



CAPTION

Daniel P. Doherty, Cheryl L. Nicholas, Stacy C. Hannan, Kristine L. Kipphut, Susan Saba, Tara Anthony, Paula Brensinger, and Seth D. McElroy, Petitioners

v.

2011 Legislative Reapportionment Commission, Respondent

CASE INFORMATION

Initiating Document: Petition for Review

Case Status: Closed

Journal Number: J-102-2012 September 13, 2012

Case Category: Administrative Agency Case Type(s): Redistricting

CONSOLIDATED CASES

RELATED CASES

Docket No / Reason	Type
126 MM 2012 Court Order	Consolidated
127 MM 2012 Court Order	Consolidated
128 MM 2012 Court Order	Consolidated
129 MM 2012 Court Order	Consolidated
130 MM 2012 Court Order	Consolidated
132 MM 2012 Court Order	Consolidated
133 MM 2012 Court Order	Consolidated
134 MM 2012 Court Order	Consolidated
39 WM 2012 Court Order	Consolidated
40 WM 2012 Court Order	Consolidated
41 WM 2012 Court Order	Consolidated
42 WM 2012 Court Order	Consolidated

COUNSEL INFORMATION



COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Rothermel, Frank A.
 Bernharddt, Rothermel & Siegel, P.C.
 Address: Bernharddt Rothermel & Siegel
 1515 Market St Ste 1540
 Philadelphia, PA 19102
 Phone No: (215) 568-0100
 Representing: D. Doherty, C. Nicholas, St. Hannan, K. Kipphut, S. Saba, T. Anthony, P. Brensinger, S.
 McElroy, Petitioner
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Del Sole, Joseph A.
 Del Sole Cavanaugh Stroyd, L.L.C.
 Address: 200 First Ave Ste 300
 Pittsburgh, PA 15222
 Phone No: (412) 261-2393
 Representing: 2011 Legislative Reapportionment Commission, Respondent
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Cavanaugh, Patrick Kennedy
 Del Sole Cavanaugh Stroyd, L.L.C.
 Address: The Waterfront Building, Suite 300
 200 First Avenue
 PITTSBURGH, PA 15222
 Phone No: (412) 261-2393
 Representing: 2011 Legislative Reapportionment Commission, Respondent
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Del Sole, Stephen John
 Del Sole Cavanaugh Stroyd, L.L.C.
 Address: The Waterfront Building, Suite 300
 200 First Avenue
 Pittsburgh, PA 15222
 Phone No: (412) 261-2393
 Representing: 2011 Legislative Reapportionment Commission, Respondent
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Stickman, William Shaw, IV
 Del Sole Cavanaugh Stroyd, L.L.C.
 Address: The Waterfront Building, Suite 300
 200 First Avenue
 Pittsburgh, PA 15222
 Phone No: (412) 261-2393
 Representing: 2011 Legislative Reapportionment Commission, Respondent
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:



COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Gallagher, Kathleen A.
 Eckert Seamans Cherin & Mellott, LLC
 Address: 44th Floor USX Tower
 600 Grant St
 Pittsburgh, PA 15219
 Phone No: (412) 566-6034
 Representing: Michael Turzai, as a Member of the 2011 PA Legislative Reapportionment Commission,
 Respondent Amicus Curiae
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Paszamant, Brian S.
 Blank Rome LLP
 Address: One Logan Sq 130 N 18th St
 Philadelphia, PA 19103-6933
 Phone No: (215) 569-5791
 Representing: Senator Dominic Pileggi, Respondent Amicus Curiae
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Buchholz, Carl Merritt
 Address: DLA Piper LLP
 One Liberty Place
 1650 Market St., Suite 4900
 Philadelphia, PA 19103
 Phone No: (215) 656-3300
 Representing: Senator Dominic Pileggi, Respondent Amicus Curiae
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Mullaney, Mary Ann
 Blank Rome LLP
 Address: One Logan Sq 130 N 18th St
 Philadelphia, PA 19103-6933
 Phone No: (215) 569-5598
 Representing: Senator Dominic Pileggi, Respondent Amicus Curiae
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Robinson, Brian Michael
 DLA Piper US, LLP
 Address: DLA Piper US Llp
 1650 Market St Fl 49
 Philadelphia, PA 19103-7301
 Phone No: (215) 656-2445
 Representing: Senator Dominic Pileggi, Respondent Amicus Curiae
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:



COUNSEL INFORMATION

Attorney: Clemmer, Shauna Christine
 Address: PA Department of State
 PA Department of State
 301 N Office Building
 Harrisburg, PA 17120-0102
 Phone No: (717) 783-0736
 Representing: Bureau of Elections, Department of State, Participant
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Kelly, Linda L.
 Address: Office of Attorney General
 Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
 Litigation Section
 15th Floor, Strawberry Square
 Harrisburg, PA 17120
 Representing: Attorney General's Office, Participant
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

Attorney: Granahan, Kathleen M.
 Address: PA Office of Attorney General
 16th Floor, Strawberry Square
 Harrisburg, PA 17120
 Phone No: (717) 787-3391
 Representing: Attorney General's Office, Participant
 Pro Se: No
 IFP Status:

FEE INFORMATION

Fee Dt	Fee Name	Fee Amt	Receipt Dt	Receipt No	Receipt Amt
07/09/2012	Petition for Review	73.50	07/09/2012	2012-SUP-M-000884	73.50

AGENCY/TRIAL COURT INFORMATION

Court Below:
 County: Division:
 Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: June 8, 2012
 Docket Number: Borough of Trappe, Montgomery Co.
 Judge(s): OTN:
 Order Type: Order

Court Below:
 County: Division:
 Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: June 8, 2012
 Docket Number: District 2, Borough of Emmaus, Lehigh
 Judge(s): OTN:

Supreme Court of Pennsylvania



Miscellaneous Docket Sheet

Docket Number: 131 MM 2012

Page 5 of 10

September 25, 2018

Order Type: Order

Court Below:

County: Division:

Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: June 8, 2012

Docket Number: District 2, South Union Twp, Fayette Co

Judge(s): OTN:

Order Type: Order

Court Below:

County: Division:

Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: June 8, 2012

Docket Number: District 9, Northampton Twp, Bucks Co

Judge(s): OTN:

Order Type: Order

Court Below:

County: Division:

Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: June 8, 2012

Docket Number: Ward 1, Division 3, City of Philadelphia

Judge(s): OTN:

Order Type: Order

Court Below:

County: Division:

Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: June 8, 2012

Docket Number: Ward 11, Division 5, City of Allentown

Judge(s): OTN:

Order Type: Order

Court Below:

County: Division:

Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: June 8, 2012

Docket Number: Ward 3, Division 3, Lower Providence Twp

Judge(s): OTN:

Order Type: Order



Court Below:

County:

Division:

Date of Agency/Trial Court Order: June 8, 2012

Docket Number: Ward 64, Division 2, City of Philadelphia

Judge(s):

OTN:

Order Type: Order

ORIGINAL RECORD CONTENT

Original Record Item	Filed Date	Content/Description
----------------------	------------	---------------------

Record Remittal:

BRIEFING SCHEDULE

Petitioner

D. Doherty, C. Nicholas, St. Hannan, K. Kipphut, S. Saba, T. Anthony, P. Brensinger, S. McElroy
Brief

Due: August 6, 2012

Filed: August 6, 2012

Reproduced Record

Due: August 6, 2012

Filed:

Respondent

2011 Legislative Reapportionment Commission
Brief

Due: August 20, 2012

Filed: August 20, 2012

Respondent Amicus Curiae

Michael Turzai, as a Member of the 2011 PA
Legislative Reapportionment Commission
Brief

Due: August 20, 2012

Filed: August 20, 2012

Senator Dominic Pileggi

Brief

Due: August 20, 2012

Filed: August 20, 2012

SESSION INFORMATION

Journal Number: J-102-2012

Listed/Submitted Date: September 13, 2012

Consideration Type: Oral Argument Supreme Ct.

DISPOSITION INFORMATION

Related Journal No: J-102-2012

Judgment Date: May 8, 2013

Category: Decided

Disposition Author: Castille, Ronald D.

Disposition: Appeal Dismissed

Disposition Date: May 8, 2013

Dispositional Filing:

Author:

Filed Date:

DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
------------	-----------------------------	------------------	----------



DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
July 9, 2012	Petition for Review	Petitioner	D. Doherty, C. Nicholas, St. Hannan, K. Kipphut, S. Saba, T. Anthony, P. Brensinger, S. McElroy
July 10, 2012	Order Regarding Answer/No Answer Letter, Petitioner's Briefs, Consolidation and Argument		Bizzoso, Irene M.
Comments:			
AND NOW, this 10th day of July, 2012, the above referenced matters are hereby consolidated for purposes of pleading, briefing and argument.			
A consolidated answer or no answer letter to the petitions for review is due by 1 P.M. Monday, July 23, 2012. Any prior directives regarding time frame for filing an answer is/are hereby rescinded.			
Petitioners' briefs are to be received by the Supreme Court of Pennsylvania Prothonotary's Office by 1:00 p.m. on Monday, August 6, 2012. If hand delivered, briefs may be filed at the nearest Supreme Court Prothonotary's Office. Service of said briefs shall be made via personal service or e-mail as agreed to by the parties.			
Respondent's consolidate brief is due on or before 1:00 p.m. Monday, August 20, 2012, under the same filing and service constraints as aforementioned. Due to the nature of these appeals and the constricted time frame, no applications for extensions of time will be entertained.			
Oral argument will be scheduled during the September argument session in Philadelphia, by separate order.			
July 10, 2012	Order Exited		Office of the Prothonotary
July 19, 2012	Agency Record Received		Legislative Reapportionment Commission
July 23, 2012	Answer to Petition for Review	Respondent	2011 Legislative Reapportionment Commission
August 6, 2012	Order Regarding Oral Argument		Bizzoso, Irene M.
Comments:			
AND NOW, this 6th day of August, 2012, this matter is hereby listed as case #4 for argument session commencing at 9:30 a.m., Thursday, September 13, 2012, in Philadelphia, PA. Petition and Respondent will be allotted up to ten (10) minutes per side to present their argument.			
August 6, 2012	Order Exited		Office of the Prothonotary
August 6, 2012	Petitioner's Brief	Petitioner	D. Doherty, C. Nicholas, St. Hannan, K. Kipphut, S. Saba, T. Anthony, P. Brensinger, S. McElroy
August 6, 2012	Motion for Leave to File a Brief in Excess of the Page Limit Set Forth by Pa.R.A.P. 2135	Respondent	2011 Legislative Reapportionment Commission



DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
August 6, 2012	Order Granting Motion for Leave to File Brief in Excess of Page Limitation		Vaskov, John A.
Comments: AND NOW, this 6th day of August, 2012, the Motion for Leave to File Brief in Excess of Page Limitation is granted, the Respondent's Brief not to exceed 110 pages.			
August 6, 2012	Order Exited		Office of the Prothonotary
August 13, 2012	Acknowledgement of Argument Notice		
	2011 Legislative Reapportionment Commission	Respondent	Del Sole, Joseph A.
	2011 Legislative Reapportionment Commission	Respondent	Stickman, William Shaw, IV
August 13, 2012	Acknowledgement of Argument Notice		
	D. Doherty, C. Nicholas, St. Hannan, K. Kipphut, S. Saba, T. Anthony, P. Brensinger, S. McElroy	Petitioner	Rothermel, Frank A.
August 20, 2012	Respondent's Brief	Respondent	2011 Legislative Reapportionment Commission
August 20, 2012	Respondent Amicus Curiae's Brief	Respondent Amicus Curiae	Michael Turzai, as a Member of the 2011 PA Legislative Reapportionment Commission
August 20, 2012	Petition of Amicus Curiae Turzai for Leave to Participate in Oral Argument	Respondent Amicus Curiae	Michael Turzai, as a Member of the 2011 PA Legislative Reapportionment Commission
August 20, 2012	Respondent Amicus Curiae's Brief	Respondent Amicus Curiae	Senator Dominic Pileggi
August 22, 2012	No Answer Letter to Petition of Amicus Curiae Turzai for Leave to Participate in Oral Argument	Respondent	2011 Legislative Reapportionment Commission
August 28, 2012	Order Denying Petition of Amicus Curiae Turzai for Leave to Participate in Oral Argument		Per Curiam

Comments:

AND NOW, this 28th day of August, 2012, the Petition of Amicus Curiae Michael Turzai as a Member of the 2011 Pennsylvania Legislative Reapportionment Commission for Leave to Participate in Oral Argument is DENIED. See Pa.R.A.P. 531(b).



DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
August 28, 2012	Order Exited		Office of the Prothonotary
September 11, 2012	Praecipe for Appearance 2011 Legislative Reapportionment Commission	Respondent	Cavanaugh, Patrick Kennedy
September 12, 2012	Limited Reply Brief to Respondent's Brief Received and Returned	Petitioner	D. Doherty, C. Nicholas, St. Hannan, K. Kipphut, S. Saba, T. Anthony, P. Brensinger, S. McElroy
Comments: Returned as untimely filed.			
September 13, 2012	Nunc Pro Tunc Appeal to Permit the Filing of Limited Reply in Opposition to Respondent's Brief	Petitioner	D. Doherty, C. Nicholas, St. Hannan, K. Kipphut, S. Saba, T. Anthony, P. Brensinger, S. McElroy
Comments: 9-13-12 - requested proof of service 9-13-12 - proof of service rec'd			
September 13, 2012	Argued		Supreme Court of Pennsylvania
September 14, 2012	Answer to Nunc Pro Tunc Appeal to Permit the Filing of a Reply in Opposition to Respondent's Brief	Respondent	2011 Legislative Reapportionment Commission
May 8, 2013	Appeal Dismissed		Castille, Ronald D.

Comments:

The matter has been ably briefed, both by concerned citizens and the LRC. For the reasons we have articulated above, we reaffirm Holt I as against the various challenges made to the decision; and we further determine that, as against the specific challenges presented in these various appeals, the LRC, in crafting the 2012 Final Plan, sufficiently heeded this Court's admonition that it "could have easily achieved a substantially greater fidelity to all of the mandates in Article II, Section 16" than it did in its unconstitutional 2011 Final Plan. See Holt I, 38 A.3d at 718. Moreover, we hold that the appellants have not demonstrated that the 2012 Final Plan is contrary to law. We therefore conclude that the LRC has utilized the population data of the 2010 census to create a redistricting map that complies with the Pennsylvania Constitution, which shall hereby have the force of law, beginning with the 2014 election cycle. The appeals are dismissed.

Jurisdiction relinquished.

Former Justice Orié Melvin did not participate in the consideration or decision of these appeals.

Messrs. Justice Eakin and Baer, Madame Justice Todd and Mr. Justice McCaffery join the opinion.

Mr. Justice Saylor files a concurring opinion.



DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
May 8, 2013	Judgment Entered		Office of the Prothonotary
May 8, 2013	Nunc Pro Tunc Appeal to Permit the Filing of Limited Reply Brief Dismissed as Moot		Office of the Prothonotary
May 30, 2013	Reconsideration Time Expired/Case Closed		Office of the Prothonotary

Comments:

Notification sent to the Legislative Reapportionment Commission

6-4-13 - Received receipt acknowledgment from the Reapportionment Commission.