2 of 6 April 25, 2024



COUNSEL INFORMATION

Designated Respondent Real Alternatives, Inc.

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Voss, Joshua John Attorney: Kleinbard, LLC Law Firm: Address: Kleinbard LLC 1717 Arch St FI 5th

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (267) 443-4114 Fax No:

Attorney: Zimmer, Samantha G. Address: Kleinbard LLC

1717 Arch St 5th FI Philadelphia, PA 19103

Phone No: (570) 352-8367 Fax No:

Designated Respondent Department of Human Services

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Court Below:

Attorney: Cohan, Marisa Lynn

Law Firm: Pennsylvania Department of Human Services, Bureau of Hearings and Appeals

Address: Pa-Dhs-office Of General Counsel

> 625 Forster St 3rd FI West Harrisburg, PA 17120

Phone No: (717) 783-2800 Fax No:

Attorney: Serafin, Kenneth J.

Pennsylvania Department of Human Services, Bureau of Hearings and Appeals Law Firm:

Address: Office Of General Counsel

625 Forster St 3rd Fl West Harrisburg, PA 17120

Phone No: (717) 783-2800 Fax No:

FEE INFORMATION

Fee Dt Fee Name Fee Amt Receipt Dt Receipt No Receipt Amt

10/13/2020 90.25 10/14/2020 2020-CMW-H-001926 Petition for Review - Appellate 90.25

AGENCY/TRIAL COURT INFORMATION

Order Appealed From: September 11, 2020 Notice of Appeal Filed:

Order Type: Documents Received: October 13, 2020

Decision

Division: Office of Open Records County:

OTN: Judge:

Office of Open Records

AP 2017-2304 Judicial District: Docket Number:

10:35 A.M. Sealed Documents

Commonwealth Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 1002 CD 2020

Page 3 of 6 April 25, 2024

Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania



ORIGINAL RECORD CONTENT

Original Record Item Filed Date Content Description

Agency Record November 25, 2020 Supplemental Record December 01, 2020

Date of Remand of Record: February 16, 2023

		BRIEFING SCHEDULE			
	None		None		
		DOCKET ENTRY			
Filed Date	Docket Entry / Filer	Representing	Participant Type	Exit Date	
October 13, 2020	Petition for Review Filed				
	Carter, Mary Alice		Designated Petitio	Designated Petitioner	
	Equity Forward		Designated Petitio	Designated Petitioner	
October 19, 2020	Application for Intervention (Pa.	R.A.P. 1531b)			
	Voss, Joshua John	Real Alternatives, Inc.	Designated Respo	Designated Respondent	
Document Name:	Unopposed Application for Inter	vention by Real Alternatives			
October 21, 2020	Notice Exited			10/21/2020	
	Commonwealth Court Filing				
	Office				
October 22, 2020	Order Granting Application for In	ntervention		10/22/2020	
	Per Curiam				
Document Name:	upon consideration of the "Unor	pposed Application To Intervene by	Real Alternatives,"		
		Records giving rise to this pet ed as a party principally align			
October 30, 2020	Docketing Statement Filed				
	Mutchler, Terry Lee	Equity Forward	Designated Petitio		
	Mutchler, Terry Lee	Carter, Mary Alice	Designated Petitio	ner	
November 25, 2020	Agency Record Received				
	Office of Open Records				
Document Name:	See Briefing Schedule at 986 C	D 2020			
November 25, 2020	Briefing Schedule Issued				
	Commonwealth Court Filing				
	Office				
December 1, 2020	Sealed Supplemental Record				
	Office of Open Records				
Document Name:	Sealed Program Development a	and Advancement Agrrement.			
December 3, 2020	Order Sua Sponte for Consolida	ation		12/03/2020	
	Per Curiam				
Document Name:	NOW, December 3, 2020, the a	bove-captioned matters are hereby	y consolidated.		
Comment:		ce Carter are Designated Petit			
	schedule previously issued at	No. 1002 C.D. 2020 remains	in effect for these cons	olidated matters.	

further filings in these consolidated matters shall be captioned as set forth above.

Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

Commonwealth Docket Sheet
Docket Number: 1002 CD 2020

Page 4 of 6



		DOCKET ENTRY				
Filed Date	Docket Entry / Filer	Representing	Participant Type	Exit Date		
January 25, 2021	Entry of Appearance Zimmer, Samantha G. Atty. Zimmer for Real Alternatives	Real Alternatives, Inc.	Designated Respondent			
March 3, 2021 Document Name:	Tentative Session Date Krimmel, Michael May 2021					
	-					
April 7, 2021	Argument Scheduled Krimmel, Michael					
Document Name:	: MONDAY, May 10, 2021 (Panel 2) @9:30 a.m. via WebEx Video Conference (No. 11 & 11a on the list)					
April 27, 2021	Filed - Other Mutchler, Terry Lee Mutchler, Terry Lee	Equity Forward Carter, Mary Alice	Designated Petitioner Designated Petitioner			
April 27, 2021	Application for Continuance Mutchler, Terry Lee Mutchler, Terry Lee Cohan, Marisa Lynn Voss, Joshua John	Equity Forward Carter, Mary Alice Department of Human Services Real Alternatives, Inc.	Designated Petitioner Designated Petitioner Designated Respondent Designated Respondent			
Document Name:	Jt. Motion for Continuance					
	application is GRANTED. The	April, 2021, upon consideration of argument scheduled for Monday, bEx videoconference is hereby Co	May 10, 2021 a	at 9:30 a.m. on the		
May 3, 2021	Amended	<u> </u>		05/03/2021		
Document Name:	Per Curiam					
Comment:	AND NOW, this 3rd day of May, 2021, upon consideration of the Joint Motion for Continuance, the application is GRANTED. The argument scheduled for Monday, May 10, 2021 at 9:30 a.m. in the above-captioned matter via WebEx videoconference is hereby CONTINUED. In addition, the parties' request for entry of the stipulated briefing schedule is hereby GRANTED. Designated Petitioners shall file a Response Brief to Designated Respondent's February 3, 2021 Brief within 14 days of entry of this Order and Designated Respondent shall file a Reply Brief within 14 days of service of Designated Petitioners' Response Brief. The Prothonotary is hereby directed to list this matter for the next available argument list.					
May 17, 2021	Memorandum of Law Filed Mutchler, Terry Lee Equity Forward Designated Petitioner Mutchler, Terry Lee Carter, Mary Alice Designated Petitioner					
	MUNCHEL ICHVICE	•	-	1101		
	Response Brief of Designated Peti of Designated Respondent's Real		Carter to Brief			
	Response Brief of Designated Peti of Designated Respondent's Real A Tentative Session Date Krimmel, Michael		o date to blief			

Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

Commonwealth Docket Sheet
Docket Number: 1002 CD 2020

Page 5 of 6

ENTPY

April 25, 2024 **DOCKET ENTRY** Filed Date Docket Entry / Filer Representing Participant Type **Exit Date Argument Scheduled** October 20, 2021 Krimmel, Michael Document Name: Thursday, November 18, 2021, 9:30 a.m. (Panel) CR 5001, Pennsylvania Judicial Center, Harrisburg Comment: No. 38 & 38a on the list. November 17, 2021 **Argument Continued** 11/17/2021 Per Curiam Document Name: Order Granting Application for Continuance/ Continued to Next Available Argument List Comment: AND NOW, this 17th day of November, 2021, Petitioners', Equity Forward and Mary Alice Carter, unopposed Emergency Application for Relief Seeking Continuance for Oral Argument scheduled for Thursday, November 18, 2021 at 9:30 a.m/1:00 p.m. is hereby GRANTED and is continued until the next available list. The Prothonotary is directed to schedule the matter for the next available list. Tentative Session Date December 27, 2021 Krimmel, Michael Document Name: March 2022 **Argument Scheduled** January 28, 2022 Krimmel, Michael Document Name: Monday, March 7, 2022, 11:30 a.m. (Panel) CR 3001, Pennsylvania Judicial Center, Harrisburg Comment: No. 19 & 19a on the list. Affirmed 07/19/2022 July 19, 2022 Fizzano Cannon, Christine Document Name: Opinion (30 pages) Comment: AND NOW, this 19th day of July, 2022, the September 11, 2020 final determination of the Office of Open Records is AFFIRMED. Judge Cohn Jubelirer and Wallace did not participate in the decision. Petition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Filed August 18, 2022 Carter, Mary Alice **Designated Petitioner Equity Forward Designated Petitioner** Document Name: 355 MAL 2022 Comment: 355 MAL 2022 Petition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court Filed September 1, 2022 Real Alternatives, Inc. **Designated Respondent** Document Name: 378 MAL 2022 Comment: 378 MAL 2022 January 23, 2023 Order Denying Petition for Allowance of Appeal to PA Supreme Court 01/24/2023 Per Curiam Document Name: 355 & 378 MAL 2022 Comment: 378 MAL 2022 February 16, 2023 Remitted Commonwealth Court Filing Acknowledgement of Record Remittal February 21, 2023

Office of Open Records

10:35 A.M. Sealed Documents

Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania

Commonwealth Docket Sheet Docket Number: 1002 CD 2020

Page 6 of 6

April 25, 2024

SESSION INFORMATION

Journal Number: 19a-03-2022

Consideration Type: Oral Argument - Panel

Listed/Submitted Date: March 7, 2022

Panel Composition:

The Honorable Anne E. Covey
The Honorable Christine Fizzano Cannon
Judge

The Honorable Bonnie Brigance Leadbetter Senior Judge

DISPOSITION INFORMATION

Final Disposition: Yes

Related Journal No: Judgment Date:

Category: Decided Disposition Author: Fizzano Cannon, Christine

Disposition: Affirmed Disposition Date: July 19, 2022

Disposition Comment: AND NOW, this 19th day of July, 2022, the September 11, 2020 final determination of the Office of Open

Records is AFFIRMED. Judge Cohn Jubelirer and Wallace did not participate in the decision.

Dispositional Filing: Opinion Filing Author: Fizzano Cannon, Christine

Filed Date: 7/19/2022 12:00:00AM

Dispositional Filing: Dissenting Opinion Filing Author: Leadbetter, Bonnie Brigance

Filed Date: 7/19/2022 12:00:00AM