

Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



Miscellaneous Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 141 MM 2021

Page 1 of 9

May 2, 2024

CAPTION

Carol Ann Carter, Monica Parrilla, Rebecca Poyourow, William Tung, Roseanne Milazzo, Burt Siegel, Susan Cassanelli, Lee Cassanelli, Lynn Wachman, Michael Guttman, Maya Fonkeu, Brady Hill, Mary Ellen Balchunis, Tom DeWall, Stephanie McNulty and Janet Temin, Petitioners

v.

Veronica Degraffenreid, in her official capacity as the Acting Secretary of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania; Jessica Mathis, in her official capacity as Director for the Pennsylvania Bureau of Election Services and Notaries, Respondents

CASE INFORMATION

Initiating Document: Application for Extraordinary Relief

Case Status: Closed

Journal Number:

Case Category: Election

Case Type(s): Redistricting

CONSOLIDATED CASES

RELATED CASES

Docket No / Reason	Type
142 MM 2021	Related
Same Issue(s)	
Gressman et al., Pet. v. Degraffenreid et al.	
5 MAP 2022	Related
Same Record Below	
Carter, C. et al v. Chapman, L. et al.	
6 MAP 2022	Related
Same Record Below	
Gressman et al. v. Chapman, L. et al.	
9 MAP 2022	Related
Same Record Below	
Carter, C. et al v. Chapman, L. et al.	
10 MAP 2022	Related
Same Record Below	
Gressman et al. v. Chapman, L. et al.	
11 MAP 2022	Related
Same Record Below	
Carter, C. et al v. Chapman, L. et al; Apl: Osche	
12 MAP 2022	Related
Same Record Below	
Gressman et al. v. Chapman, L. et al.; Apl: Osche	
7 MM 2022	Related
Same Record Below	
Carter, C. et al, Pets. v. Chapman, L., et al.	

COUNSEL INFORMATION

Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



Miscellaneous Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 141 MM 2021

Page 2 of 9

May 2, 2024

COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Rogers, Edward David
 Ballard Spahr, LLP
 Address: Ballard Spahr Llp
 1735 Market St Fl 51
 Philadelphia, PA 19103-7599
 Phone No: (610) 246-4701
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:
 Representing: Carol Ann Carter, et al., Petitioner
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Clark, Robert Joseph
 Ballard Spahr, LLP
 Address: Ballard Spahr Llp
 1735 Market St Fl 51
 Philadelphia, PA 19103
 Phone No: (215) 864-8659
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:
 Representing: Carol Ann Carter, et al., Petitioner
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: McDonald, Michael R.
 Ballard Spahr LLP
 Address: 1735 Market St Fl 51
 Philadelphia, PA 19103
 Phone No: (215) 864-8425
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:
 Representing: Carol Ann Carter, et al., Petitioner
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Ort, Paul Keller
 Ballard Spahr, LLP
 Address: Ballard Spahr Llp
 1735 Market St Fl 51
 Philadelphia, PA 19103
 Phone No: (215) 864-8287
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:
 Representing: Carol Ann Carter, et al., Petitioner
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



Miscellaneous Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 141 MM 2021

Page 3 of 9

May 2, 2024

COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Pratt, Marcel S.
Ballard Spahr, LLP
Address: Ballard Spahr Llp
1735 Market St 51st Fl
Philadelphia, PA 19103
Phone No: (215) 864-8506
Receive Mail: Yes
Receive EMail: Yes Email:
Representing: Carol Ann Carter, et al., Petitioner
Pro Se: No
IFP Status:

Attorney: Hill, John Brent
Hangley, Aronchick, Segal, Pudlin & Schiller
Address: Hangley Aronchick Segal
1 Logan Sq Fl 27
Philadelphia, PA 19103
Phone No: (215) 496-7049
Receive Mail: Yes
Receive EMail: Yes Email:
Representing: Degraffenreid, Veronica, Respondent
Pro Se: No
IFP Status:
Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Respondent
Pro Se: No
IFP Status:

Attorney: Kotula, Kathleen Marie
Pennsylvania Department of State
Address: Pa Dept Of State
306 N Ofc Bldg 401 North St
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0500
Phone No: (717) 783-1657
Receive Mail: Yes
Representing: Bureau of Elections, Respondent
Pro Se: No
IFP Status:

Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



Miscellaneous Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 141 MM 2021

Page 4 of 9

May 2, 2024

COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Mavroudis, Dimitrios
 Address: Tucker Law Group
 1801 Market St Ste 2500
 Philadelphia, PA 19103
 Phone No: (215) 982-2280
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:
 Representing: Degraffenreid, Veronica, Respondent
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Respondent
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Rickabaugh, Jessica Ann
 Tucker Law Group, LLC
 Address: Tucker Law Group
 1801 Market St Ste 2500
 Philadelphia, PA 19103
 Phone No: (215) 875-0609
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:
 Representing: Degraffenreid, Veronica, Respondent
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Respondent
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Tucker, Joe H., Jr.
 Tucker Law Group, LLC
 Address: Tucker Law Group LLC
 1801 Market Ste Ste 2500
 Philadelphia, PA 19103
 Phone No: (215) 875-0609
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:
 Representing: Degraffenreid, Veronica, Respondent
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Respondent
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



Miscellaneous Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 141 MM 2021

Page 5 of 9

May 2, 2024

COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Wiygul, Robert Andrew
 Hangle, Aronchick, Segal, Pudlin & Schiller
 Address: Hangle Aronchick Et Al
 18TH Cherry Sts Fl 27
 Philadelphia, PA 19103
 Phone No: (215) 496-7042
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:
 Representing: Degraffenreid, Veronica, Respondent
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Mathis, Jessica, Respondent
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Duffy, Jeffry William
 Baker & Hostetler, LLP
 Address: Baker & Hostetler Llp
 1735 Market St Ste 3300
 Philadelphia, PA 19103-7501
 Phone No: (215) 564-2916
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:
 Representing: Benninghoff, Kerry, Possible Intervenor
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Cutler, Bryan, Possible Intervenor
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Holtzman, Anthony Richard
 Address: K& L Gates Llp
 17 N 2ND St 18th Fl
 Harrisburg, PA 17101-1507
 Phone No: (717) 231-4500
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:
 Representing: Corman, Jake, Possible Intervenor
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:
 Representing: Ward, Kim, Possible Intervenor
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



Miscellaneous Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 141 MM 2021

Page 6 of 9

May 2, 2024

COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: King, Thomas W., III
 Dillon McCandless King Coulter & Graham LLP
 Address: Dillon Mccandless Et Al
 128 W Cunningham St
 Butler, PA 16001-5742
 Phone No: (724) 283-2200
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:
 Representing: Leslie Oshe, et al., Possible Intervenor
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Woods, Corrie Allen
 Woods Law Offices PLLC
 Address: 200 Commerce Dr Ste 210
 Moon Township, PA 15108
 Phone No: (412) 329-7751
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:
 Representing: Jay Costa, et al., Possible Intervenor
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Attisano, Marco Santino
 Flannery Georgalis, LLC
 Address: Flannery Georgalis LLC
 707 Grant St Ste 2750
 Pittsburgh, PA 15219
 Phone No: (412) 438-8209
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:
 Representing: Jay Costa, et al., Possible Intervenor
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Breth, Thomas E.
 Dillon McCandless King Coulter & Graham, LLP
 Address: Dillon Mccandless King Coulter & Graham Llp
 128 W Cunningham St
 Butler, PA 16001-5742
 Phone No: (724) 283-2200
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:
 Representing: Leslie Oshe, et al., Possible Intervenor
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



Miscellaneous Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 141 MM 2021

Page 7 of 9

May 2, 2024

COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Shuber, Jordan Peter
 Address: Dillon, McCandless, King, Coulter & Graham, L.L.P.
 Dillon Mccandless King Coulter & Graham L.l.p.
 128 W Cunningham St
 Butler, PA 16001
 Phone No: (724) 283-2200
 Receive Mail: Yes
 Receive EMail: Yes Email:
 Representing: Leslie Oshe, et al., Possible Intervenor
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

SUPREME COURT INFORMATION

Appeal From:
 Appeal Filed Below:
 Probable Jurisdiction Noted: Docketed Date: December 21, 2021
 Allocatur/Miscellaneous Granted: Allocatur/Miscellaneous Docket No.:
 Allocatur/Miscellaneous Grant Order:

FEE INFORMATION

Fee Dt	Fee Name	Fee Amt	Receipt Dt	Receipt No	Receipt Amt
12/21/2021	Extraordinary / Plenary Jurisdiction	70.25	12/28/2021	2021-SUP-M-002042	70.25

INTERMEDIATE APPELLATE COURT INFORMATION

Court Name: Docket Number:
 Date of Order: Rearg/Recon Disp Date:
 Rearg/Recon Disposition:
 Judge(s):
 Intermediate Appellate Court Action:
 Referring Court:

AGENCY/TRIAL COURT INFORMATION

Court Below: Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania
 County: Division: Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania
 Date of Agency/Trial Court Order:
 Docket Number: 464 MD 2021
 Judge(s): OTN:
 Order Type:

ORIGINAL RECORD CONTENT

Original Record Item	Filed Date	Content/Description
----------------------	------------	---------------------

Record Remittal:

Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



Miscellaneous Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 141 MM 2021

Page 8 of 9

May 2, 2024

DISPOSITION INFORMATION

Related Journal No:		Judgment Date:	
Category:	Decided	Disposition Author:	Per Curiam
Disposition:	Order Denying Application for Extraordinary Relief	Disposition Date:	January 10, 2022
Dispositional Filing:	Dissenting Statement	Author:	Wecht, David N.
Filed Date:	January 10, 2022		

DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
December 21, 2021	"Application for Extraordinary Relief under 42 Pa.C.S. § 726 and Pa.R.A.P. 3309"	Petitioner	Carol Ann Carter, et al.
December 27, 2021	Answer to Application for Extraordinary Relief	Respondent Respondent	Degraffenreid, Veronica Mathis, Jessica
December 27, 2021	Application for Intervention	Possible Intervenor Possible Intervenor Possible Intervenor Possible Intervenor	Cutler, Bryan Benninghoff, Kerry Corman, Jake Ward, Kim
December 29, 2021	Answer to Application for Intervention	Respondent Respondent	Degraffenreid, Veronica Mathis, Jessica
December 29, 2021	Answer to Application for Intervention	Petitioner	Carol Ann Carter, et al.
December 30, 2021	Praecipe for Appearance	Possible Intervenor Possible Intervenor	Cutler, Bryan Benninghoff, Kerry
December 30, 2021	Application for Leave to File Response to Application for Extraordinary Relief	Possible Intervenor	Leslie Oshe, et al.

Comments:

Filed on behalf of:

Leslie Osche, Kim Greyer, Michael T. Slupe, Candee Barnes, Thomas Reep, Brandy Reep, Kenneth Lunsford, Tammy Lunsford, James Thompson, Pamela Thompson, Joseph Renwick, Stephanie Renwick, Louis Capozzi, David Ball, Mary E. Owlett, Kristine Eng, Justin Behrens, James P. Foreman, Matthew J. Stuckey, Anthony J. Luther, Linda C. Daniels, Jeffrey Piccola, James Vasilko, Jay Hagerman, Evan P. Smith (collectively referred to as the "Citizen-Voter Intervenor")

Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



Miscellaneous Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 141 MM 2021

Page 9 of 9

May 2, 2024

DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
December 31, 2021	Application for Intervention	Possible Intervenor	Jay Costa, et al.
Comments: Filed on Behalf of: Senator Jay Costa, Senator Judy Schwank, Senator Lisa Boscola, Senator James Brewster, Senator Amanda Cappelletti, Senator Carolyn Comitta, Senator Marty Flynn, Senator Art Haywood, Senator John Kane, Senator Tim Kearney, Senator Steve Santarsiero, Senator Nikil Saval, Senator Christine Tartaglione, Senator Lindsey Williams			
January 5, 2022	Notice of Disclosure		Brobson, P. Kevin
January 7, 2022	Praeipice for Appearance		
	Mathis, Jessica	Respondent	Tucker, Joe H., Jr.
	Degraffenreid, Veronica	Respondent	Tucker, Joe H., Jr.
January 7, 2022	Application to be Admitted Pro Hac Vice (Matthew Gordon, Esquire)		
	Carol Ann Carter, et al.	Petitioner	McDonald, Michael R.
January 7, 2022	Praeipice for Appearance		
	Mathis, Jessica	Respondent	Mavroudis, Dimitrios
	Degraffenreid, Veronica	Respondent	Mavroudis, Dimitrios
January 7, 2022	Praeipice for Appearance		
	Mathis, Jessica	Respondent	Rickabaugh, Jessica Ann
	Degraffenreid, Veronica	Respondent	Rickabaugh, Jessica Ann
January 10, 2022	Order Denying Application for Extraordinary Relief		Per Curiam
Comments: AND NOW, this 10th day of January, 2022, the Application for Extraordinary Relief is DENIED, WITHOUT PREJUDICE to Petitioners to reapply for similar relief in this Court, as future developments may dictate. Additionally, the denial is without prejudice to Petitioners to file an application in the Commonwealth Court, requesting that court to accelerate the timetable set forth in its December 20, 2021 scheduling order. The Application for Leave to File Proposed Intervenor-Petitioners' Response and the Application to Intervene of Senator Jay Costa, et al., are DISMISSED AS MOOT. Justice Wecht files a dissenting statement. Justice Donohue notes her dissent.			
January 10, 2022	Order Exited		Office of the Prothonotary
February 9, 2022	Reconsideration Time Expired/Case Closed		Office of the Prothonotary

CROSS COURT ACTIONS

Docket Number: 464 MD 2021
Docket Number: 5 MAP 2022